



**PLANNING DIVISION**  
**STAFF REPORT**

**Board of Adjustment**

**September 2, 2020**

CASE No.: **BOA20-00226**

CASE NAME: **Arrival at Cadence**

Owner's Name:	PPGN-Ellsworth, LLLP
Applicant's Name:	Susan E. Demmit, Gammage & Burnham
Location of Request:	Within the 9200 to 9400 blocks of East Ray Road (south side); the 5200 to 5400 blocks of South Ellsworth Road (east side); and within the 9200 to 9400 blocks of East Cadence Parkway (both sides). Located south of Ray Road and East of Ellsworth Road.
Parcel Nos:	313-25-006A and 313-25-006B
Nature of Request:	Special Use Permit (SUP) to allow a Comprehensive Sign Plan (CSP) for large commercial development.
Zone District:	Planned Community (PC)
Council District:	6
Site Size:	27± acres
Proposed Use:	Commercial development
Existing Use:	Vacant
Staff Planner:	Charlotte Bridges, Planner I
Staff Recommendation:	APPROVAL with Conditions

**HISTORY**

On **October 10, 2012**, City Council approved the annexation of the subject property as part of a larger 483± acre annexation and a comparable zoning of Limited Industrial (LI) (Case No. Z12-027, Ord. No. 5113, and Ord. No. 5114). On the same date, City Council also approved the rezoning of the property from LI to a Planned Community (PC) District and established the Pacific Proving Grounds North Community Plan, which was subsequently named the Cadence Community Plan (Case No. Z12-028, Ord. No. 5115).

On **June 6, 2018**, the Board of Adjustment approved a Special Use Permit for the Cadence Master Comprehensive Sign Plan which established community-wide sign types including major and

minor entry monumentation, non-residential signs, facility/identical signs, directions signs and builder signs (Case No. BOA18-00328).

On **October 9, 2019**, the Planning and Zoning Board approved the Development Unit Plan for Development Unit 1, Phase 2 of the Planned Community District to guide development on the property (Case No. ZON19-00577).

On **March 25, 2020**, the Planning and Zoning Board approved a site plan for the development of a commercial shopping center located at the northeast and southeast corner of Ellsworth Road and Cadence Parkway within Phase 2 of Development Unit 1 of the Cadence Community (Case No. ZON19-00909).

On **July 29, 2020**, the Planning and Zoning Board approved a site plan and Special Use Permit for the development of a convenience market and associated service station at the southeast corner of Ray and Ellsworth Roads, 5214 S Ellsworth Road (Case No. ZON20-00049).

## **PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

### **Background:**

The subject request is for an individual Comprehensive Sign Plan (CSP) for a 27± acre commercial/retail development in a Planned Community (PC) District with an approved Community Plan (CP).

The development, Arrival at Cadence, is located in Phase 2 of Development Unit 1 (DU1) of the Cadence CP, which identifies the land use group (LUG) for the subject site as Community Commercial (CC). Section 4.7 of the Cadence DU 1, Phase 2 Plan, stipulates that all permanent signage within the CC LUG be reviewed and approved as part of an individual CSP and includes general design standards applicable to all signs within the CC LUG. In addition, Section 4.7 of the Cadence DU 1, Phase 2 Plan refers to Chapter 15 of the Cadence Community Plan (CP) for specific standards for all signage types. Section 15.1 of the Cadence CP then establishes the sign standards and criteria as set forth in the Mesa Zoning Ordinance (MZO) as the base sign standards and criteria for use within the Cadence CP except as modified though an approved Comprehensive Sign Plan. Section 15.3 of the Cadence CP states that individual CSPs are required to be reviewed and approved by the Board of Adjustment in conjunction with the granting of a Special Use Permit (SUP).

