


Historic Preservation Board Staff Report

March 4, 2025

Case No.	ADM25-00131	
Project Name	523 W Clark St - Workshop Demolition Project	
Request	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of a detached, 426 square foot, one-story workshop (the “Subject Building”) located behind the main house at the rear southwest corner of the property and within the West Side-Clark Addition Historic District (the “Proposed Project”)	
Project Location	Located at 523 W Clark St (the “Subject Property”), approximately 1,350 feet south of West University Drive; Approximately 1000 feet west of North Country Club Drive along West Clark Street	
Parcel No(s)	135-60-108	
Project Area	0.22 ± acres (9,713 square feet)	
Council District	District 4	
Historic Designation	West Side-Clark Addition Historic District	
Existing Zoning	Multiple Residence 2, Historic District Overlay	
General Plan Designation	Urban Residential with a conserve growth strategy	
Applicant	Lori Savar, Tuff Shed	
Owner	Stefani Asato	
Staff Planner	Matthew Kriegl, Historic Preservation Officer	

Recommendation

Staff finds that the Proposed Project meets the Certificate of Appropriateness criteria for demolition on property with an approved historic district overlay district in the Mesa Zoning Ordinance Section 11-74-4(B).

Staff recommends approval with conditions.

Approval Criteria

Section 11-74-4(B):

- a) Per Section 11-74-4(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, the Historic Preservation Board shall only grant a request for demolition if the building or structure is of minimal historic significance because of its location, conditions, modifications, or other factors; and,
- b) Demolition of the building or structure would be inconsequential to the preservation of historic properties in the vicinity.

Project Overview

Request:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to demolish a detached, one-story, 462 square foot workshop within the West Side-Clark Addition Historic District. The Subject Property has been classified as contributing to the historic district. The workshop is located behind the contributing main one-story historic structure at the rear southwest corner of the lot and is mostly obscured from the public right-of-way (ROW). After the existing workshop is demolished, a new 400 square foot, one-story, workshop structure will be constructed in its place. The plans for the replacement workshop structure have been reviewed and a COA has been issued for the new structure. All other buildings will remain and are subject to future COA applications, as applicable

Analysis:

Based on the application and review of the Historic District survey, the Subject Property is contributing to the Historic District. However, there is an additional structure, a 462 square foot workshop, located at the rear southwest corner of this lot, behind the main one-story historic Ranch house.

The Subject Building was constructed at an unknown date. However, based on its design, it may have been constructed generally between the end of district's period of significance and the 1990s.

Due to its location, visibility of the Subject Building from the ROW is minimal. Additionally, the Subject Building has lost historic integrity through multiple non-sympathetic repairs, and storm damage. Furthermore, the Subject Building does not contribute to the historic character of the property and was identified as a noncontributing feature as part of the National Register designation. As a result, staff believes the Subject Building to be a noncontributing feature of the property on the local level designation as well.

The Subject Building is of minimal historic significance due to its poor condition, lack of historic integrity, and location. Demolition of the Subject Building would be inconsequential to the

preservation of historic properties in the vicinity. Due to these reasons, staff recommends that the COA for demolition be granted.

Site Context

Zoning:

- The project site is zoned Multiple Residence 2 (RM-2).
- Historic District (HD) overlay – West Side-Clark Addition Historic District

Surrounding Zoning & Use Activity:

The Proposed Project is compatible with surrounding land uses, which include single family residential, apartments, offices, and vacant land. The Historic District overlay encompasses all of the neighboring properties and surrounding blocks.

Timeline:

- **August 05, 2010:** The West Side-Clark Addition Historic District entered into the National Register of Historic Places.
- **August 28, 2017:** City Council established a Historic District (HD) Overlay creating the local West Side-Clark Addition Historic District (Ordinance No. 5404).

Site History:

- The West Side-Clark Addition Historic District is an early example of the process of suburbanization that changed Mesa from an early 20th century agricultural settlement to one of Arizona's larger, sprawling twenty-first century cities. The establishment of the earliest components of the district is especially notable as being part of the initial growth on the west side of Mesa at the time when the original townsite was built-out for the first time. The district has a period of significance from 1930 to 1958.
- This district represents the first residential area to be developed outside the western boundary of Mesa's original townsite and reflects the suburban planning approaches and architectural styles common in the Salt River Valley from the 1930s through the late 1950s for middle-income, single-family housing.
- Approximately quarters of the houses are Ranch Style with only a few Period Revival and other styles scattered within the older two subdivisions in the north half of the district.
- The district is comprised of four subdivisions (West Side Addition (platted 1930), Monte Vista Addition Amendment (platted 1935), Clark Addition Amendment (platted 1946), Clark Addition No. 2 (platted 1947) and the character of the historic district today is very similar to its appearance at the close of the period of significance in 1958.
- The zoning designation for the Subject Property is Residential Multiple Dwelling ("RM-2") with an Historic District ("HD") overlay.
- This main house was constructed in 1940 and is classified as contributing to the West Side-Clark Addition Historic District, and a modest example of the Ranch style of architecture.

- The existing workshop was constructed at an unknown date. However, based on its design, it may have been constructed generally between the end of district's period of significance and the 1990s.
- Character-defining elements of the main house include large picture windows and an attached carport representing a vehicular-based society of post-WWII. Virtually intact, it provides a positive contribution to the historic character of the neighborhood.

Conditions of Approval

Staff recommends **approval** of the Proposed Project, subject to the following conditions:

1. Compliance with the final site plan as submitted.
2. Compliance with all applicable City development codes and regulations.

Exhibits

Exhibit 1 – Vicinity Map

Exhibit 2 – Project Narrative

Exhibit 3 – Site Plan(s)

Exhibit 4 – Photographs

Exhibit 5 – Power Point Presentation