

Maura Jackson

From: Jeff McVay <jmccvay3@cox.net>
Sent: Wednesday, September 20, 2023 1:57 AM
To: Maura Jackson; Mary Kopaskie-Brown
Cc: Kellie Rorex
Subject: RE: Certificate of Appropriateness final review for 111 W. 7th Pl -Evergreen Historic District (ADM23-00135)
Attachments: image001.png

Hello Maura,

Thank you for providing a thoughtful decision on my request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for our proposed detached guest house and RV/carport. Please accept this email as my formal request to appeal the Historic Preservation Office's (HPO) denial of the proposal to the Historic Preservation Board (HPB). The basis for my appeal, which respond to only those standards in which staff has determined the request is inconsistent, are outlined below.

Standard:

The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alterations of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

Staff Comment:

The proposed RV garage has a height that exceeds the development patterns within the District. Additionally, the placement on the parcel disrupts the rhythm and character found within the District. It would be better placed elsewhere on the lot or further back if possible.

Applicant Response:

As stated in the review comments this standard related to the character of the property. With the exception of height in relation to our house, primary staff concerns are related to relationship to the District. In relation to the property, an earlier renovation and addition to this property received a Certificate of Appropriateness from the City that allowed a significant addition and renovations, which have since made the property non-contributing to the Evergreen Historic District. Understanding that the previous approval happened under different HPO staffing and interpretation of standards, the previously approved renovations and additions have significantly changed character of the property. While we regret the loss of the historic character, we purchased the property after the approved addition and renovations and we believe the current request is consistent with the character of the property we purchased and as previously approved by the City.

Regardless of the recent addition and renovations and relate to height, the original structure has a typical roofline of 12 feet. The proposed RV carport has a maximum height of 15.5 feet, which is not out of line with the height of the original structure, particularly when considering the RV carport would be located 16.5 feet behind the front line of the original house and 51.5 feet from the street. Existing improvements such as a swimming pool preclude the ability to located the RV carport off Macdonald, and if such relocation were possible our corner lot precludes the ability to build any structure that isn't adjacent to a neighbors house.

Related to locating the RV carport further back on the property, the larger plan includes a small, 698 SF one-bedroom guest house for my aging parents to live. As livable space, zoning requires that the building be located within the lots buildable area. The existing house and improvements don't allow alternative configurations that includes an RV carport, which as proposed is fully compliant with Zoning Code Requirements. The guest house has been placed as far south on the property while still being within the buildable area, which precludes relocating the RV further south.

Related the driveway comment, properties with two driveways is a regular condition within the Evergreen Historic District, with more than one existing example along the same block as our property. Understanding that there are Zoning Code standards related to the total width of driveways for a single property, we commit to complying with such standards as part of the proposed project.

Standard:

New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differential from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, feature, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

Guidelines Recommend: Constructing a new addition on a secondary or non-character defining elevation and limiting its size and scale in relationship to the historic building.

Ensuring that the addition is subordinate and secondary to the historic building and is compatible in massing, scale, materials, relationship to solid voids, and color.

Staff Comment:

The project as proposed with the RV carport would disrupt the scale and proportion found within the District. This part of the project would not be subordinate to the historic resources and is not limited in size and scale to the historic building.

Applicant Response:

The proposed guest house and RV/carport is not an addition to a non-character defining elevation, it is a detached structure. As such, we don't believe this guideline applies. Having said that, as the RV carport is the primary concern with the proposal, it is important to note that the RV carport only consists of 360 SF of roof area in comparison to the 3,240 SF of existing roof area. The remainder of the guest house proposal, which has a total roof area of 1,612 SF, and has not been noted as a concern has a maximum height of 11'10". We believe that for this reason, the proposal is subordinate to our non-contributing property. In addition, the overall design of the guest house and RV/carport is differential from the old, but use materials that are compatible with the no longer contributing historic features of the original house.

While the stated Guidelines are specifically related to additions, in response to staff comments scale and proportion related to the District, there exist many examples of taller structures, including many two-story houses and additions that have been lawfully permitted within the Evergreen Historic District, several of which that are original to the District. It is such variety of architecture that played a large part in our decision to purchase our home in the Evergreen Historic District. As such, we do not believe our proposal would disrupt the scale and proportion of the Evergreen Historic District.

Standard:

Design the new addition to complement and enhance the historic building in size, scale, materials, and details.

Don't: construct an addition which is larger in size or inappropriate in scale to the original building.

Staff Comment:

The RV carport has a scale that is incompatible with the District, especially for where it is placed on the parcel.

Applicant Response:

As noted in our earlier responses, we believe that we have addressed staff's concerns related to this standard.

Please let me know the next two HPB hearing dates. Depending on timing of hearings and my ability to prepare for the HPB hearing, I would like to request the ability to choose the later of the next two HPB meetings. In addition, please let

me know if I need to submit any materials I would like to present to the HPB in advance of the hearing and the deadline for providing those materials in advance of the next two HPB meetings.

Thank you,

Jeff McVay

Sent from [Mail](#) for Windows

From: [Maura Jackson](#)

Sent: Tuesday, September 5, 2023 4:41 PM

To: [Cox](#)

Cc: [Mary Kopaskie-Brown](#); [Michelle Dahlke](#)

Subject: Certificate of Appropriateness final review for 111 W. 7th Pl -Evergreen Historic District (ADM23-00135)

