



PLANNING DIVISION
STAFF REPORT

Board of Adjustment

November 1, 2023

CASE No.: BOA23-00487	CASE NAME: Chevron/Denmart
------------------------------	-----------------------------------

Owner’s Name:	DLA-6 Properties LLC
Applicant’s Name:	Michael Donada, Arizona Sign Plus LLC
Location of Request:	2733 North Recker Road.). Located South of McDowell Road on the east side of Recker Road.
Parcel Nos:	141-68-293E
Nature of Request:	Requesting a Special Use Permit (SUP) to allow for the modification of an existing Comprehensive Sign Plan (CSP) for an existing Commercial Development
Zone District:	Limited Commercial with a Planned Area Development overlay (LC-PAD)
Council District:	5
Site size:	1.4± acres
Existing use:	Convenience Store, Automobile Service Station, and Gas Station
Hearing date(s):	November 1, 2023 / 5:30 p.m.
Staff Planner:	Kwasi Abebrese
Staff Recommendation:	APPROVAL with Conditions

HISTORY

On **March 21, 1985**, the subject site was annexed into the City of Mesa as part of a larger 444± acre annexation (Ordinance No. 1915).

On **July 7, 1986**, the Mesa City Council established a comparable City of Mesa zoning designation of Commercial ([C-2] equivalent to Limited Commercial) on the project site (Case No. Z85-027; Ordinance No. 1938).

On **December 1, 1998**, the Board of Adjustment approved a Special Use Permit (SUP) to allow for the development of an Automobile Service Station, Car Wash and Convenience Store on the project site (Case No. BA98-049).

On **December 15, 2000**, the Board of Adjustment approved a Special Use Permit (SUP) for a Comprehensive Sign Plan (CSP) for the existing Automobile Service Station on the project site (Case No. ZA00-011).

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Background:

The applicant is requesting a Special Use Permit (SUP) to modify an existing Comprehensive Sign Plan (CSP) for a commercial development in the Limited Commercial with a Planned Area Development overlay (LC-PAD) district.

General Plan Character Area Designation and Goals:

The Mesa 2040 General Plan Character Area designation on the property is Neighborhood with a Suburban Sub-type. Per Chapter 7 of the General Plan, the primary focus of the Neighborhood character type is to provide safe places for people to live where they can feel secure and enjoy their surrounding community. Neighborhoods can contain a wide range of housing options and often have non-residential uses such as schools, parks, places of worship and local serving businesses. The Suburban Sub-type is primarily residential in nature but may contain commercial uses along arterial frontages and at major street intersections. The existing use as a commercial development located at the intersection of North Recker Road and McDowell Road conforms to the intent of the General Plan character area.

Site Characteristics:

The project site is located south of McDowell Road on the east side of Recker Road. The site is approximately 1.4± acre in size and is zoned Limited Commercial with a Planned Area Development overlay (LC-PAD). The site has over 292 linear feet of street frontage on North Recker Road and 185 linear feet on East McDowell Road.

Surrounding Zoning Designations and Existing Use Activity:

Northwest (Across McDowell Road) GC Existing Commercial	North (Across McDowell Road) AG Vacant	Northeast (Across McDowell Road) AG Vacant
West (Across Recker Road) LC Existing Commercial	Subject Property LC-PAD Existing Commercial Development	East LC-PAD Existing Commercial
Southwest (Across Recker Road) RM-3 Existing Multiple Residences	South RS-6-PAD Existing Single-Residences	Southeast RS-6-PAD Existing Single-Residences

Mesa Zoning Ordinance Requirements and Regulations:

The proposed request encompasses modifications to a CSP for an existing convenience store, carwash, and automotive repair facility. The existing CSP, which was approved in 2000 (Case No.

ZA00-011), allowed for the installation of eight attached signs with a maximum sign area of 88 square feet and two detached signs with areas comprising of 46 square feet each. The proposed CSP includes an increase in the maximum sign area of the attached signs from 88 square feet to 190.4 square feet. In addition, the proposal includes an increase in the areas of the two existing detached signs from 46 square feet to approximately 49.5 square feet and 64.6 square feet respectively.

The project site comprises of a one-story multi-purpose building and a gas canopy that were constructed in 2000. The building is approximately 70 feet wide and 104 feet deep and the existing gas canopy is 40 feet wide and 87 feet deep. The proposed CSP encompasses the installation of ten attached signs comprised of face and halo lit channel letters on the existing building and gas canopy. Specifically, a total number of four signs are proposed on the west side and one sign each is proposed at the north and east sides of the existing building respectively. In addition, a total number of four attached signs are proposed on the existing gas canopy.

Moreover, the CSP entails a change in the sign faces of the existing monument signs as well as reconstruction of the detached sign on the west side of the site. The proposed reconstruction includes the addition of an electronic message panel and relocation of the monument sign further south of the site. The electronic message panel is intended to display a single static message at one time for a minimum of eight (8) seconds.

Table 1 compares the Mesa Zoning Ordinance (MZO) standards, the existing CSP standards, and the proposed CSP modifications per Sections 11-43-3 and 11-43-5 of the MZO.

