


Historic Preservation Board Staff Report

March 4, 2025

Case No.	ADM25-00035	
Project Name	228 N Macdonald - Unit E Demolition Project	
Request	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition of Unit E, a detached, one-story, 600 square foot building (the “Subject Building”), centrally located on the property, behind the main two-story historic main house, and located within the West Second Street Historic District (the “Proposed Project”)	
Project Location	Located at 228 N Macdonald (the “Subject Property”), approximately 1,000 feet southwest of the corner of North Center Street and East University Drive; Approximately 700 feet south along North Macdonald from the intersection with West University Drive	
Parcel No(s)	138-58-031	
Project Area	0.5 ± acres (22,204 square feet)	
Council District	District 4	
Historic Designation	West Second Street Historic District	
Existing Zoning	Downtown Residential 3, Historic District Overlay	
General Plan Designation	Downtown with a conserve growth strategy	
Applicant	Mallory Harden, Betty 58 Inc.	
Owner	Mallory Harden, Betty 58 Inc.	
Staff Planner	Matthew Kriegl, Historic Preservation Officer	

Recommendation

Staff finds that the Proposed Project meets the Certificate of Appropriateness criteria for demolition on property with an approved historic district overlay district in the Mesa Zoning Ordinance Section 11-74-4(B).

Staff recommends approval with conditions.

Approval Criteria

Section 11-74-4(B):

- a) Per Section 11-74-4(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, the Historic Preservation Board shall only grant a request for demolition if the building or structure is of minimal historic significance because of its location, conditions, modifications, or other factors; and,
- b) Demolition of the building or structure would be inconsequential to the preservation of historic properties in the vicinity.

Project Overview

Request:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to demolish a detached, one-story, 600 square foot building (Unit E), located on a property that has been classified as contributing to the West Second Street Historic District. The building proposed to be demolished (Unit E) is located behind the main two-story historic structure and is mostly obscured from the public right-of-way (ROW). The applicant is proposing to demolish the building and replace it with a new structure to be located between the two remaining buildings. The applicant is in preliminary discussions with staff to determine the design of any new structure(s). All other buildings will remain and are subject to future COA applications, as applicable.

Analysis:

Based on the application and review of the Historic District survey, the Subject Property is contributing to the Historic District. However, there are two additional secondary structures located on this property, both of which are located behind the main two-story historic Craftsman house.

These two structures (one including Unit E and the other including Units F, G, H, J) were constructed outside the property's period of significance and do not contribute to the historic character of the property. Furthermore, the Subject Building was identified as a noncontributing feature as part of the National Register designation. As a result, staff believes the Subject Building to be a noncontributing feature of the property on the local level designation as well.

The Subject Building was constructed c. 1975. This 600 square foot one-story structure is in poor condition and is proposed to be demolished so that a new structure may be constructed in its place. Any new construction will require a COA prior to any issuance of permits or commencement of construction.

The Subject Building is of minimal historic significance due to its age, condition, and location, and demolition of the Subject Building would be inconsequential to the preservation of historic properties in the vicinity. Due to these reasons, staff recommends that the COA for demolition be granted.

Site Context

Zoning:

- The project site is zoned Downtown Residential 3 (DR-3).
- Historic District (HD) overlay – West Second Street Historic District

Surrounding Zoning & Use Activity:

The Proposed Project is compatible with surrounding land uses, which include single family residential, apartments, offices, and vacant land. The Historic District overlay encompasses all of the neighboring properties and surrounding blocks.

Timeline:

- **July 07, 1999:** West Second Street Historic District entered into the National Register of Historic Places.
- **September 24, 2001:** City Council established a Historic Preservation Overlay District to Expand the Existing West Second Street Historic District (Ordinance No. 3933).
- **June 20, 2003:** The National Register boundaries of the West Second Street Historic District are revised and expanded. The district resources are reevaluated and reclassified.

Site History:

- Encompassing portions of five blocks from the original townsite, the district showcases the early transformation of Mesa from a rural community to suburban estates. Unlike the formal replatting of entire blocks into residential subdivisions, the original "City of Zion" garden blocks were divided into individual lots through gradual lot splits. This process allowed for a more organic, incremental development of the area.
- A defining feature of the district is its wide public rights-of-way, which were improved and narrowed through the introduction of tree-lined, grassy medians. These landscaped medians are significant character-defining elements that contribute to the district's unique charm.
- The oldest home in the district, the Hakes/Isley/McDavid House, dates from around 1884-1890, and subsequent homes were added over time, resulting in a rich mix of architectural styles and construction dates. This slow, informal development process gives the West Second Street Historic District its eclectic and diverse architectural character.
- The West Second Street Historic District (District), in which the Subject Property resides, has a period of significance spanning from 1883 to 1959.
- Constructed in 1914 as the residence for prominent Mesa rancher Fred C. Weeks. Occupied by the Weeks family through 1950. Weeks was born in October 1865 in Ontario, Canada, and

came to Mesa in 1888. In addition to a cattleman and rancher, Weeks, served as clerk of the Mesa Board of Education in the 'teens, and was a member of the Mesa City Council between 1921 and 1922. He was also a former director of the First National Bank of Mesa and a member of the Board of Governors of the Salt River Valley Water Users Association (now the Salt River Project).

- This two-story house is an uncommon example of a large-scale Craftsman Bungalow style. It represents the early 20th Century development of N. Macdonald as an upper-class neighborhood.
- The house is constructed of brick covered with pebble dash stucco. Notable features include exposed rafters with knee braces. Many of the original windows and doors have been retained. Although the house remains in good solid condition, there have been multiple alterations. The most visible of these alterations include the enclosure of the second-floor balcony with T1-11 siding and jalousie windows along with a metal exterior staircase and replaced front columns.
- Sometime after 1950, the main building was divided into three rental units (Units A, B, C). This is likely when the alterations to the balcony occurred.
- In the mid-1970s, Unit E, a one-story rental unit (the Subject Building) was constructed. Even later, an additional two-story four-unit rental building was constructed (comprising of Units F, G, H, J).

Conditions of Approval

Staff recommends **approval** of the Proposed Project, subject to the following conditions:

1. Compliance with the final site plan as submitted.
2. Compliance with all applicable City development codes and regulations.

Exhibits

Exhibit 1 – Vicinity Map

Exhibit 2 – Project Narrative

Exhibit 3 – Site Plan(s)

Exhibit 4 – Photographs

Exhibit 5 – Power Point Presentation