

**Tuesday, July 13, 2021
Virtual Platform
57 East 1st Street
4:30 PM**

A meeting of the Design Review Board was held by Virtual Platform at 4:30 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Vice Chair Sean Banda
*Boardmember Tanner Green
Boardmember Scott Thomas
Boardmember J. Seth Placko
Boardmember Paul Johnson
Boardmember Jeanette Knudsen

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Boardmember Dane Astle

STAFF PRESENT:

Nana Appiah
Lesley Davis
Cassidy Welch
Jennifer Gniffke
Sean Pesek
Chloe Durfee-Sherman

OTHERS PRESENT:

(* indicates Boardmember or staff participated in the meeting using audio conference equipment)

Vice Chair Banda welcomed everyone to the meeting at 4:30 PM

- 1 Call meeting to order.**
- 2 Consider the Minutes from the June 15th, 2021 Design Review Board Meeting.**

A motion to approve the Minutes from June 15, 2021 Design Review Board Meeting was made by Boardmember Thomas and seconded by Boardmember Knudsen.

Vote: 5 – 0

Upon tabulation of votes, it showed:

AYES – Banda – Thomas – Johnson – Knudsen – Placko

NAYS – None

ABSENT – Astle

ABSTAINED – Green

3 Election of Design Review Board Officers –
 a. Chair
 b. Vice Chair

The Board postponed voting for a new Chair and Vice Chair until the new Boardmember, Dane Astle, could be in attendance.

4 Discuss and provide direction on the following Preliminary Design Review cases:*

This is a preliminary review of Design Review Board cases. That applicant and public may speak about the case, and the Board may provide comments and suggestions to assist the Applicant with the proposal, but the Board will not approve or deny a case under Preliminary Review.

4-a DRB21-00395 District 6. Within the 7600 to 7800 block of east Warner Road (south side) and within the 4400 to 4700 block of the South Sossaman Road alignment (east side). Located east of the Sossaman Road alignment on the south side of Warner Road. (101.7± acres). Requesting the review of a industrial business park. Wendy Riddell, Berry Riddell LLC, Applicant Tonto Corp and Gateway Business Park, LLC, Owners.

Staff Planner Kellie Rorex presented the case.

Vice Chair Banda invited the applicant to speak.

Applicants introduced themselves as Brandon Blakes and Wendy Riddell.

Applicant Wendy Riddell

- We are excited about this project and happy to answer questions

Boardmember Johnson

- Well-designed buildings
- No issues with alt compliance
- Concerned about south façade for building 6
- Concerned about the screen wall

Kellie Rorex

- Showed the site through arial and renderings

Wendy Riddell

- Building oriented towards the south given the uniqueness of the site

Boardmember Johnson

- Wants more movements on the south side that is facing the freeway as this is the most visible side

Applicant Brandon Blakes

- Here are the approaches to the building in the rendering
- The buildings have offices in
- The view is blocked for the most part from the freeway by the parapet edge

Boardmember Johnson

- Nice building

Boardmember Thomas

- Question on building 6 on the 200 sq ft expansion option
- What is the distance between top of parapet to top of roof

Brandon Blakes

- Our intent is to proceed with the buildings as drawn
 - Evaporative units will still be screened
 - The only time that equipment would be seen would be if someone was above the parapet which will not happen
- We rendered the view from the driver's perspective and have created a landscape buffer that will grow and help buffer and screen the view

Boardmember Green

- Feel that the rendering have done a significant job at screening the view of passers on road ways
- More of the view is on the east side
- Great job

Boardmember Knudsen

- Renderings on the freeway are very helpful
- Good color and great project

Brandon Blakes

- The height was at 60 ft through the PAD to allow for the room for equipment screening

Boardmember Placko

- No issue with landscape palette
- Could put pine trees on the south side to help screen
- Is the site over parked?
- They won't use all of that parking
- The landscape islands could be enlarged to take up more
- Reduce parking spaces
- Add more planters
- Do an overflow parking that has more landscaping
- Will never use that many parking spaces

