



**PLANNING DIVISION
STAFF REPORT**

Planning and Zoning Board

August 24, 2022

CASE No.: **ZON21-00966**

PROJECT NAME: **Villas on Main**

| | |
|---|---|
| Owner's Name: | BFH HOLDINGS LLC |
| Applicant's Name: | David Bohn, The BFH Group |
| Location of Request: | Within the 6100 block of East Main Street (south side). Located east of Recker Road on the south side of Main Street. |
| Parcel No(s): | 141-57-081B |
| Request: | Rezoning from Limited Commercial (LC) to Multiple Residence 3 with a U designation and a Planned Area Development overly (RM-3U-PAD) and Site Plan Review. This request will allow for a multiple residence development |
| Existing Zoning District: | Limited Commercial (LC) |
| Council District: | 2 |
| Site Size: | 4.5± acres |
| Proposed Use(s): | Multiple Residences |
| Existing Use(s): | Vacant |
| P&Z Hearing Date(s): | August 24, 2022 / 4:00 p.m. |
| Staff Planner: | Charlotte Bridges, Planner II |
| Staff Recommendation: | APPROVAL with conditions |
| Planning and Zoning Board Recommendation: | |
| Proposition 207 Waiver Signed: | Yes |

HISTORY

On **December 16, 1974**, the City Council approved the annexation of 3,957± acres of land, including the subject site. Prior to annexation, Maricopa County adopted a Development Master Plan (DMP) for the 2,100-acre Leisure World development, which included the subject site. Upon annexation, the City of Mesa began using this master plan to guide development in the area (Ordinance No. 907).

On **June 17, 1975**, the City Council established comparable zoning on 160± acres of recently annexed land. The subject site was rezoned from Maricopa County Rural 43 to C-2 (equivalent to Limited Commercial [LC]) along the Main Street frontage to a depth of 200-feet. The remainder of the subject site was rezoned Agricultural (AG) (Case No. Z75-029, Ordinance No. 936).

On **July 5, 1978**, City Council rezoned 45± acres, including the southern portion of the subject site, from AG to LC in compliance with Leisure World DMP (Case No. Z78-043, Ordinance No. 1149).

On **July 2, 1984**, City Council approved a DMP modification for an 82± acre area, including the subject site, to allow for the development of retail, office and multi-family development (Case No. Z84-119, Ordinance No. 1851).

On **December 3, 1984**, City Council approved a site plan for a 17± acre area, including the subject site, to allow for the development of a group commercial center (Case No. SPR84-028).

On **February 17, 1987**, City Council approved a site plan modification for a 17± acre area, including the subject site, to allow for the development of a group commercial center. This case was approved with a two-year time limit to begin construction. The site plan modification subsequently expired when construction did not commence. (Case No. SPM86-027, Ordinance No. 2173).

On **December 17, 2007**, City Council approved a site plan modification for the subject property to allow the expansion of an existing office development (Case No. Z07-111, Ordinance No. 4788).

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant is requesting to rezone the subject property from Limited Commercial (LC) to Multiple Residence 3 (RM-3) with Urban (U) designation and a Planned Area Development Overlay (RM-3U-PAD) and requesting Site Plan Review of an Initial Site Plan to allow an 86-unit multiple residence development. The subject site is undeveloped and is located approximately 650 feet east of Recker Road on the south side of Main Street. The proposed site plan shows 86, two-story, attached dwelling units grouped into various configurations. As part of the request for the PAD overlay, the applicant is requesting certain modifications to the City's development standards to facilitate the development of the property.

General Plan Character Area Designation and Goals:

The Mesa 2040 General Plan Character Area designation on the property is Mixed Use Activity District with a Community Scale Sub-type. Per Chapter 7 of the General Plan, the focus of the Mixed Use Activity District is large-scale community and regional activity areas that usually have significant retail and commercial components including shopping areas, power centers, and lifestyle centers that are designed and developed to attract customers from a large radius. The district often includes other uses such as office, entertainment, and residential.

