

Board of Adjustment

Staff Report

CASE NUMBER: BOA18-00328

LOCATION/ADDRESS: The 5200 to 5300 blocks of South Ellsworth Road (east side). Located on the east side of Ellsworth Road and the north side of the future State Route 24 freeway alignment to the Williams Field Road alignment and both sides of the Williams Field Road alignment to approximately one-quarter mile east of the Crismon Road alignment.

COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 6

STAFF PLANNER: Veronica Gonzalez, Planner II

OWNER: PPGN-Ray, LLLP

APPLICANT: Andrea Alegria, Silver Fern Companies, LLC

REQUEST: *Requesting a Special Use Permit (SUP) to establish a Comprehensive Sign Plan (CSP) for the Cadence Planned Community (formerly known as Pacific Proving Grounds North) in the PC district.*

SUMMARY OF APPLICANT'S REQUEST

This request involves the review of the master comprehensive sign plan for the Cadence Planned Community. The applicant has indicated the signs described by this Comprehensive Sign Plan (CSP) will be used to identify the project, significant community entries, community facilities and direct people to builder locations around the 484-acre site.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends **approval** of case BOA18-00328, **with the following conditions:**

1. *Compliance with the Cadence Master Comprehensive Sign Plan (MCSP) dated May 16, 2018, as submitted, except as may be modified by the conditions listed below;*
2. *Placement of any sign within a Public Utility and Facility Easement (PUFE) or a Public Utility Easement (PUE) requires review and approval of an encroachment permit by the City Engineer before the sign is erected or placed;*
3. *A Minor Community Entry Monument may only be placed on two (2) of the four (4) corners at the intersection indicated on the Signage Master Plan map (page 1 of the Cadence MCSP).*

SITE CONTEXT

CASE SITE: A portion of the former General Motors Proving Grounds, now referred to as "Cadence" – zoned PC

NORTH: Eastmark DU-8 – zoned PC

EAST: Eastmark DU-8 – zoned PC

SOUTH: Vacant land/Future SR-24 alignment – Zoned Maricopa County RU-43

WEST: (Across Ellsworth Road) Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport – zoned LI-PAD

STAFF SUMMARY AND ANALYSIS:

Cadence at Gateway is an approximately 484 acre planned community located in a portion of the former GM Proving Grounds property. The Community Plan (CP) for Cadence was adopted in 2012 and established the regulatory framework and design standards to facilitate its development as a New Traditional Community. Chapter 15 of the Cadence CP sets forth the criteria and standards for signage within the community. This request for a master comprehensive sign plan (MCSP) is required per Section 15.2 of the CP.

In accordance with Section 15.2 of the Cadence CP, this MCSP will create a cohesive and flexible foundation for community-wide signage. The MCSP outlines six different types of community-wide signage that include the following:

- Major Entry Monumentation

- Minor Entry Monumentation
- Non-Residential Signage
- Facility/Identity Signage
- Directional Signage
- Builder Signage

Based on the sign types submitted, the goal of this MCSP is to provide overall community theming and identity, internal circulation and directional information and business identification. The MCSP does not include signage for specific development projects within Cadence. Per Chapter 15 of the Cadence CP, review and approval of separate comprehensive sign plans is required for specific development projects and certain temporary signs.

In total, the MCSP proposes up to 66 community-wide signs (exclusive of any future signs within individual comprehensive sign plans or temporary comprehensive sign plans). Table 1 below outlines the six different types of proposed signage within this MCSP and how they compare with MZO standards. **Bolded** entries denote the MCSP proposal.

Table 1: Comparison of Cadence MCSP with Conventional Sign Ordinance

Cadence Sign Type	Comparable Sign Ord Sign Type	Proposed Number (total)	Sign Ord Permitted Number	Individual Sign Height	Sign Ord Maximum Sign Height	Individual Sign Area	Sign Ord Maximum Sign Area (per sign)	Comparable Content Neutral Sign Type
Community Entry (Major and Minor)	Subdivision Entry (Permanent)	1 Major 2 Minor	2 signs at each subdivision entry	Minor: 6 ft Major: 10 ft	6 ft	104 sq ft Minor 210 sq ft Major	12 sq ft	Subdivision Entry Sign
Non-Residential Signage	Detached (Permanent)	12	1 sq ft of sign area/1' street frontage 1' total sign height/10' street frontage	9 ft	12 ft	33 sq ft	80 sq ft	Permanent Detached
Directional Signage	Subdivision Directional (Temporary)	13	2 signs per subdivision	5 ft, 4 in	10 ft	7.2 sq ft	48 sq ft	Portable Rigid Detached
Builder Signage	Subdivision Directional (Temporary)	31	2 signs per subdivision	5 ft	10-ft	11.44 sq ft	48 sq ft	Portable Rigid Detached
Facility ID Signage	On-site (Permanent)*	7	1 sign per site*	**A: 5 ft **B: 4 ft	6 ft*	**A: 3 sq ft **B: 3.8 sq ft	6 sq ft*	Permanent Detached

* Assumes location in residential zoning district

** See Page 2 of the Cadence MCSP for Sign Types A and B

Major Community Entry Monumentation will be located at the entrance to the development at Cadence Parkway off of Ellsworth Road. Major entry monumentation includes limestone pillars and an entry portal. Five pillars and the entry portal will be located on the north side of Cadence Parkway. A center pillar will be placed in the median that will include

a 15 square foot Cadence logo. Seven pillars will be located on the south side of Cadence Parkway that will spell out the community name and account for 195 square feet of sign area. The letters C-A-D-E-N-C-E will be steel pan letters with halo backlighting. Staff believes the amount of sign area proposed for the major community entry monumentation is justifiable as the monumentation is well-designed and establishes a sense of place for this community.