Kellie Rorex

- They are actually under parked and asking for less parking in their PAD
- Requirement for parking lot clusters to be no more than 200 spaces
- PAD is asking for 300 spaces
- Applicant is adding more pedestrian walkways that are shaded to help
- The parking is the same for other sites in the area

Vice Chair Banda

- They should reduce parking and possibly take away more of the paved areas
- Ask for parking study to soften parking and reduce

Boardmember Placko

- Larger soil masses will allow trees to get to larger size
- Larger parking islands

Wendy Riddell

- We did do a parking study
- We are flexible to staff helping with parking

Vice Chair Banda

- For Building 6 is the form liner carried around the building
- Elevation for south side is very flat
- Well designed development but want more movement in the building
- Thank you for the lighting and having is where it is important

Brandon Blakes

- Follow the vertical relief
- Introduce gray striping
- Are stuck with how trucks load and unload
- We do carry the form liner all around the building

Staff Planner Kellie Rorex summarized the board comments

- Update the elevations
- Stronger canopy on the south side
- Pines to screen on the corner and south side

- 4-b DRB21-00290 District 6.** Within the 7800 to 8000 blocks of east Ray Road (north side). Located west of Hawes Road on the north side of Ray Road. (9.9± acres). Requesting the review of an industrial development. Eric Zitny, Ware Malcomb, Applicant; Marwest Enterprises LLC/Santan 74 LLLP, Owner.
(Continued from the June 15, 2021 meeting).

Staff Planner Kellie Rorex presented the case.

Vice Chair Banda invited the applicant to speak.

Applicant Eric Zitny described the project.

Boardmember Thomas

- Dock doors need to blend to match the rest of the building

Boardmember Johnson

- Like the material
- Like the form liner
- Issue with alternative compliance for articulation
- Rendering on page 12, no horizontal movement to either wall
- The vertical movement doesn't seem to relate to the architecture or colors

Boardmember Thomas

- Could put movement on the back wall
- Could break up panels and have them jog in or out
- Like the front side
- Backside will be visible from the 202
- Would also like to see some ups and downs in height

Boardmember Green

- Horizontal and vertical movement feels out of place, and it feels like it is just there to meet requirements
- The last project had changes to material or texture to make it make sense

Eric Zitny

- The way that the front of the building curves on Ray Road do inform the movements

Boardmember Green

- Some corners anchor the building, but the east and west sides need more ins and outs
- Even 6-12 inches could help
- Intent is to keep from being one mass wall
- There is not a real break-up of the massing

Vice Chair Banda

- Several of us agree
- The "battlements" or the meaningful movement isn't present
- The bumps have nothing coordinating it
- Need to make it more meaningful with more architectural interest

Eric Zitny

- Something could be added, or something could be removed for more meaningful movement

Boardmember Placko

- No issues with the palette
- What is the green?

Kellie Rorex

- Open space

Boardmember Knudsen

- No issues with color palette
- Agree with other Boardmembers

Vice Chair Banda

- Make sure that the lighting is the same Kelvin as the rest of the site.

Staff Planner Kellie Rorex summarized the board comments

- More meaningful movement
- Could change materials, could change reliefs, or anything else

- 4-c DRB21-00352 District 2.** Within the 4400 block of East Baseline Road (north side). Located east of Greenfield Road on the north side of Baseline Road. (1.04± acres). Requesting the review of a dental office with a drive-thru. Jonathan Ammon, Jammon Studios, Applicant; Blue Glacier LLC, Owner.

Staff Planner Chloe Durfee-Sherman presented the case.

Vice Chair Banda invited the applicant to speak.