Additionally, the site is also located in a Transit Corridor character type. This character type overlays the other character types and is used to transition the area into a more transit- and pedestrian-oriented development form. The focus in this character type is to develop a mixed-use, pedestrian-oriented, urban environment, particularly within walking distance of transit stops. Currently, there are no plans for a light rail extension or a bus rapid transit route in the area, however there is a Valley Metro bus route along Main Street with bus stops within an eighth of a mile to the east and west of the subject site. To implement compliance with the Transit Corridor character type's focus and purpose, the General Plan permits a RM-3 District with an Urban (U) designator as a primary zoning district.

Per Chapter 7 (pg. 7-20) of the General Plan, a Mixed Use Activity District character area may take on a significant residential character with the redevelopment of shopping centers, so long as the residential component is developed secondary to the primary uses. Secondary uses may be permitted in conjunction with a greater commercial development or complimentary to existing commercial developments provided the minimum percentage of primary uses within the character area are established through existing zoning/development. Per Chapter 7 (pg. 7-22) of the General Plan, a minimum of 70% of the total Mixed Use Activity District character area shall be reserved for primary zoning designations and uses. These primary designations shall include commercial zoning districts, such as the Office Commercial (OC), Limited Commercial (LC), General Commercial (GC), Mixed Use (MX), Planned Employment Park (PEP), and Infill Incentive District 2 (ID-2). The minimum percentages of the zoning can be met with a combination of the above listed zoning districts, or the entire area may be zoned under one primary zoning district. In addition to the zoning requirements, the General Plan also outlines the minimum and maximum percentages of primary and secondary land uses allowed in the Mixed-Use Activity District character area designation. Per this requirement, the maximum allowed secondary land uses for multiple Residences is 30%.

Greater than 70% of the Mixed Use Activity District character area is established with LC and GC zoning districts and is developed with primary uses. The subject request, being zoned entirely RM-3U-PAD to allow for the proposed multiple residence development, helps achieve the goals of the Mixed Use Activity District by providing a horizontal mix of multiple residence with existing commercial and office uses. In addition, the proposed multiple residence development will add to the housing types in the area and add to the surrounding population that can support existing and future commercial developments.

Finally, the proposed multiple residence development helps achieve the goals of the Transit Corridor character type by locating the residences close to Main Street to create an urban environment, providing sidewalks from the development to public sidewalks to create pedestrian connectivity and installing landscape trees and shrubs to improve the Main Street streetscape.

Overall, Staff reviewed the request and determined it is consistent with the review criteria for developments outlined in Chapter 15 (pg. 15-1) of the Mesa 2040 General Plan.

Zoning District Designations:

The request is to rezone the site from LC to RM-3U with a PAD Overlay. Per Section 11-5-2 of the MZO, the RM-3U zoning district allows for a wide range of housing types including multiple

residences use with a minimum density of 12 dwelling units per acre and a maximum density of 20 dwelling units per net acre. The subject request complies with these density requirements.

PAD Overlay Modification – MZO Article 3, Chapter 22:

The subject request includes a Planned Area Development overlay (PAD) to allow for modifications to certain required development standards of the MZO on the property. Per Section 11-22 of the MZO, the purpose of the PAD overlay is to allow innovative design and flexibility that creates high-quality development for the site. Overall, the proposed development complies with requirements of a PAD as outlined in Section 11-22 of the MZO by incorporating high-quality development design standards. Table 1 below shows the MZO required standard and the applicant's proposed PAD standard.

Table 1: Development Standards

| Development Standards | MZO Required | PAD Proposed | Staff Recommendation |
|--|--|--|-----------------------------|
| <u>Standards for Required Open Space –</u> <i>MZO Section 11-5-5(A)(3)(e)(i)(1)</i> | Private open space located at the ground level (e.g., yards, decks, patios) shall have no dimension less than ten (10) feet. | Private open space located at the ground level (e.g., yards, decks, patios) shall have no dimension less than five feet. | As proposed |
| Attached Garages– <i>MZO Section 11-5-5(B)(4)(f)(ii)</i> | In multi-story buildings that include livable floor area, garage doors located below upper-story living space shall be recessed at least three (3) feet from the upper story facade. | In multi-story buildings that include livable floor area, garage doors located below upper-story living space may be on plane with the upper story façade. | As proposed |
| Foundation Base – <i>MZO Section 11-33-5(A)(2)(b)</i> - Along exterior walls adjacent to a drive aisle | Minimum five foot wide foundation base shall be provided, measured from face of building to face of curb along the entire length of the exterior | At garage fronts only, a minimum two foot wide foundation base shall be provided, measured from face of garage front to face of curb along the entire exterior length | As Proposed |

| | | | |
|--|-----------------------------------|--|--|
| | wall adjacent to drive aisles. | of the garage front adjacent to drive aisles. | |
|--|-----------------------------------|--|--|

