



Planning and Zoning Board

Meeting Minutes

Held in the City of Mesa Council Chambers – Upper Level

Date: June 12, 2019 Time: 4:00 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Chair Michelle Dahlke
Vice Chair Dane Astle
Jessica Sarkissian
Tim Boyle
Shelly Allen
Deanna Villanueva-Saucedo
Jeffrey Crockett

MEMBERS ABSENT:

None

STAFF PRESENT:

Nana Appiah
Tom Ellsworth
Lesley Davis
Lisa Davis
Wahid Alam
Evan Balmer
Ryan McCann
Charlotte McDermott
Rebecca Gorton

OTHERS PRESENT:

Chris Van Male
Brent Vail
Shannon Vail
Amber Prast
Jessica Sanchez
Michael Sanchez
Tammy Kleck
Kevin Vandelak
Robert Mason
Heather Chadwick
Lisa Stewart
Ernest Amponsatt
Andrea Forman
Sarah Cherry
Julie Ellis
Casandra Ayres
Citizen who did not sign in

Call Meeting to Order.

Chair Dahlke declared a quorum present and the meeting was called to order at 4:00 pm.

1. Take action on all consent agenda items.

Items on the Consent Agenda

2. **Approval of minutes:** Consider the minutes from the May 22, 2019 study session and regular hearing.

MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2019 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *2-a** Boardmember Villanueva-Saucedo motioned to approve the Consent Agenda. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Allen.

Vote: 7-0 Approved

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Allen, Crockett and Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS – None

Zoning Cases: ZON18-00951, ZON19-00193, ZON19-00201 and ZON19-00231; Preliminary Plats: “Eastmark Row Towns” and SEC First & Macdonald Phase 2”

* * * * *

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also “live broadcasted” through the City of Mesa’s website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2019 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *3-a ZON19-00192 District 6.** Within the 9300 block of East Cadence Parkway (both sides). Located east of Ellsworth Road and south of Ray Road. (33.2± acres). This request will approve the Development Unit 1 Phase 1 Development Unit Plan within the Pacific Proving Grounds North Community Plan, also known as the Cadence Community Plan. Susan Demmitt, Gammage and Burnham, PLC, applicant; PPGN-Ellsworth, LLLP, owner.

Planner: Lesley Davis

Staff Recommendation:

Summary: Staffmember Lesley Davis presented case ZON19-00192 to the Board. Ms. Davis stated this request is for approval of Phase 1 of Development Unit 1 within the Cadence Community Plan. Ms. Davis explained this is to guide future development of single residence and multi-residence development within Phase 1 of the Development Unit 1. The Cadence at Gateway Community Plan establishes a procedure that requires them to go through to obtain development approval for the property and the first step is to establish the Development Unit Plan. This plan outlines criteria of what needs to be submitted and the types of uses that are anticipated for each of the Development Units.

Ms. Davis explained the Development Unit 1 is intended to be the higher density residential with commercial land uses. The applicant is coming forward with the higher density residential component of the DU1. The proposal is consistent with the General Plan and the Gateway Strategic Development Plan.

Susan Demmitt with Gammage & Burnham, 2 N. Central Avenue, spoke on behalf of the developer. Ms. Demmitt asked the Board if she can wait to hear the public comments first before she addresses the board and responds to the public comments.

Jessica Sanchez, 9545 E. Travertine is opposed to the project and did not speak.

Brent Vail, 9711 E. Timpani Lane is opposed to the project and did not speak.

Shannon Vail, 9711 E. Timpani Lane is opposed to the project. Ms. Vail spoke for several neighbors and stated their concerns about planning of their community which they never received. Ms. Vail stated only a few residents recently received letters informing them of multi-family housing was being planned in an area where they had been told it would be developed as a retail space. She stated retail will bring tax dollars to Mesa and feels multi-family will not.

MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2019 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

Ms. Vail also informed the Board that residents are concerned with safety and want their community to remain safe. She stated studies show if there are more than 4 complexes in a multi-residential development, crime will increase. Ms. Vail stated the development will also increase traffic and use of services in their area by people that do not pay HOA fees.

Tamara Kleck, 9857 E. Thornbush is opposed to the project and did not speak.

Sarah Cherry, 9634 E. Talon is opposed to the project. Ms. Cherry stated her concern of maintaining the appearance of the neighborhood as they were sold on the idea of a beautiful appearance of the community. Ms. Cherry stated the residents are paying monthly dues to maintain the surrounding landscape and feels the HOA will be paying for the landscaping surrounding the apartments.

Lisa Stewart, 1125 W. Mulberry Way is opposed to the project and did not speak.

Kevin Vandelac, 9922 E. Timpani is opposed to the project and did not speak.

Amber Prast, 9656 E. Timpani is opposed to the project. Ms. Prast is concerned about increase in traffic around the elementary school. She feels the high-density residential development will increase crime rates in the area.

Robert Mason, 9518 E. Thornbush is opposed to the project. Mr. Mason stated the notification he received identified a possible commercial development on the subject parcel. If there is a high-density project developed, he will be next door to it.

Lisa Mason, 9518 E. Thornbush is opposed to the project and did not speak.

Susan Demmitt with Gammage & Burnham, 2 N. Central Avenue, responded to the comments received by the residents. Ms. Demmitt stated she and the developer welcome speaking with the neighbors after the meeting and will be hosting an informational meeting in the near future with the residents.