Table 1: Standard Attached and Detached Signs

Sign Standards	MZO Requirements	Existing CSP	Proposed CSP	Staff Recommendation
Maximum Sign Area	<u>MZO Section 11-43-3(D)(1):</u> Wall Sign - 160 sq. ft.	88 sq. ft.	192 sq. ft.	As proposed
	<u>MZO Section 11-43-3(D)(3):</u> Detached Sign - 80 sq. ft	46 sq. ft.	80 sq. ft.	As proposed
Maximum number of permitted signs per front foot of building (81-199 feet)	<u>MZO Section 11-43-3(D)(1):</u> Wall Signs - 3	4	10	As proposed

Comprehensive Sign Plan MZO Section 11-46-3(D)

Per Section 11-46-3(D) of the MZO, the Board of Adjustment shall find the following criteria are met for approval of a CSP:

1. The development site contains unique or unusual physical conditions, such as topography, proportion, size, or relation to a public street that would limit or restrict normal sign visibility; or

The subject site has limited frontage along East McDowell and North Recker Roads. The increased sign area for both detached and attached signs will allow for greater visibility of the existing commercial development for both vehicular and pedestrian traffic on McDowell and Recker Roads.

The request meets this criterion.

2. The proposed or existing development exhibits unique characteristics of land use, architectural style, site location, physical scale, historical interest, or other distinguishing features that represent a clear variation from conventional development; or

The project site is zoned Limited Commercial with a Planned Area Development overlay (LC-PAD). The approval of the subject CSP would allow for signage that is consistent with the various commercial uses surrounding the property as well as compatible with the adjacent residential districts. The proposed design of the monument and wall signs creates a unique site that will provide greater visibility for the existing commercial development.

The request meets this criterion.

3. The proposed signage incorporates special design features such as lighting, materials, and craftsmanship, murals, or statuaries that reinforce or are integrated with the building architecture.

The proposed modifications include increase in the sign area and update in the sign elevations with new colors that are consistent with the architecture of the existing building and will be well integrated with the rest of the site.

The request meets this criterion.

Special Use Permit MZO Section 11-70-5

Per Section 11-70-5(E) of the MZO, the Board of Adjustment shall also find the following criteria are met for approval of a SUP:

1. Approval of the proposed project will advance the goals and objectives of and is consistent with the policies of the General Plan and any other applicable City plan and/or policies;

The site is located in the Neighborhood character area designation of the Mesa 2040 General Plan. The existing commercial development is consistent with the goals and objectives of the General Plan and approval of the CSP will advance the goals and objectives by allowing a customized sign plan for the existing commercial development to provide greater visibility.

The proposal meets this criterion.

2. The location, size, design, and operating characteristics of the proposed project are consistent with the purposes of the district where it is located and conform with the General Plan and any other applicable City plan or policies;

The existing commercial development is permitted in the LC district per Section 11-6-3 of the MZO. The proposed modifications to the approved CSP for both the site's attached and detached signs are consistent with the size, design, and operating characteristics of the property and surrounding area.

The proposal meets this criterion.

3. The proposed project will not be injurious or detrimental to the adjacent or surrounding properties in the area, nor will the proposed project or improvements be injurious or detrimental to the neighborhood or to the general welfare of the City; and

There will be no injurious or detrimental impact to surrounding properties with the proposed signage and will only encourage harmonic growth for the surrounding area. The proposed signs will not be overbearing in size, and will not flash, blink, animate or emit any noise and the signage itself will not be injurious or detrimental to the surrounding area or to the general welfare of the City of Mesa.

The proposal meets this criterion.

4. Adequate public services, public facilities and public infrastructure are available to serve the proposed project.

The City of Mesa utilities and public infrastructure are available to serve the existing development.

The request meets this criterion

Findings:

- A. The site is zoned LC-PAD.

- B. The existing CSP, which was approved in 2000, allowed for two detached signs comprising 46 square feet each and eight attached signs with a maximum sign area of 88 square feet in area.
- C. The proposed CSP will allow for an increase in the sign area of the detached signs from 46 square feet to 80, which is consistent with current standards, and an increase in sign area for the attached signs from 88 square feet to 192 square feet.
- D. The materials and design of the proposed signs will be well integrated with the theme and architecture of the existing building and the surrounding area.
- E. The existing commercial development is consistent with the Mesa 2040 General Plan.
- F. The proposed signs will not be injurious or detrimental to the surrounding area or to the general welfare of the City of Mesa.
- G. Adequate public services, public facilities and public infrastructure are available to serve the proposed project.

Neighborhood Participation Plan and Public Comments:

The applicant completed a Citizen Participation Process, which included mailing notification letters to all property owners within 500 feet of the subject property. As of the writing of this report, staff has not been contacted by any resident or property owner to express support or opposition to the request.

Staff Recommendation:

Based upon the application received and preceding analysis, Staff find that the requested Special Use Permit to modify an existing Comprehensive Sign Plan complies with the review criteria for a Comprehensive Sign Plan outlined in Section 11-46-3 of the MZO and the required findings for a Special Use Permit outlined in Section 11-70-5 of the MZO; and therefore, recommends approval of the request with the following conditions.

Conditions of Approval:

- 1. Compliance with the sign plan documents submitted.
- 2. Compliance with all requirements of the Development Services Department regarding the issuance of building permits.
- 3. All signs shall remain outside of the public domain including rights-of-way, PUEs and PUFES.

Exhibits:

- Exhibit 1 – Vicinity Map
- Exhibit 2 – Staff Report
- Exhibit 3 – Narrative and Justification Statement
- Exhibit 4 – Site Plan
- Exhibit 5 – Elevations