Applicant Jonathon Ammon presented the case

Boardmember Johnson

- Likes the traditional rural look to the building
- Wants to understand the roof
- No issues but wants to hear Jeannette's comments on color
- North elevation – the way the windows are laid out on the stucco portion it is nicely balanced everywhere but would be nice to see windows in recessed areas that are also balanced on the wall

Boardmember Knudsen

- Noted the farmhouse design
- Worried if the architectural style will look dated in the future
- The color Greek Vanilla has yellow undertones and wants applicant to compare it to the old Texas brick to make sure they work together

Boardmember Thomas

- Agree with Boardmember Knudsen. Likes building overall
- How does it fit with surrounding buildings?

- No other buildings with a farmhouse look within the center

Applicant Jonathon Ammon

- We want to bring the center to a higher level and lead a different direction for the center
- The building makes a statement and is nicer than what is around us
- This is the direction the ownership has granted them

Boardmember Thomas

- Front elevation – when it rains the water will run straight down front edge and you may need a small gutter system to tie in

Boardmember Placko

- Has questions and some concerns with the landscape plan
- Turf in parking islands is a problem and will be a maintenance issue
- There are other areas that it works better if they wish to use it
- North side – Texas mountain laurels in parking lot islands are a problem because the islands are too narrow
- The space for the tree adjacent to the trash enclosure is too small and the canopy of the tree will be a problem for trash pick up
- North side of the building whales tongue agave – plan on 5-6 feet on diameter for growth
- East of entry – concerned about plants surviving one summer with exception to Texas Mountain Laurels
- Think about replacing Japanese boxwood, Shasta daisy, liriop-turf lily (only use in focused areas), Salvia – May Night
- South of the building there is an arc of Japanese boxwoods and 2 circles of orange jubilees and the symbols for dwarf myrtle and box plum are too close
- The Japanese boxwoods won't survive
- Natal plum or dwarf myrtle would be heartier
- Tacoma (orange jubilee) would be a better background plant adjacent to the building
- Place for grass is south of the building or along the sidewalk and is usable.
- pink muhly would be fine
- Shift the sidewalk to the side possibly – 2 trees is plenty
- Whales tongue agave west of entrance
- Salvia won't survive one summer

Staff Planner Chloe Durfee-Sherman

- Asked for clarifications on plant changes

Boardmember Placko

- Shasta Daisy, Turf Lily, (use in focused places) May Night sage,

Boardmember Green

- Question on drive thru – wants to be sure you have enough height for clearance

Applicant Jonathon Ammon

- No clearance bars – the eyebrow will be spaced appropriately
- Matched what is used in a common drive-thru

Vice Chair Banda

- Stick with 4000 K if the white isn't yellow or use 3,500K, but not 3,000K

Staff Planner Chloe Durfee-Sherman summarized the board comments

- Windows in recessed portion – north elevation to be more balanced on wall
- Greek villa has yellow tones and works with Texas brick
- At the entrance, use gutters to guide rain
- Landscape islands - remove turf, make changes to the islands to accommodate trees
- Check spacing for whale tongue agave
- Switch out the plants listed
- Lighting should be 3,000 to 4000 K. Stick to 4000 if between
- Balance windows on north elevation

Citizen Comment

The adjacent property owner spoke and identified himself at Ryan Birrell at 1959 & 1947 South Greenfield Road, Mesa, AZ 85206. He stated his concerned that the traffic at Discount Tire would be impeded and wanted to hear comments.

Comment card submitted

Ryan Birrell at 1959 & 1947 South Greenfield Road, Mesa, AZ 85206

"H&R-REIT wishes to ascertain how the drive thru will work? Where the line-up will be visa a vie our entrance. I represent the owner of the Fueling station and Tire shop."

- 4-d DRB21-00462 District 6.** Within the 9200 block of East Cadence Parkway (south side). Located south of Ray Road and east of Ellsworth Road. (1.2± acres). Requesting the review of a restaurant with a drive-thru. Stephanie Watney, Withey Morris PLC, Applicant; PPGN-Ellsworth LLLP, Owner.

Staff Planner Jennifer Gniffke presented the case.