### **Attached Signs**

The attached signage within the proposed CSP complies with all of the Mesa Zoning Ordinance sign standards. The proposed CSP contains two charts that pertain to attached signs: 1) Standard Attached Sign Allowances Per Occupancy; and 2) Optional Attached Sign Allowances for Single Occupancy PAD Buildings under 5,000 SF Gross Floor Area. These charts specify the maximum number of attached signs, the maximum aggregate sign area calculation and the maximum area per sign based on the linear foot of front building occupancy.

### Detached Signs

The requested CSP proposes 48 feet of aggregate height for detached signs along Ellsworth Road, which is a three-foot increase over MZO allowance. Per Table 11-43-3(D)(3) of the MZO, the maximum aggregate height for the four detached signs along Ellsworth Road is 45 feet.

Per Table 11-43-3(D)(3) of the MZO, the maximum sign height for a detached sign is 12-feet and maximum area per sign is 80 square feet. The detached signs proposed by the ICSP comply with these MZO requirements.

Section 11-43-2(C)(1)(c) of the MZO requires a 75-foot separation between detached permanent signs on the same parcel or group commercial center. The locations for all the detached signs proposed by the CSP comply with this MZO requirement.

**Table 1: Detached Signs: CSP comparison to Table 11-43-3-D-3 of the MZO**

<b>Ellsworth Road (900-feet of Street Frontage)</b>		
<b>Sign Requirements</b>	<b>MZO Requirements</b>	<b>Proposed CSP</b>
<b>Aggregated Area</b>	900 sq. ft. (1 sq. ft. of sign area / lineal ft. of street frontage)	278 sq. ft. (3 signs at 76 sq. ft. each 1 sign at 50 sq. ft.)
<b>Aggregated Height</b>	45 ft. (1 ft. of height / 20 lineal ft. of street frontage)	<b>48 ft.</b> <b>(4 signs at 12 ft. each)</b>
<b>Ray Road (779-feet of Street Frontage)</b>		
<b>Sign Requirements</b>	<b>MZO Requirements</b>	<b>Proposed CSP</b>
<b>Aggregated Area</b>	779 sq. ft. (1 sq. ft. of sign area / lineal ft. of street frontage)	152 sq. ft. (2 signs at 76 sq. ft. each)
<b>Aggregated Height</b>	38 ft. (1 ft. of height / 20 ft. lineal ft. of street frontage)	24 ft. (2 signs at 12 ft. each)
<b>Cadence Parkway (North Parcel) (1,329-feet of Street Frontage)</b>		
<b>Sign Requirements</b>	<b>MZO Requirements</b>	<b>Proposed CSP</b>
<b>Aggregated Area</b>	1,320 sq. ft. (1 sq. ft. of sign area / lineal ft. of street frontage)	1 sign at 76 sq. ft.
<b>Aggregated Height</b>	132 ft. (1 ft. of height / 10 ft. lineal ft. of street frontage)	1 sign at 12 ft.

**Cont'd Table 1: Detached Signs: CSP comparison to Table 11-43-3-D-3 of the MZO**

<b>Cadence Parkway (South Parcel) (1,329-feet of Street Frontage)</b>		
<b>Sign Requirements</b>	<b>MZO Requirements</b>	<b>Proposed CSP</b>
<b>Aggregated Area</b>	1,320 sq. ft. (1 square ft. of sign area / lineal ft. of street frontage)	1 sign at 76 sq. ft.
<b>Aggregated Height</b>	132 ft. (1 ft. of height / 10 ft. lineal ft. of street frontage)	1 sign at 12 ft.

**General Plan Character Area Designation and Goals:**

The property is located in a Mixed Use Community character area designation of the City's General Plan. Per Chapter 7 of the General Plan, the primary focus of the Mixed Use character area designation is for large land areas where it is possible to develop a mixture of uses that create a complete and identifiable community. Such mix of uses include employment, industrial, office, retail, medical, educational, community service, tourism, entertainment, open space, recreational, and residential uses to provide a complete community atmosphere. The requested CSP will advance the goals and objectives of the Mixed Use Community character area by accommodating a customized sign plan for the commercial development that will support future and existing residential development as identified in the Community Plan; as well as help to create a complete and identifiable neighborhood as envisioned with the goals of the Mixed Use Community character designation.

