



# Street Maintenance Program Follow-up Review

Department of Transportation



## OBJECTIVES

---

The objective of this follow-up review was to determine whether the Department of Transportation effectively implemented the action plans based on the recommendations from the March 2023 Street Maintenance Program audit report.

## BACKGROUND

---

On March 13, 2023, we issued a report on our audit of the Department of Transportation's street maintenance program. The objective of the audit was to determine whether effective controls are in place to ensure proper street maintenance of City streets in accordance with applicable policies, statutes, and other requirements. The audit report included five recommendations that would strengthen controls to help ensure compliance with third-party contracts, improve the process for pavement management forecasting, ensure the accuracy and completeness of its pavement condition data, and ensure equitable distribution of resources. The department agreed with the recommendations and developed action plans to implement the recommended changes.

## CONCLUSION

---

Of the five recommendations, two have been fully implemented and three are currently in progress. We will conduct a second follow-up review in approximately one year. The status of the recommendations is summarized below:

Recommendations	Status
<p><b>1-1:</b> To help ensure compliance with the terms and conditions of third-party contracts, the department should develop and implement written policies and procedures to address the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ The process for monitoring third-party contractors to ensure it collects the required documentation, such as independent material test results, temperature gauge calibration certificates, and citizen notifications.</li><li>○ Retaining documentation of its inspections to demonstrate that the quality of work performed by third-party contractors and repeated incidents of unsatisfactory performance are monitored.</li></ul>	

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Periodically reviewing the terms and conditions to ensure the requirements are still valid and applicable.</li> </ul> <p><b>1-2:</b> The department should enforce or modify the terms and conditions of its third-party contracts.</p>	
<p><b>2-1:</b> The department should develop and implement written policies and procedures to address how City streets are prioritized for pavement treatments, such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ The forecasting process for identifying and selecting City streets that require treatment, including documenting the criteria used in the selection process.</li> <li>○ Retaining documentation of its selection process, including adjustments made to the forecast schedule.</li> <li>○ Review and approval of the City streets selected for pavement treatment, including any adjustments made to the forecast schedule.</li> <li>○ Periodically reviewing the forecasting process to ensure the criteria being used is still relevant and appropriate.</li> </ul>	<span style="color: green;">✓</span>
<p><b>3-1:</b> To help ensure accuracy and completeness of pavement condition data, the department should develop and implement:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ The process for performing pavement condition surveys, including the frequency and criteria for when streets should be surveyed, to ensure surveys are performed properly and on a consistent basis.</li> <li>○ Retaining documentation to support the pavement condition data entered into the pavement management software.</li> <li>○ Periodically reviewing the pavement condition data entered into the pavement management software to ensure it accurately reflects the distresses identified during the pavement condition surveys, including retaining documentation of this review process.</li> </ul> <p><b>3-2:</b> To help prevent or detect inappropriate or unintended changes to pavement condition data in the pavement management software, the department should ensure user activity is logged and determine whether its software can be configured to generate logs that can be periodically monitored.</p>	<span style="color: orange;">In Progress</span>
<p><b>4-1:</b> The department should perform monitoring and review procedures to ensure that the pavement condition data provided by its third-party contractor is accurate and reliable, including:</p>	<span style="color: orange;">In Progress</span>

<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Retaining documentation of its procedures performed to demonstrate the pavement condition data was reviewed.</li><li>○ Verifying the pavement condition data was properly uploaded into the department's pavement management software to identify any errors or duplicate entries.</li><li>○ Requesting documentation of its quality control process and procedures performed.</li></ul>	
<p><b>5-1:</b> To ensure resources are distributed equitably throughout the City, the department should review its annual forecasting process, including the criteria used to prioritize which streets receive pavement treatment. In addition, the department should also review its budgeting process to ensure funding is allocated equitably for projects throughout the City.</p>	<i>In Progress</i>



*The City Auditor's office provides audit, consulting, and investigative services to identify and minimize risk, maximize efficiencies, improve internal controls, and strengthen accountability to Mesa's citizens. We serve as an independent resource to City Management and the City Council, to provide them with timely, accurate, and objective information, assurances, and recommendations pertaining to City of Mesa programs and activities.*

### **Audit Team**

Michelle Hute, Senior Internal Auditor

### **City Auditor**

Joseph Lisitano, CPA, CIA

### **Mesa City Auditor's Office**

Phone: 480-644-5059

Email: [auditor.info@mesaaz.gov](mailto:auditor.info@mesaaz.gov)

Website: <https://www.mesaaz.gov/government/city-auditor>

Copies of our audit reports are available at:

<https://www.mesaaz.gov/government/city-auditor/audits>