

- \*4-e ZON18-00375 District 4.** The 0 block of South Mesa Drive (east side), the 400 block of East Main Street (south side), the 0 block of South Udall (both sides) and the 0 block of South LeSueur (west side). Located at the southeast corner of Main Street and Mesa Drive. (6± acres). Rezone 4± acres from T5MS and T4NF to T5MSF; and 2± acres from T4NF-HD and T4N-HD to T5MSF-HD. This request will allow for a mixed-use development. City Creek Reserve, Inc, applicant; Land Equity Investors LLC and Presiding Bishop of the Church of LDS, owner. **(Companion case to preliminary plat “Mesa Temple Redevelopment”, associated with item \*5-c)**

**Planner: Tom Ellsworth**

**Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions**

**Summary:** Principal Planner Tom Ellsworth presented case ZON18-00375 to the Board. Mr. Ellsworth explained what constitutes a Form Base Code and how it works within the City code Mr. Ellsworth stated the request is to rezone the site within our Form Base Code. He stated after opting into the Form Base Code, an applicant begins to select building types and building form. This process is very descriptive of the type of the architecture and structure they will have, and providing flexibility at the first floor to allow a mixture of both residential and non-residential uses. Mr. Ellsworth stated a small portion of this site sits within the Temple Historic District.

Mr. Ellsworth explained the site plan will be reviewed through the zoning clearance process as an Administrative Review. He stated the site plan is reviewed against the forms and transects found in our Form Base Code chapters of the zoning ordinance. During this process, staff reviews setbacks, building heights and the architecture of the building. Staff also reviews for quality and context of the site.

Boardmember Allen inquired what the feedback was from the Historic Preservation Board. Mr. Ellsworth responded the applicant went before the Historic Preservation Board at their June meeting to discuss this case as it relates to the historic district, and the seven homes that will be effected by the development. The applicant has agreed with the Historic Preservation Board to limit the buildings on the south side of the site to 3-story height as shown on the transect plan.

Carl Duke, City Creek Reserve, introduced David Davis of Dale Gardon Architecture in Scottsdale. As the design consultant, Mr. Davis presented the design character and the process they have gone through to get to this point. He stated this is a two fold process; the first is the actual Temple and the second is the surrounding neighborhood.

Mr. Davis explained the seven homes effected are all rentals and it is important to note the entire site is not within the historic district. He stated the portion on the southern boundary is the area in which the Historic Preservation Board recommended buildings not be higher than 3-story. Mr. Davis stated there will be a below grade parking garage for residents, members of the Temple and the public.

## MINUTES OF THE JUNE 20, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

Boardmember Boyle inquired how the schools would be impacted by this development. Tom Ellsworth responded staff received an impact analysis from the school district which stated they can take on the additional student population. The analysis broke down the impact; estimating 20-30 elementary students, 10-15 junior high students, and 12-14 high school students.

Planning Director, John Wesley, reminded the Board the focus of this application is the rezoning of the area. He stated the question they are considering is the appropriate zoning transects and has the applicants limiting themselves to 3-stories on the southern portion of the site.

Resident Jenn Duff, 146 W. 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, spoke. Ms. Duff stated her concern is the demolition of the historic homes and how this could impact the future of other historic districts.

Resident Janice Gennevois, 150 N. Wilbur spoke. Ms. Gennevois stated she feels the Historic Preservation Office lacks foresight and knowledge of how to protect the entities of the historic buildings in the City. She stated the HPB found no reason to rezone this area as the current zoning already allows 3-story buildings. Ms. Gennevois stated the HPB wants to remain involved and the removal of the 7 contributing properties will effect the integrity of the historic district.

Resident Patrick Tucker, 136 N. Hibbert, spoke. Mr. Tucker reiterated the removal of the 7 properties will change the integrity of the Temple District.

Boardmember Sarkissian inquired what is restricting the applicant from going higher than the 3 story building. Mr. Ellsworth responded what is restricting them is one of the stipulations is the specific transect zone shown that shows an area where they are limiting their height to 3 stories and they are agreeing to this height in that transect zone.

Boardmember Allen inquired of the developer is they have considered relocating some of the properties. Carl Duke responded they have advertised to the public they are giving away each of the homes to anyone willing to relocate the homes and giving \$10,000.00 toward the cost of the relocation. It is extremely expensive and cost prohibitive for them to do so. Mr. Duke stated it is expensive to relocate these homes and the materials used to build them makes it difficult to relocate.

Boardmember Boyle stated they discussed having the project go before the Design Review Board. He inquired about the Form Base Code and how a project is reviewed and suggested all Form Base Code projects would go before the Design Review Board. John Wesley explained the code has specific requirements with regard to building forms and different types such as Main Street and Court yard buildings. He stated that with each of these forms there are very specific requirements with them such as placement of doors and street frontage and types. The actual architecture and what it looks like is not in the code and is open to the individual design and is very

## MINUTES OF THE JUNE 20, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

closely reviewed by staff. Mr. Wesley explained one of the attractions of the Form Base Code is that it reduces some of the steps in the process to help encourage use of this code because of the controls that are in the Form Base Code.

Jeff McVay with the City Manager's Office, explained further the process staff went through in order to develop the Form Base Code. Mr. McVay stated it was established in parallel with the Central Main Plan to develop the goals with development of the downtown area and the Form Base Code is extremely prescriptive. It allows staff to use their judgment to go through the architecture and push design.

Boardmember Boyle feels the design presented does not reflect the feel the City is striving for and would like the Design Review Board to review this. Boardmember Allen stated she agrees with Mr. Boyle and this is an entry and exit area of our downtown area and leans toward referring the architecture to the Design Review Board. Ms. Allen stated she has concern about the loss of the homes in a historic district and appreciates the developer listening to the Historic Preservation Board.

Boardmember Sarkissian stated she feels ok with the project and stated she was originally concerned about that the historic homes were going to be demolished and is glad to know the majority of the project is not in the historic district. She stated she has mixed feelings about the elevations..

Vice Chair Michelle Dahlke stated she likes a lot of the aspects of the project and does have concerns about the historic portion of the project. Ms. Dahlke stated her understanding this is not within this Board's responsibility. She stated she is not in favor of the project being reviewed by the Design Review Board and feels the Form Base Code and staff would handle any design issues. Ms. Dahlke asked the applicant if he would be comfortable with taking it to the Design Review Board. Mr. Duke responded they would like an opportunity to present the architecture to the Board.

It was moved by Boardmember Allen and seconded by Boardmember Boyle to approve case ZON18-00375 and companion preliminary plat "Mesa Temple Redevelopment" with conditions as proposed by staff with the added condition that this project be reviewed through the Design Review process:

**That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON18-00375 conditioned upon:**

1. Compliance with the Transect Plan and preliminary plat submitted.
2. Completion of a Zoning Clearance process per Ch. 11-56-4.E.
3. Approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness prior to the issuance of a building permit for those portions of the site that are within the Temple Historic District.

## MINUTES OF THE JUNE 20, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

4. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
5. Review of the architecture and landscape design through the Design Review process.

**Vote: 4-0 (Chair Clement and Boardmember Astle, absent)**

\* \* \* \* \*

**Note:** *Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also “live broadcasted” through the City of Mesa’s website at [www.mesaaz.gov](http://www.mesaaz.gov)*