Vice Chair Banda invited the applicant to speak

Applicant Jason Morris introduced his project

Boardmember Johnson

- No comments on design
- Like form and articulation
- Curious why the drive thru is so wide

Applicant Jason Morris

- Want to make sure no one gets trapped

Boardmember Thomas

- What is the width of the fiber board planks? 15 or 18 feet?
- I like the larger width
- Is there a reason why the trash enclosure brick is different?

Applicant Jason Morris

- Some of the site design was done with another commercial center
- The restaurant has unique stone design that isn't in the overall center

Boardmember Knudsen

- Like building
- Color Raisin in the Sun looks to have a purple undertone
- Have you used it on other buildings?
- May see a purple undertone
- Colors are nice

Boardmember Green

- Reviewed similar project back in September
- Had same looks and colors
- On the pergola over drive thru consider decreasing the spacing of the planks to create more shading

Vice Chair Banda

- Support more shading
- If the refuse is not shared It feels weird to have it different and very disconnected
- If the refuse is the same for the overall site that might make more sense

Boardmember Thomas

- The parking lot screen wall is the same brick so it might be consistent throughout the overall site

Vice Chair Banda

- As long as the center has all the same, it is fine
- Want unique lighting like halo or something else
- Suggests more than just pan channel signage
- It should be more interesting

Jason Morris

- The applicant is interested in doing something that stands out
- Will look to see what we can do corporately

Boardmember Green

- Asked staff if there is guidance for trash enclosures to match?

Senior Staff Planner Lesley Davis

- There are design guidelines for Cadence, but they are not that specific
- Mesa is looking for cohesiveness

Staff Planner Jennifer Gniffke summarized the board comments

- As long as the trash matches the center it is fine
- Provide halo lit signage

- 4-e DRB21-00119 District 4.** Within the 300 block of North Stapley Drive (west side) and within the 1100 block of East University Drive (south side). Located on the southwest corner of Stapley Drive and University Drive. (.70± acres). Requesting the review of a drive-thru coffee shop. Tim Rasnake, Archicon, Applicant; Singh Jaswinder/Surinder K, Owner.

Staff Planner Sean Pesek presented the case.

Applicant not available to speak.

Boardmember Johnson

- Starbucks does great design
- Doesn't feel design is up to the same level of other Starbucks
- Want to introduce other examples

Planning Director Dr. Appiah

- Make sure to work within the City of Mesa Design Guidelines,
- Be mindful that we are seeking advice from the board to enhance the design, but we must follow the guidelines
- Please make sure it is not a preference, as all 7 Boardmembers will have different preferences

Boardmember Johnson

- Example of Gilbert and McKellips
- The canopy design is integrated into the architecture
- Screen wall adds interest
- Starbucks is a progressive design brand
- Looks like they are meeting the design guidelines with proposal

Vice Chair Banda

- There is a brand level expectation
- Could be something edgier
- There could be signage on the canopy
- The trellis or wall art could be better or edgier that could pop more
- The corner is in need for enhancement
- Could stand out more

Planning Director Dr. Appiah

- The board needs to keep in mind that if the applicant is meeting the requirements
- We have to work within the design guidelines and code

Boardmember Johnson

- We understand the position
- But if we want to enhance the design or have ideas that could improve it, we don't think you want us to hold our tongue

Developer Andy Crude

- Would like to incorporate a lot of what was suggested
- What does that process look like for timeline?

Planning Director Dr. Appiah

- Changes should not derail the project
- Staff Planner Sean Pesek will send comments from the meeting and applicant can resubmit for approval
- We appreciate you accepting comments

Andy Crude

- Wants to strive for better design
- This is one of the few walk-up designs
- Design is between the developer, architect, and the company
- Thank you for the input

Vice Chair Banda

- Thank you

Boardmember Johnson

- Thanks for receptiveness

Boardmember Knudsen

- Material board, colors are great, thanks

Boardmember Placko

- The planting palette is the same as others
- This project has very structured gridded design
- Needs redo of the planting design in the northeast corner
- At the screen wall on east side of the drive thru the bougainvillea will grow too large as a vine
- Think about giving them more adequate space to grow
- The wall is 3 ft while the plant will go 8ft and will turn into a big shrub