Standards for Required Open Space:

Per Section 11-5-5(A)(3)(e)(i)(1) of the MZO, private open space located at the ground level (e.g., yards, decks, patios) shall have no dimension less than 10 feet. The applicant is requesting a minimum dimension of five feet in depth for the private patios for 22 units along the east, south, and west perimeters of the development. The width of the private open space for each dwelling unit will be 21 feet.

The private open space dimensions for units varies throughout the site. The remaining 12 units on the ground level along the east, south, and west perimeters of the development will have private patios six feet in depth. The private patios for dwelling units within the interior of the site will be eight feet in depth and the private patios for dwelling units along Main Street will be seven feet to eight feet in depth. As proposed the smallest private open space area is 105 square feet.

Attached Garages:

Per Section 11-5-5(B)(4)(f)(ii) of the MZO, in multi-story buildings that include livable floor area, garage doors located below upper-story living space shall be recessed at least three feet from the upper story facade. The applicant is requesting to eliminate this requirement, however, they are proposing architectural overhangs along the garage frontage, large vertically hung windows and enhanced garage doors to accent the variation between units and promote uniqueness within the development.

Foundation Base:

Per Section 11-33-5(A)(2)(5) of the MZO, a minimum five-foot-wide foundation base shall be provided, measured from face of building to face of curb along the entire length of the exterior wall adjacent to drive aisles. The applicant is requesting a minimum distance of two feet along 16 of the units. A total of 38 units will have a three-foot-wide foundation base adjacent to the drive aisle. The remaining 32 units will meet the minimum five-foot-wide foundation base in accordance with the MZO development standard.

The reason for this requested modification is due to the “alley loading” layout. Overall, there will be a varying distance from the face of the buildings to the face of curb. Per the applicant’s narrative, justification for this request is the provision of a more robust and abundant open space to promote community interaction and a higher quality living experience.

Justification:

Justification for the PAD overly includes an average of 145± square feet of private open space per unit, where only 100 square feet is required. Outside of the private patios, the site plan delivers

approximately 811± square feet of common open space per unit, which includes a perimeter, five-foot-wide meandering sidewalk that connects the swimming pool, tot-lot, pickle ball court, and ramada site amenity areas. In addition, the development provides each unit with a double-car garage, where only one covered parking spaces is required per unit and incorporates additional architectural design elements to create a unique community aesthetic. Overall, the proposed development complies with requirements of a PAD as outlined in Section 11-22 of the MZO by incorporating high-quality design elements into the project.

Site Plan and General Site Development Standards:

The proposed site plan shows development of 86, two-story, attached dwelling units grouped into various configurations and with a proposed density of 18.7± dwelling units per acre. Each unit contains two-bedrooms located on the second floor and a minimum of 105 square feet of private, ground-floor open space.

Access to the site is from Main Street by two, separate drive entrances, one providing access to the west half of the site and other providing access to the east half of the site. Interior to the site, visitor parking spaces are provided adjacent to the centralized common open space area. This common open space area contains mailbox kiosks, a swimming pool, two ramadas with barbeque, a tot lot, and dog park area. Centrally located along the south property line, is another common open space area with a pickle ball court and additional visitor parking spaces. Throughout the site, sidewalks connect the units to the common open space areas and Main Street.

Per Section 11-32-3 of the MZO, 181 parking spaces are required for the development, of which 86 spaces (one per unit) must be covered or garage spaces. Resident parking is accommodated by a double-car garage in each unit for a total of 172 covered parking spaces. According to the site plan submitted, 13 visitor parking spaces are provided.

Design Review:

The Design Review Board is scheduled to review this development on July 12, 2022. Staff will work with the applicant to address the comments and recommendations made by the Design Review Board.