**Gateway Strategic Development Plan:**

The property is also located within the Mixed Use Community District of the Gateway Strategic Development Plan. According to this plan, the focus of the Mixed Use Community District is to provide sustainability through the creation of a live/work/play community with a wide variety of land uses to include low- to high-density residential, commercial, employment, civic and recreational uses. The proposed request conforms to the goals of the Gateway Strategic Development Plan to create a sense of place for people to live, work, and play.

**Site Characteristics:**

The Arrival at Cadence is the commercial anchor of an approximately 464± acre mixed-use, master planned community, Cadence at Gateway, and is located at the southeast corner of Ray and Ellsworth Roads. Access into the development is provided from Ray Road and Ellsworth Road via Cadence Parkway, which serves as the major internal street between the north and south sections of the development and then continues on to serve the residential neighborhoods further to the east and south. The approved site plan for the development indicates 120,000± square feet of retail, employment, restaurant, and services uses on the property. The location of buildings on the property have been oriented toward Cadence Parkway to promote connectivity within the development. In addition, shaded gathering area and pedestrian walkways throughout the development encourage interaction between the commercial development and the

residential development to the east and south, which helps to create an overall unified community.

**Surrounding Zoning Designations and Existing Use Activity:**

<b>Northwest</b> <b>(Across Ellsworth Road)</b> <b>AG</b> <b>Vacant</b>	<b>North</b> <b>(Across Ray Road)</b> <b>PC (Eastmark)</b> <b>Vacant</b>	<b>Northeast</b> <b>(Across Ray Road)</b> <b>PC (Eastmark)</b> <b>Vacant</b>
<b>West</b> <b>(Across Ellsworth Road)</b> <b>LI-PAD</b> <b>Vacant</b>	<b>Subject Property</b> <b>PC (Cadence at Gateway)</b> <b>Vacant</b>	<b>East</b> <b>PC (Eastmark)</b> <b>Residential</b> <b>(Across Cadence Parkway)</b> <b>PC (Cadence at Gateway)</b> <b>Multi-Residence</b>
<b>Southwest</b> <b>(Across Ellsworth Road &amp; across SR24 Gateway)</b> <b>LI-PAD</b> <b>Vacant</b>	<b>South</b> <b>(Across SR 24 Gateway alignment)</b> <b>Zoned in Maricopa County</b> <b>Vacant</b>	<b>Southeast</b> <b>PC (Cadence at Gateway)</b> <b>Residential</b>

**Cadence Community Plan Requirements:**

Section 15.3(a)(i) Review Criteria of the Cadence CP stipulates that an individual CSP may contain signage standards and criteria that exceed the permitted height, area and number of signs specified in the Mesa Zoning Ordinance based on the following criteria:

1. **Placement.** All signs shall be placed where they are sufficiently visible and readable for its function. Factors to be considered shall include the purpose of the sign, its location relative to traffic movement and access point, site features, structures, and sign orientation relative to viewing distance and viewing angles.

**Per Table 11-43-3(D)(3) of the MZO, the maximum aggregate height for the four detached signs along Ellsworth Road is 45 feet. The individual CSP proposes 48 feet of aggregate height for these signs, which exceeds MZO allowance. The three proposed multi-tenant detached signs and the gas station detached sign are properly and appropriately located relative to traffic movement and access points, site features, planned buildings and orientation relative to distance and viewing angle.**

***The requested 48-feet aggregate height of the four detached signs proposed along Ellsworth Road meets this criteria.***

2. **Quantity.** The number of signs that may be approved shall be no greater than that required to provide reasonable project identification and entry signs, internal circulation and directional information to destinations and development sub-areas, and business identification. Factors to be considered shall include the size of the development, the number of development sub-areas, and the division or integration of sign functions.