Boardmember Green

- There are overhead utilities over the trees on the north side
- Hate to see them get cut, reconsider tree choices to minimize need for over trimming
- The west dividing wall appears to be 4 ft. Will it be extended?
- Want to see the wall continued and blended in

Staff Planner Sean Pesek

- Stated staff will explore options with the applicant

Boardmember Green

- Trash enclosures up against a fence, be cautious about creating a dead zone or hiding spaces with the area

Vice Chair Banda

- Recommend getting CEPTD input from police on trash enclosure design for safety

Boardmember Placko

- The pishache trees are not considered good under power lines
- The cascalote are considered good under power lines

Boardmember Thomas

- Extend the concrete further so that cars are not sitting on asphalt
- The cross walk should be a contrasting color
- Extend back past the sign menu board

Staff Planner Sean Pesek summarized the board comments

- Enhance the design of the building
- Bougainvillea should be replaced adjacent to screen wall for smaller plan
- Verify tree choice under powerline to avoid conflicts
- Screen wall on west side should be replaced or integrated carefully with new walls and trash dead space to be considered
- Extend the concrete back to the menu board
- Provide a contrasting color for pedestrian crosswalk

- 4-f DRB21-00349 District 6.** Within the 8200 to 8400 blocks of East Pecos Road (south side). Located east of Sossaman Road on the south side of Pecos Road. (6.8± acres). Requesting the review of an industrial development. Larry L. Allen, ThirtyThree North Architects, Applicant; East Comstock, LLC, Owner.

Senior Staff Planner Lesley Davis presented the project and noted the request for alternative compliance request

Vice Chair Banda invited the applicant to speak

Lesley Davis read the letter from the applicant, Larry Allen, describing his project.

Applicant Larry Allen

- Tried to incorporate what the owner does especially incorporating their curtain wall

Boardmember Thomas

- Like building
- Like the contrasting roll up doors
- The storage building looks as it plays well
- No concerns

Boardmember Johnson

- The north elevation looks great
- The depth of the property is so long but the elevations on the east and west are well done to break up the look and feel
- Where is the CMU wall
- Concerned the plain wall will take away from the beautiful architecture
- Could play with look or texture on wall to make it look more incorporated
- The trash enclosure looks cool too

Applicant Larry Allen

- CMU wall is shared with neighbor
- We have a CMU base with horizontal banding and metal banding on top to match the building

Boardmember Placko

- Very unique and representative style
- Fractured rock is helping to define the hard landscape
- Decomposed Granite 2 should be brought down on the sides to finish off the exterior look
- Trees planted over underground drainage pipes?

Applicant Larry Allen

- Trees need to be moved back
- Underground storage system is not under parking, need to move the trees so not on top

Boardmember Johnson

- Too many plants, loosen up planting in parking islands

Boardmember Knudsen

- Great project

Boardmember Green

- Love building
- Love material choices
- Question on the metals. Is there a treatment being added to the copper or will it oxidize?

Applicant Larry Allen

- The metal is steel
- The copper is powder coated

Vice Chair Banda

- Great look
- Wants a cool sign
- Nice site walls
- Amazing drawings

Senior Staff Planner Lesley Davis

- Work with applicant on design of wall on the east side. Provide banding or something depending on timing of adjacent projects.
- Look at location of trees near underground drainage
- Loosen up landscape island planting

5 Discuss and take action on the following Design Review cases: None

6 Staff Presentation

Presentation on proposed Small Lot Development Guidelines and associated text amendments to Title 11 of the Mesa Zoning Ordinance - Rachel Prelog and Veronica Gonzalez

7 Planning Director Update:

Planning Director Dr. Appiah discussed with the board how to make sure the meetings don't take as long and about making sure comments follow the design standards and design guidelines.

8 Adjournment

Boardmember Johnson moved to adjourn the meeting and was seconded by Boardmember Placko. Without objection, the meeting was adjourned at 7:55 PM.