Surrounding Zoning Designations and Existing Use Activity:

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| Northwest (Across Main Street) LC Existing Commercial | North (Across Main Street) LC Existing Commercial | Northeast (Across Main Street) LC Vacant |
| West LC and GC Existing Commercial and Assisted Living | Subject Property LC Vacant | East LC Existing Commercial |
| Southwest GC Existing Assisted Living | South LC-PAD Existing Medical Offices | Southeast LC Existing Commercial |

Compatibility with Surrounding Land Uses:

The subject site is undeveloped and is located approximately 650± feet east of Recker Road on the south side of Main Street. Over the years, the properties to the east with frontage along Main Street have developed with commercial uses, while the properties to the south have developed with assisted living facilities and medical offices. The proposed development provides an additional housing choice within the area and will contribute to the population to support existing and future commercial development in the area.

Neighborhood Participation Plan and Public Comments:

The applicant completed a Citizen Participation Process, which included inviting property owners within 1,000 feet of the site, as well as HOAs within ½ mile, and registered neighborhood within one mile of the site to a virtual neighborhood meeting to allow interested parties the opportunity to ask questions and provide opinions on the proposed project.

In addition, the applicant mailed letters of notification and posted a sign on the subject property in compliance with the Planning and Zoning Board notice of public hearing requirements of Section 11-67-5(1) of the MZO.

As of the writing of this report, staff has not received any comments about this proposal. Staff will provide the Board with any new information during the scheduled Study Session on June 22, 2022.

School Impact Analysis:

The Mesa Public School District reviewed the request for its potential impact on the existing schools in the area. The school district provided the following analysis.

Table 2: School Impact Analysis

| Proposed Development (86 units) | Name of School | Annual Estimated Demand | Adequate Capacity to Serve |
|--|-----------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Elementary | Madison Elementary | 8 | Yes |
| Middle School | Fremont Middle School | 10 | Yes |
| High School | Skyline High School | 17 | Yes |

Staff Recommendation:

Based on the application received and the preceding analysis, staff finds that the subject request for a rezone and Site Plan Review approval is consistent with the Mesa 2040 General Plan, the purpose for a Planned Area Development overlay outlined in Section 11-22-1 of the MZO, the review criteria for approval of a site plan outlined in Section 11-69-5 of the MZO and therefore, recommends approval with the following conditions.

Conditions of Approval:

1. Compliance with the final site plan and landscape plan submitted.
2. Compliance with all requirements of Design Review case DRB21-00967.
3. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
4. Dedicate the right-of-way and easements required under the Mesa City Code at the time of application for a building permit, at the time of recordation of the subdivision plat, or at the time of the City's request for dedication, whichever comes first.
5. Prior to issuance of any building permit, abandon the 25-foot-wide sidewalk easement and 50-foot-wide landscape easement along Main Street.
6. Prior to issuance of any building permit, recordation of a two-foot-wide public utilities and facilities easement along Main Street.
7. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations, except the modifications to the development standards as approved with this PAD overlay and shown in the following table:

| Development Standards | Approved |
|--|---|
| <u>Additional Standards for Private Open Space</u> – <i>MZO Section 11-5-5(A)(3)(e)(i)(1)</i> | Private open space located at the ground level (e.g., yards, decks, patios) shall have no dimension less than five feet |
| Attached Garages, Multi-Story Buildings – <i>MZO Section 11-5-5(B)(4)(f)(ii)</i> | In multi-story buildings that include livable floor area, garage doors located below upper-story living space may be on plane with the upper story façade. |
| Foundation Base along exterior walls adjacent to a drive aisle – <i>MZO Section 11-33-5(A)(2)(b)</i> | At garage fronts only, a minimum two foot wide foundation base shall be provided, measured from face of garage front to face of curb along the entire exterior length of the garage front adjacent to drive aisles. |

Exhibits:

Exhibit 1 – Vicinity Map

Exhibit 2 – Staff Report

Exhibit 3 – Application Information

3.1 Site Plan Project Narrative

3.2 Grading and Drainage Plan

3.3 Landscape Plan

3.3 Elevations

3.4 Project Narrative

3.5 Citizen Participation Plan

Exhibit 4 – Citizen Participation Report