

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 21, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- 6-b ZON18-00169 District 6.** The 8200 to 8400 blocks of East Baseline Road (north side). Located west of Hawes Road on the north side of Baseline Road. (32.6± acres). Modification of an existing PAD. This request will allow for the reduction of interior garage dimensions. Drew Huseth, Woodside Homes, applicant; Baseline Mesa LLC, owner.

Planner: Cassidy Welch

Staff Recommendation: Denial

Summary: Staffmember Cassidy Welch presented case ZON18-00169. Ms. Welch stated the current City of Mesa zoning code requires new subdivisions provide a 20' wide by 22' deep, 2 car garage. Ms. Welch stated the applicant is requesting a reduction in the garage size to 19' 4" wide by 22' deep for the traditional lots, and 21' 4" wide by 20" deep for the alley loaded courtyard product. She stated staff feels the reduction of garage size would not provide sufficient storage space or parking and increase traffic concerns. Ms. Welch stated there are no driveways for the alley loaded product and staff feels the residents will be parking on the streets. Ms. Welch stated staff feels a reduction in garage space would significantly deteriorate the quality of the neighborhood.

Susan Demmitt, Gammage & Burnham, 2 North Central Ave., spoke on behalf of the applicant. Ms. Demmitt explained this is the first time Woodside Homes has developed in the City of Mesa and feels they had been proactive in working with staff and customizes floor plans and elevations for each new development. Ms. Demmitt stated as they progressed into developing the product, they ensured they worked within any specific City of Mesa guidelines and are now in the Final Plat stage. Ms. Demmitt stated the garage dimension requirement is an unusual regulation and not easy to find in COM zoning ordinance. She explained once this came to their attention, they immediately requested a reduction in the garage dimension. Ms. Demmitt stated the reduction of the garage size is imperative due to the product type and size of the lots.

Ms. Demmitt explained the applicant is requesting an 8" reduction in width for two of the six floor plans in the traditional product and a reduction of all the garages for the cluster product. She believes there will be adequate storage space for all of the garages and that they meet or exceed all requirements. Ms. Demmitt reviewed garage size requirements of surrounding cities and feels the City of Mesa has the greatest requirements. She stated this is a market driven issue and builders build what buyers are looking for.

Ms. Demmitt stated Woodside Homes had built cluster product in other communities and have not experience parking issues with this product. Boardmember Sarkissian inquired if the other Woodside Home

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 21, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

communities have been sold and if there have been any parking issues. Ms. Demmitt stated there is a community in West Phoenix, 75th Avenue and Thomas Road, which is fully built out. She stated Woodside Homes has not experienced any parking issues at this time in this development.

Ms. Demmitt explained they have already made modifications to the 45' wide floor plans in response to conversations with staff. She stated the original intent was to build a 19'4"x20' garage which is what was built in other communities. Ms. Demmitt explained the intent was to provide an option for buyers to extend their garage 2'. Instead of the option for the buyer, Ms. Demmitt stated they agreed with staff to make the 2' extension a mandatory requirement for the 45' lots.

Ms. Demmitt stated their request is for reduction of the width of the garages and not reduction of length for the traditional lots. She explained the process if the builder were required to keep the larger garages and the impact on living spaces. She explained these elevations are finely tuned floor plans and are geared to a specific buyer type. Ms. Demmitt stated it would be helpful to the building community if the requirements were not buried in the ordinance and easier to find.

Ms. Demmitt believes the reduced garages accommodate the type of vehicles people are driving today. She presented a comparison of top selling vehicles in 2017 and found that all of the cars would comfortably fit into the smaller garage. She stated the issue then becomes if there is enough storage. Ms. Demmitt stated the cluster lots all have 10' side yards that run the length of the house, and do not have traditional rear yards. She explained there is enough room for to store trash receptacles on the side yard, a lawn mower or bikes. There is also a 45 sq. ft. storage area under the stairway in the house for storage. As far as the parking concerns, Ms. Demmitt stated they exceed the city standards for parking requirements by providing 3 parking spaces per home, averaging a ratio of 3.1. The streets are designed by city standards and designed for on-street parking.

Referencing the traditional lots, Ms. Demmitt provided the Board with specific garage sizes for each of the traditional lots. She stated they have a minimum 10' rear yard, but the buyer for these lots want a more traditional back yard. Ms. Demmitt stated every single lot in the traditional homes will be 20' deep at a minimum. This will provide the buyer space in the rear for storage. She stated there will be space to park two vehicles in the driveway and there will be on-street parking, developed by City standards.

Boardmember Boyle inquired of staff if they feel the location of the standards for garage size is easily located, as he has been able to locate it for his various projects. Planning Director John Wesley responded staff feels it is easily found and is located in the Zoning Code under parking standards. Mr. Wesley stated it has been suggested it be added to residential design standards as well.

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 21, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

Boardmember Allen stated her home was built prior to the standard and is unable to fit two cars in her garage and struggles with the request for narrowing garage sizes. Ms. Allen stated neighbors have begun parking their cars on the street and feels it makes a statement in the neighborhood. She understands the cost associated with changing the garage sizes, but feels cluster homes typically are starter homes and buyers tend to turn into rentals. Boardmember Allen stated she is still opposed to approving the reduction of the garages.

Chair Clement inquired if the applicant had read the code correctly, would this have changed anything. Ms. Demmitt replied they would still be here today, requesting the reduction of the garage width. She explained the reduced garage sizes are adequate for this product.

Chair Clement inquired if there have been other requests for this width recently. Planning Director John Wesley responded the 20' width standard has been in our code for years. In 2011, the standard for depth was changed from 20' to 22'. Mr. Wesley explained there was a request a few years ago from Mulberry to reduce one product line to 19'4" in width. He stated all other small lot cluster product have been built to City standards.

Chair Clement inquired what would be the process if the Board denies the request. Ms. Demmitt stated they will continue to proceed to Council for their decision. If it is denied, Woodside Homes would need to reassess their development. Ms. Demmitt stated she feels the City needs to have flexibility in the Ordinance standards for small lot development.

Boardmember Sarkissian stated if the application were to be denied, the applicant could incur the cost of revising the floor plans, be impacted with amending the set-backs for PAD amendment or re-plat the entire development. Ms. Sarkissian stated this could push the developer to walk away from the project. She stated she feels deviating the standards for this product at this location is appropriate.

Vice Chair Dahlke stated she feels that most vehicles will be able to fit into the smaller garage and making the home smaller would make selling the home harder. Ms. Dahlke stated there are storage opportunities provided and the applicant has exceeded the parking requirements. She feels the applicant is so far along in the process and it would be unfair to recommend denial.

Boardmember Boyle stated he recognizes the hardship a denial would put on the applicant, as he has been through having to lose some units on a project because of the standards. Mr. Boyle stated he feels the standards make a better product and better City and is not concerned what other cities' requirements are. He stated he likes we are trying new product and feels we need to go with standards that have been set.

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 21, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

It was moved by Vice Chair Dahlke to approve case ZON18-00169 with the recommended stipulations presented by Planning Director John Wesley. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Sarkissian.

That: The Board recommends the approval of the PAD Modifications to case ZON18-00169 conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with conditions of approval associated with case numbers Z14-021 and ZON17-00326, except as amended by case ZON18-00169.
2. All traditional lot homes (45'x110') allowed a garage width not less than 19' 4" and depth of garage shall meet City standards.
3. All courtyard and alley lot homes allowed a garage depth of not less than 20' and width of garage shall meet City standards.

Vote: 3-2 (Boardmembers Astle and Duff, absent; Boardmembers Allen and Boyle, nay)

* * * * *

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.gov