**A request to increase the quantity of attached and detached signs is not included in this individual CSP.**

***This criteria is not applicable.***

3. **Size.** All signs shall be not be larger than necessary for visibility and readability unless unique land use or architectural considerations exist. Factors to be considered in determining appropriate size shall include topography, volume of traffic, speed of traffic, visibility range, proximity to adjacent uses, amount of sign copy, placement of display (location and height), lettering style and presence of distractive influences.

**A request to increase the size (area) of attached and detached signs is not included in this individual CSP.**

***This criteria is not applicable.***

4. **Material.** Sign material shall be compatible with architectural and/or natural features of the project. This may be accomplished through similarity of materials for sign structures and faces, the use of complementary colors, similarity of architectural style , or use of a consistent lettering style or copy.

**All proposed attached and detached sign have been designed using the same type of materials, colors, and illumination to provide for uniform regulation and orderly and consistent development.**

***The proposed detached signs along Ellsworth Road meet this criteria.***

5. **Context.** The design of all signs should respect the context of the surround area and the character establish by existing signage. Items to be considered include, but are not limited to, lettering style, sign placement, and architectural style.

**Specifications for lettering style, sign placement and architectural style are included in this individual CSP.**

***The proposed detached signs along Ellsworth Road meet this criteria.***

6. **Sign Illumination and Brightness.** Signs, when illuminated, shall conform to the Mesa Lighting and Electrical Code, and shall conform to the brightness standards specified in the Mesa Sign Ordinance.

***Staff has included a condition of approval to address this requirement.***

## **Mesa Zoning Ordinance Requirements and Regulations:**

### **Special Use Permit MZO Section 11-70-5**

Per Section 11-70-5(E) of the City of Mesa Zoning Ordinance, the Board of Adjustment shall also find the following criteria are met for approval of a SUP:

1. Approval of the proposed project will advance the goals and objectives of and is consistent with the policies of the General Plan and any other applicable City plan and/or policies;

**Arrival at Cadence is located in a Mixed Use Community character area designation of the City of Mesa General Plan and the Mixed Use Community District of the Gateway Strategic Development Plan. Per Chapter 7 of the General Plan, the primary focus of the Mixed Use character area designation is for large land areas where it is possible to develop a mixture of uses that create a complete and identifiable community. Uses may include a mix of retail, entertainment, and offices. Approval of the CSP will advance the goals and objectives of the General Plan and the Gateway Strategic Development Plan by accommodating a customized sign plan for the planned commercial/retail, employment, restaurant, and/or service uses within development.**

***The proposal meets this criteria.***

2. The location, size, design, and operating characteristics of the proposed project are consistent with the purposes of the district where it is located and conform with the General Plan and any other applicable City plan or policies;

**The location, size, and design of the proposed signage is consistent with the existing PC District and CC LUG, and also conforms with the Mixed Use Community character area of the General Plan. The proposed signage, which includes similar materials for sign structures, faces, and architectural style, as well as complementary colors, complements the planned architectural character of the area and the established design themes within the Cadence at Gateway community. All signs are strategically located to be sufficiently visible and readable for their function. The locations of the attached building tenant signs, multi-tenant monument signs, and gas station monument signs are properly and appropriately located relative to traffic movement and access points, site features, planned buildings, and orientation relative to distances and viewing angles.**

***The proposal meets this criteria.***

3. The proposed project will not be injurious or detrimental to the adjacent or surrounding properties in the area, nor will the proposed project or improvements be injurious or detrimental to the neighborhood or to the general welfare of the City; and

**The proposed CSP will not be injurious or detrimental to the surrounding properties, nor to the general welfare of the City. The design, placement, quantity, and size respect the existing and planned context and character of the area.**

***The proposal meets this criteria.***

4. Adequate public services, public facilities and public infrastructure are available to serve the proposed project.

**This CSP has no impact on public services, public facilities, or public infrastructure. Adequate public services, public facilities, and public infrastructure are available to serve Arrival at Cadence.**

