



# AUDIT OF BADGING/SECURITY ACCESS

Mesa Police Department



## OBJECTIVES

---

This audit was conducted to determine whether effective controls are in place to ensure that building/suite access is managed appropriately to prevent unauthorized access to City facilities.

## BACKGROUND

---

Badging and security access for the City is granted through the Mesa Police Department Badging Office. The Badging Office provides identification badges and security access for both City employees and non-employees including contractors, custodial staff, and volunteers. There are currently over 11,000 issued and active badges/access cards.

The City utilizes the C-Cure software system to manage identification card and security access amongst its facilities. Currently, City facilities utilize the C-Cure system for badge access at exterior and interior points. Although some City facilities are open to the public, such as Mesa City Plaza and the Municipal Court Building, the badge access points are located in areas in which the public does not have access and individuals must use their badge to access these areas.

When individuals leave the City, the process is to return badges to a supervisor or a departmental badge liaison on their last day of work. The supervisor or liaison is then required to return the badges to the Badging Office for proper deactivation and handling.

## SUMMARY OF OBSERVATIONS

---

1. Documented supervisor approval is not always obtained before identification badges are issued and access is granted to City facilities.
2. Badges are not always returned to the Badging Office after termination.

## CONCLUSION

---

In our opinion, the Police Department Badging Office has effective controls in place to ensure that building/suite access is managed appropriately to prevent unauthorized access to City facilities. However, improved controls are needed regarding documenting supervisor approval for badges/access and obtaining badges after termination. For additional details, please see the attached Issue and Action Plan.

# ISSUE AND ACTION PLAN #1

## Identification badge and access approvals are not always documented

---

### What We Found

Approvals for identification badges and access to City facilities should be documented. However, department management and/or the Badging Office do not always verify that the forms are properly completed before requesting/issuing badges and granting access to City facilities. Specifically, audit testing determined the following:

For City Employees:

- 5 out of 20 identification badge forms tested did not have documented supervisor approval.

For Non-Employees (Contractors, Volunteers, Custodial Staff):

- 6 out of 25 identification badge forms tested did not have documented supervisor approval.
- 5 out of 12 access card forms tested did not have documented supervisor approval.

### What It Should Be

The City has two forms that are required to be completed before identification badges are issued and/or access is granted to City facilities. Both forms require supervisor approval to be documented before badges and/or access is granted.

### Why Does It Matter

Without the proper approvals, unauthorized access may be granted to City facilities.

### What We Recommend and Management's Action Plans

**Recommendation #1-1:** Management should ensure forms are properly completed before issuing identification badges or granting access to City facilities by implementing one or more of the following:

- Updating the forms to make it clear that supervisor approval must be obtained before badges will be issued/access granted.
- If other verification methods are used in place of obtaining supervisor approval, the verification should be documented in the individual's file.
- Creating internal Badging Office policies and procedures that document the other verification methods that can be used in lieu of supervisor approval.

**Action Plan #1-1:** The badging office will review and update all forms to ensure proper information is gathered. Along with updating the forms the following will also be implemented:

- Notification will be sent out to all approving building liaisons to clarify that access will not

be granted until both the proper forms are received as well as the proper approvals. It will be the liaisons responsibility to gather approvals from requested access to areas not covered under their jurisdiction.

- Directives will be written and sent out to all building liaisons explaining the requirement for documented approvals on the initial badging paperwork. Any additions or changes will be submitted by a written request through email containing the proper chain of approval. A formal reply from the badging office will be sent detailing the action taken and will be placed into the employees file to document the chain of approval and completion.
- Internal procedures will continue to be evaluated and developed to ensure thorough documentation is maintained.

**Individual or Position Responsible:** Badging Office Supervisor Thomas Hill

**Estimated Completion Date:** April 30, 2023

## ISSUE AND ACTION PLAN #2

### Badges are not always returned after termination

---

#### What We Found

Per Management Policy 116, badges for both City employees and non-employees, should be returned after termination. However, department management does not always obtain badges from employees after termination and/or does not always return the relinquished badges back to the Badging Office. Specifically, audit testing determined the following:

For City Employees:

- 23 out of 30 badges tested were not returned to the Badging Office.

For Non-Employees (Contractors, Temporary Employees, Volunteers):

- 59 out of 90 badges tested were not returned to the Badging Office.

#### What It Should Be

Management Policy 116 - Identification/Access Cards, Section IV.A.8. states,

"Upon termination of employment with the City, City employees shall surrender their identification card to their supervisor. The supervisor shall notify Police Department/Facility Access immediately and forward the identification/electronic access card to the Police Department/Facility Access as soon as practicable."

Management Policy 116 - Identification/Access Cards, Section IV.A.9. states,

"Contractors and non-employees shall return and surrender any identification cards issued by the City upon their termination or severance from the contracted vendor's employment or the termination of the City's contract with the vendor."

#### Why Does It Matter

If badges are not returned, individuals may have access to City facilities after termination.

#### What We Recommend and Management's Action Plans

**Recommendation #2-1:** Management should establish a process to ensure all badges are returned after termination or evaluate the risk of badges not being returned and update the Management Policy as appropriate.

**Action Plan #2-1:** The badging office is currently in the process of updating the current Police Department policy regarding access control that includes the issuance of identification and access cards. City Management policy will be evaluated, and changes submitted to coincide with each other

to maintain consistency citywide. Pending changes include:

- Review of the responsibilities in collection of employee Identification and access cards upon termination.

**Individual or Position Responsible:** Badging Office Supervisor Thomas Hill

**Estimated Completion Date:** June 30, 2023

## SCOPE

---

The scope of the audit was current and terminated badge holders during fiscal year 2021 (FY21).

## METHODOLOGY

---

To accomplish our objective, we performed the following:

- Interviewed Badging Office staff.
- Reviewed management policies.
- Analyzed C-Cure system data and reports.
- Performed detailed testing of current and terminated badge holders.

## AUDIT STANDARDS

---

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.



*The City Auditor's office provides audit, consulting, and investigative services to identify and minimize risk, maximize efficiencies, improve internal controls, and strengthen accountability to Mesa's citizens. We serve as an independent resource to City Management and the City Council, to provide them with timely, accurate, and objective information, assurances, and recommendations pertaining to City of Mesa programs and activities.*

#### **Audit Team**

Karen Newman, CPA, CIA, CFE Senior Internal Auditor

#### **City Auditor**

Joseph Lisitano, CPA, CIA

#### **Mesa City Auditor's Office**

Phone: 480-644-5059

Email: [auditor.info@mesaaz.gov](mailto:auditor.info@mesaaz.gov)

Website: <https://www.mesaaz.gov/government/city-auditor>

Copies of our audit reports are available at:

<https://www.mesaaz.gov/government/city-auditor/audits>