



**PLANNING DIVISION
STAFF REPORT**

Board of Adjustment

November 4, 2020

CASE No.: **BOA20-00622**

CASE NAME: **Dental Depot**

Owner's Name:	MT Bross LLC
Applicant's Name:	Tanner McGreevy, Fitzgerald and Associates
Location of Request:	2311 W Broadway Road
Parcel Nos:	134-39-004Z
Nature of Request:	Requesting a Special Use Permit (SUP) to allow a Comprehensive Sign Plan (CSP) for a medical use development in the LC district.
Zone District:	Limited Commercial (LC)
Council District:	3
Site size:	1.5 ± acres
Proposed use:	Dental Office
Existing use:	Vacant
Hearing date(s):	November 4, 2020 / 5:30 p.m.
Staff Planner:	Kellie Rorex
Staff Recommendation:	APPROVAL with Conditions

HISTORY

On **November 4, 1968** the City Council annexed approximately 356 ± acres, including the subject site, into the City of Mesa (Ordinance No. 602).

On **March 29, 1994**, the Board of Adjustment approved a variance request to facilitate the development of an automotive repair building on the subject site (Case No. BA87-082).

The approved variance allowed:

- A zero-lot line along the west property line; and
- Parking to encroach into the required landscape yards along the east and south property lines.

On **April 11, 2000**, the Board of Adjustment approved a Special Use Permit to allow for the development of a convenience store and fueling station, and a variance to reduce the rear yard setback (southern property line) from 20 feet to ten feet (Case No. BA99-043).

On **October 7, 2020**, the Board of Adjustment approved a Substantial Conformance Improvement Permit (SCIP) to bring the site into substantial conformance with a reduced landscape setback along Broadway Road (Case No. BOA20-00580).

On **October 13, 2020**, the Design Review Board recommended approval of the elevations and landscape design for a proposed dental office (Case No. DRB20-00495).

On **October 14, 2020**, the Planning and Zoning Board approved a site plan for the development of a dental office on the subject site (Case No. ZON20-00488).

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Background:

The applicant is requesting a Comprehensive Sign Plan (CSP) for a themed dental office development in the Limited Commercial (LC) zoning district. The requested CSP would allow for modifications to the City of Mesa Sign Ordinance for number of attached signs and the maximum height and area of a detached sign allowed.

Per Section 11-46-3(B) of the MZO, the purpose of a Comprehensive Sign Plan is to provide for the establishment of signage criteria that are tailored to a specific development or location, and which may vary from specific Sign Ordinance provisions. The intent is to provide for flexible sign criteria that promotes superior design through architectural integration of the site, buildings, and signs. The proposed CSP was designed to complement the site's Santa Fe train depot theme and includes one (1) detached monument sign, three (3) three-dimensional objects, and eight (8) attached signs.

Per Section 11-43-9 of the MZO, statues, sculptures, and other three-dimensional objects are permitted in commercial zoning districts. When a three-dimensional objects is detached from the building and within 100 feet of the right-of-way, greater than 12 feet in height, and longer than ten 10 feet, 50% of the area of the object is deducted from the allowed detached sign area. The applicants are proposing three (3), three-dimensional objects that include a semaphore, train crossing arm, and a model train. The requested CSP would allow for the applicant to have detached and attached signage as well as three-dimensional objects that that would match the train depot theme.

Per the provided sign plan, there is a large foundation base area in front of the building for a patient drop off area and seating area that will serve as the location of a proposed seven-foot (7') tall model train. To the east of the train, in the landscape area that is south of the driveway from Valencia, will be the decorative 20-foot semaphore. Just west of the driveway from Broadway is a proposed 15-foot train crossing arm. On the northeast corner of the site is a proposed 14-foot water tower with attached signage (monument sign), facing Broadway. The

monument sign and three-dimensional detached objects are outside of all site visibility triangles, outside of the right-of-way, and nonmoving (motionless).

All attached signage will be on the front elevation of the building. Per the submitted elevations the applicants are proposing two backlit cabinet signs reading “Dental Depot” and two smaller non-lit elevation signs on two sides of the tower element on the north side of the building. These signs will face northwest and northeast. Two back-lit signs will be placed on the northeast corner of the building, facing Broadway, that read, “Family Dentistry & Orthodontics” and “Open Saturdays”. Lastly, two small, non-lit signs with the dentist’s names and “Mesa” are proposed to be placed by the entry into the building. All attached signs are black with white letters and designed to mimic old-fashioned train depot signage.