***The proposal meets this criteria.***

#### **Findings**

- A. Arrival at Cadence is a large commercial development of approximately 27± acres located at the southeast corner of Ray and Ellsworth Roads.
- B. The Arrival at Cadence development is the commercial anchor of an approximately 464± acre mixed-use, master planned community known as Cadence at Gateway.
- C. The Arrival at Cadence individual CSP conforms with Section 4.7 of the Cadence DU 1, Phase 2 Plan for the CC LUG.
- D. The Arrival at Cadence individual CSP conforms with the purpose and intent of Chapter 15 of the Cadence CP by establishing flexible sign criteria tailored to a specific development project with standards appropriate to the unique character of the development.
- E. The Arrival at Cadence individual CSP conforms to Section 15.1 of the Cadence CP, which establishes the sign standards and criteria as set forth in the Mesa Zoning Ordinance (MZO) as the base sign standards and criteria for use within the Cadence CP except as modified by this CSP.
- F. The Arrival at Cadence individual CSP provides the required information for each proposed sign type in compliance with Section 15.3(a) of the Cadence CP.
- G. The Arrival at Cadence individual CSP proposed 48 feet of aggregate height for the four detached signs along Ellsworth Road, meets the criteria in Section 15.3(a)(i) of the Cadence CP to exceed the 45-foot maximum aggregate height specified in Table 11-43-3(D)(3) of the MZO.
- H. Approval of the CSP will advance the goals and objectives of the General Plan and the Gateway Strategic Development Plan by accommodating a customized sign plan for the planned commercial/retail, employment, restaurant, and/or service uses within development.
- I. The location, size, and design of the proposed signage is consistent with the existing PC District, Cadence CP, and also conforms with the Mixed Use Community character area of



the General Plan and the Mixed Use Community District of the Gateway Strategic Development Plan .

- J. The Arrival at Cadence CSP will not be injurious or detrimental to the surrounding properties, nor to the general welfare of the City. The design, placement, quantity, and size respect the existing and planned context and character of the area.
- K. The Arrival at Cadence CSP has no impact on public services, public facilities, or public infrastructure. Adequate public services, public facilities, and public infrastructure are available to serve Arrival at Cadence development.

**Neighborhood Participation Plan and Public Comments:**

The applicant sent the required notification letters to all property owners within DU 1 area of the Cadence at Gateway Community, which exceeds the required 500-foot notification area. As of writing this report, staff has not been contacted by any resident or property owner to express support or opposition to the request.

**Staff Recommendation:**

Based on the application received and the preceding analysis, staff finds the Arrival at Cadence CSP conforms to the review criteria as outlined in Section 4.7 of the DU1 Phase 2 Plan, Chapter 15 of the Cadence CP, and the review criteria for a Special Use Permit outlined in Section 11-70-5 of the MZO; therefore, staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

**Conditions of Approval:**

- 1. Compliance with the sign plan documents submitted, except as modified by the conditions listed below;
- 2. All signs shall comply with Section 11-43-2 Design Standards for Permanent Signs and Sign Structures of the Mesa Zoning Ordinance, as required by Section 15.1 of the Cadence CP; and
- 3. All signs, when illuminated, shall conform to the City of Mesa Lighting and Electrical Code, and shall conform to the brightness standards specified in the Mesa Sign Ordinance as required by Section 15.3(a)(i)(6) of the Cadence CP; and
- 4. Compliance with all requirements of the Development Services Department in the issuance of sign permits.

**Attachments:**

Exhibit 1-Vicinity Map  
Exhibit 2-Staff Report  
Exhibit 3-Narrative and Justification  
Exhibit 4-Comprehensive Sign Plan  
Exhibit 5-Site Plan  
Exhibit 6-Development Unit 1 Phase 2 – Section 4.7  
Exhibit 7-Chapter 15 of the Cadence CP