Minor Community Entry Monumentation mimics the design of the major entry monumentation in that it employs the same seven pillars spelling out the community name but on a smaller scale. The minor entry monumentation will not include the entry portal or the additional pillars. Minor community entry monumentation will be located on just two of the four corners indicated on the Signage Master Plan map (see condition #4).

Non-Residential Signage, Directional Signage, Builder Signage and Facility ID Signage are intended to provide wayfinding and identification within the community. As with the major and minor community entry monuments, staff believes these proposed sign types are well-designed and enhance the overall community identity.

When compared with typical subdivision signage used under conventional MZO allowances, the number and amount of sign area of the proposed MCSP appears to be large. However, at approximately 484 acres, Cadence is a significantly sized planned community comprising multiple individual subdivision plats. The proposed MCSP is proportional to the scale of the development. With regard to directional and builder signage, the MCSP proposes to consolidate various builder directional signage within the development to specific locations on a single sign resulting in a significant reduction of sign clutter. It is also important to note that in a PC district, the adopted CP is authorized by MZO Section 11-11-2.C to be the regulating document for the project and may include requirements that differ from requirements found in standard zoning districts. The proposed MCSP meets the requirements for community-wide signage as outlined in Chapter 15 of the Cadence CP.

FINDINGS:

1. The Cadence at Gateway Planned Community is a large master planned development consisting of approximately ±484 acres.
2. The Cadence MCSP conforms with the purpose and intent of Chapter 15 of the Cadence CP.
3. The Cadence MCSP authorizes sign area for some sign types that exceed the maximum allowed under the standard Sign Ordinance. The Cadence CP may do so based on Section 11-11-2.C of the Zoning Ordinance.
4. Because of the scale of this development, the Cadence MCSP proposes a significant amount of signage. However, two of the proposed sign types will consolidate information conveying directions to several places on a single sign resulting in a significant reduction of sign clutter.
5. The overall design and materials specified by the Cadence MCSP are of a high quality and are compatible with the architectural features of the project.
6. With the recommended conditions of approval, signs authorized by the Cadence MCSP meet the purpose and intent of Chapter 15 of the Cadence CP and the goals of the Mesa Zoning Ordinance.

CADENCE COMMUNITY PLAN REQUIREMENTS:

Chapter 15. Sign Regulations:

15.2. Master Comprehensive Sign Plans.

A Master Comprehensive Sign plan is intended to create a cohesive and flexible foundation for community-wide signage within PPGN that is appropriate to the character of the overall community, provides adequate identification and information, provides a good visual environment, promotes traffic safety and is regulated to the extent reasonably necessary.

15.2(a) Review and Approval. A Master Comprehensive Sign Plan shall be reviewed and approved by the Zoning Administrator or Board of Adjustment in conjunction with the granting of a Special Use Permit ("SUP") to establish the regulations for all permanent community-wide signage, such as overall project monumentation and identification, entry monumentation, directional signage, and other permanent signage of a community-wide nature. A Master Comprehensive Sign Plan must contain all of the following information for each proposed sign:

1. Sign Type (attached, wall mounted, monument, awning, etc.)
2. Sign Area.
3. Height and Length.
4. Location.
5. Color and Materials.
6. Lighting, Electronics, or Animation.

15.2(a)(i) Review Criteria. Because of the unique nature of land use styles and architectural characteristics within PPGN, a Master Comprehensive Sign Plan may contain signage standards and criteria that exceed the permitted height, area and number of signs specified in the Mesa Zoning Ordinance based on the following criteria:

1. **Placement.** All signs shall be placed where they are sufficiently visible and readable for their function. Factors to be considered shall include the purpose of the sign, its location relative to traffic movement and access points, site features, structures, and sign orientation relative to viewing distances and viewing angles.
2. **Quantity.** The number of signs that may be approved shall be no greater than that required to provide reasonable project identification and entry signs, internal circulation and directional information to destinations and development sub-areas, and business identification. Factors to be considered shall include the size of the development, the number of development sub-areas, and the division or integration of sign functions.
3. **Size.** All signs shall be no larger than necessary for visibility and readability unless unique land use or architectural considerations exist. Factors to be considered in determining appropriate size shall include topography, volume of traffic, speed of traffic, visibility range, proximity to adjacent uses, amount of sign copy, placement of display (location and height), lettering style and the presence of distractive influences.
4. **Materials.** Sign materials shall be compatible with architectural and/or natural features of the project. This may be accomplished through similarity of materials for sign structures and faces, the use of complementary colors, similarity of architectural style, or the use of a consistent lettering style or copy.
5. **Context.** The design of all signs should respect the context of the surrounding area and the character established by existing signage. Items to be considered include, but are not limited to, lettering style, sign placement, and architectural style.
6. **Sign Illumination and Brightness.** Signs, when illuminated, shall conform to the Mesa Lighting and Electrical Code, and shall conform to the brightness standards specified in the Mesa Sign Ordinance.