Tables 1: Attached Signs, Table 2: Detached Signs, and Table 3: Statues, Sculptures, and Three-dimensional Figures below, compare the MZO standards with the proposed CSP. **Bolded** entries denote where the CSP proposal exceeds Code.

Table 1: Attached Signs

Sign Standards	Allowed Per MZO	Applicant Proposed CSP
Number of permanent signs	3	8
Maximum aggregate sign area calculation	160 square feet	86 square feet
Maximum sign area per sign	160 square feet	34 square feet

Table 2: Detached Signs

Sign Standards	Allowed Per MZO	Applicant Proposed CSP
Number of detached signs	Multiple signs	1 sign
Maximum aggregate sign area calculation	516 square feet	440
Maximum height per sign	12 feet (1-foot of sign height per 20 lineal feet of street frontage)	14 feet
Maximum area per sign	80 square feet	217 square feet

Table 3: Statues, Sculptures, and Three-dimensional Figures

Sign Standards	Allowed Per MZO	Applicant Proposed CSP
Statues, sculpture, or three-dimensional figure	50% of the statues, sculpture, or three-dimensional figure is deducted from the total sign allowance	Three (3), three-dimensional figures that would not be counted towards the total sign allowance

General Plan Character Area Designation and Goals:

The Mesa 2040 General Plan Character Area designation on the property is Neighborhood with a Suburban sub-type. Per Chapter 7 of the Plan, the primary focus of the Neighborhood Character Area is to provide safe places for people to live where they can feel secure and enjoy their surrounding community, as well as provide opportunities for people to gain a sense of place and

feel connected to the larger community. Non-residential areas within Neighborhood character areas should be designed and located to bring people together and to not disrupt the fabric and functioning of the neighborhood as a place where people live.

Site Characteristics:

The subject site is located on the southwest corner of Broadway Road and Valencia. The site is 1.5 ± acres in size and is zoned Limited Commercial (LC). The approved site plan shows a 1,658 square foot building located along the southern portion of the site facing Broadway Road. Parking will be located in front of the building with access to the site provided via two drives, one off of Broadway Road and the other off of Valencia.

Surrounding Zoning Designations and Existing Use Activity:

Northwest (Across Broadway) LI-PAD-CUP Existing Industrial Park	North (Across Broadway) LI-PAD-CUP Existing Industrial Park	Northeast (Across Broadway) LI-PAD-CUP Existing Industrial Park
West LC Existing Commercial	Subject Property LC Existing Commercial	East (Across Valencia) LC Existing Commercial
Southwest LC/RM-4 Existing Commercial/Existing Multi-Residential	South RM-4 Existing Multi-Residential	Southeast (Across Valencia) RM-4 Existing Multi-Residential

Mesa Zoning Ordinance Requirements and Regulations:

Comprehensive Sign Plan MZO Section 11-46-3(D)

Per Section 11-46-3(D) of the City of Mesa Zoning Ordinance, the Board of Adjustment shall find the following criteria are met for approval of a CSP:

1. The development site contains unique or unusual physical conditions, such as topography, proportion, size, or relation to a public street that would limit or restrict normal sign visibility; or

The site does not contain any unique physical conditions that would restrict normal sign visibility.

The request does not meet this criterion.

2. The proposed or existing development exhibits unique characteristics of land use, architectural style, site location, physical scale, historical interest, or other distinguishing features that represent a clear variation from conventional development; or

The proposed medical office development was designed to look like a Santa Fe train depot. The proposed CSP uses three-dimensional objects to reinforce the projects design theme and is a clear variation from standard sign design.

The request meets this criterion.

3. The proposed signage incorporates special design features such as lighting, materials, and craftsmanship, murals, or statuary that reinforce or are integrated with the building architecture.

The proposed attached signage, monument sign, and three-dimensional objects reinforce the Santa Fe train depot theme and will be well integrated into the site.

The request meets this criterion.

Special Use Permit MZO Section 11-70-5

Per Section 11-70-5 of the City of Mesa Zoning Ordinance, the Board of Adjustment shall also find the following criteria are met for approval of a SUP:

1. Approval of the proposed project will advance the goals and objectives of and is consistent with the policies of the General Plan and any other applicable City plan and/or policies;

The site is located in the Neighborhood character type of the Mesa 2040 General Plan, with a Suburban sub-type. The commercial development along the arterial is consistent with the goals and objectives of the General Plan and approval of the CSP will advance the goals and objectives of the General Plan by allowing a customized sign plan for a commercial development with a unique architectural and design theme.

The proposal meets this criteria.

2. The location, size, design, and operating characteristics of the proposed project are consistent with the purposes of the district where it is located and conform with the General Plan and any other applicable City plan or policies;

The proposed medical office is a permitted use in the LC zoning district per MZO Chapter 11-6. The proposed CSP allowance for attached signs, monument sign, and three-dimensional objects, are consistent with the location, size, design and operating characteristics of the property and the surrounding area.

The proposal meets this criteria.

3. The proposed project will not be injurious or detrimental to the adjacent or surrounding properties in the area, nor will the proposed project or improvements be injurious or detrimental to the neighborhood or to the general welfare of the City; and

The proposed CSP will not be injurious or detrimental to the surrounding properties.

The proposal meets this criteria.

4. Adequate public services, public facilities and public infrastructure are available to serve the proposed project.

The City of Mesa utilities and public infrastructure are available to serve the approved dental office development.

The request meets this criterion.

Findings:

- A. The elevations were recommended for approval for the development of a train depot themed dental office building on October 13, 2020 by the Design Review Board.
- B. Per Section 11-43-3(D)(1) of the MZO, the development is allowed three (3) attached signs with a maximum aggregate sign area of 160 square feet and a maximum 160 square feet of sign area per a sign.
- C. The applicant is proposing eight (8) attached signs that have a maximum aggregate sign area and a maximum area per a sign below what is permitted per the MZO.
- D. Per Section 11-43-3(D)(3) of the MZO, LC zoned properties are allowed multiple detached signs with one (1) foot of sign height per 20 lineal feet of street frontage.
- E. The applicants are proposing one (1) detached monument sign that is 14 feet tall.
- F. Per Section 11-43-9 of the MZO, detached three-dimensional objects are permitted in commercial zoning districts. When these detached three-dimensional objects are within 100-feet from the right of way, 50% of the area of the object shall be deducted from the allowed detached sign area.
- G. The applicants are proposing three (3), three-dimensional objects that include a semaphore, a train crossing arm, and a model train. The three-dimensional objects would not be counted towards the total sign area allowed.
- H. The materials and design of the proposed signs will be well integrated with the theme and architecture of the building.
- I. The subject CSP will advance the goals and objectives of the General Plan. The sign area allowances are also consistent with the location, size, design and operating characteristics of the property and will not be injurious or detrimental to the surrounding properties.

Neighborhood Participation Plan and Public Comments:

The applicant mailed the required notification letters to all property owners within 500 feet of the site. As of the date of this report, staff has not been contacted by any resident or property owner to express support or opposition to the request.

Staff Recommendation:

Based on the application received and preceding analysis, staff finds the proposed CSP conforms to the review criteria for Comprehensive Sign Plans outlined in Section 11-46-3 and the required

findings for a Special Use Permit outlined in Section 11-70-5 of the MZO; therefore, staff recommends approval with the following conditions.

Conditions of Approval:

1. Compliance with the final site plan and all requirements of case ZON20-00488.
2. Compliance with the final elevations, landscape plan, and all requirements of case DRB20-00495.
3. Compliance with all conditions of approval for Case BOA20-00580.
4. Compliance with the sign plan documents submitted.
5. Compliance with all requirements of the Development Services Department regarding the issuance of building permits.
6. All signage to be reviewed and approved through a separate permit application.

Exhibits:

- Exhibit 1 – Vicinity Map
- Exhibit 2 – Staff Report
- Exhibit 3 – Narrative and Justification Statement
- Exhibit 4 – Site Plan
- Exhibit 5 – Sign Details
- Exhibit 6 – Elevations