Ms. Demmitt informed the Board that the application is for a Development Unit Plan for Phase 1. It is effectively a design guideline document to direct any future development within that portion of the project. The land uses allowed within the DU1 was approved with the Community Plan in September, 2012 and these land uses are allowed by right. Ms. Demmitt stated there are no specific development proposals at this time, because the Development Unit Plan is the next step in the process. The Cadence Community Plan established the framework for Cadence going forward and it does describe the diverse land uses including diverse types of housing. This Development Unit Plan does not specifically propose multi-family

MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2019 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

projects but simply sets site plan guidelines for all the uses allowed in that portion of the community development.

Chair Dahlke inquired if future development would come before this board. Ms. Demmitt replied it would depend on the intensity of the project. For example, single family proposals would not but a higher density multi-family development may be required to. If it is a four story multi-residential development it would be heard by the board.

Boardmember Sarkissian confirmed the Cadence Community Plan approved in 2012 designates the development standards. Ms. Demmitt confirms this Development Unit Plan is not specific to any but is more of a policy document with design guidelines taking the concept for Cadence to the next level. It does not include any specific development.

Ms. Demmitt responded to Boardmember Allen's question if the Community Plan is available to the residents. She explained it is a public document and has been available on the Mesa website. She stated they will host a community meeting to talk with the residents to discuss future plans prior to submitting projects to the City. There was discussion regarding notification of residents and how that process occurs.

Boardmember Sarkissian motioned to approve case ZON19-00192 with conditions of approval. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Villanueva-Saucedo.

That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON19-00192 conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with Ordinance number 5115 and the adopted Pacific Proving Grounds North Community Plan.
2. Compliance with Cadence at Gateway Development Unit 1 – Phase 1 Development Unit Plan submitted.

Vote: 7-0 Approved

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Allen, Crockett and Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS – None

* * * * *

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also “live broadcasted” through the City of Mesa’s website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2019 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *4-a ZON18-00067 District 6.** Within the 9500 through 9800 blocks of East Hampton Avenue (south side). Located north of the US-60 Superstition Freeway and west of Crismon Road. (33± acres). Rezoning from NC-BIZ, NC-PAD and PEP-PAD-CUP to RM-2-PAD; and Site Plan Review. This request will allow for a single-residence subdivision. Reese Anderson, Pew & Lake, LLC, applicant; Crismon BFC, LLC owner. **(Companion case to Preliminary Plat “Bella Encanta”, associated with item *5-a).**

Planner: Evan Balmer

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Summary: Staffmember Evan Balmer presented case ZON18-00067 and preliminary plat “Bella Encanta” to the Board. Mr. Balmer explained this request is for a rezoning to RM-2-PAD. He stated in order to receive the requested deviations to the development standards as part of the PAD request, the applicant is to provide enhancements to the development in exchange for the deviations. Mr. Balmer stated the applicant is enhancing the open space for this exchange.

Staffmember Balmer stated since the Board has seen this request last year, the General Plan was amended by Council and is Neighborhood Suburban and supports this request. It was confirmed the request for the General Plan amendment and zoning case was previously heard by the Planning and Zoning Board and the board recommendation was denial. City Council then approved the General Plan amendment and sent the request to rezone and site plan back to this board for review.

Applicant Reese Anderson, 1744 N. Val Vista, spoke to the Board. Mr. Anderson stated this is a redesign of the previous request and feels the developer has addressed the concerns of the board from the original requested site plan. He stated the density of this developer is lower than the surrounding developments and has 7.4 times more open space than is required.

Boardmember Sarkissian confirmed there will be a fence on the south side of the property. Mr. Anderson stated they received two letters from Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) stating they have no comment or concerns about the portion of the property to the south. He reported the plans have received preliminary plans with the City of Mesa for extending the sewer from the southeast corner of this site to Ellsworth. Mr. Anderson closed by stating there will be a Homeowner’s Association at this development.

Boardmember Allen stated her concerns regarding sustainability of this project and the impact it will have beyond the City itself. Ms. Allen stated the site plan has come a long way from the original proposal. She explained there was no feedback from Crime Prevention regarding design and potential Code Compliance issues.

MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2019 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

Vice Chair Astle feels there has been great progress and some of the original issues have been addressed. Chair Dahlke agrees with Vice Chair and likes all of the amenities. Boardmember Sarkissian is also in favor of the project.

Vice Chair Astle motioned to approve case ZON18-00067 to include the preliminary plat "Bella Encanta" with conditions of approval. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Sarkissian.

That: The Board voted for ZON18-00067.

Vote: Denial (Vote: 3-3; Boardmember Crockett, recused)

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian

NAYS – Allen, Boyle, Villanueva-Saucedo

* * * * *

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2019 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *4-b ZON18-00951 District 6.** The 6000 through 6400 blocks of the south Crismon Road alignment (east side), the 10000 to 10600 blocks of East Williams Field Road (south side) and the 6000 through 6400 blocks of South 222nd Street (west side). Located south of Williams Field Road and west of Signal Butte Road (170± acres). Rezone from AG and PC to PC. This request will amend the Pacific Proving Grounds North Community Plan, also known as the Cadence Community Plan and establish the Avalon Crossing Community Plan.

Planner: Tom Ellsworth

Staff Recommendation: Continuance to June 26, 2019

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed as a separate individual item.

Boardmember Villanueva-Saucedo motioned to continue case ZON18-00951 to the June 26, 2019 meeting. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Allen.

Vote: 7-0 Approved

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Allen, Crockett and Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS – None

* * * * *

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also “live broadcasted” through the City of Mesa’s website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2019 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *4-c ZON19-00193 District 4.** Within the 400 block of North Matlock Street (east side). Located north of University Drive and west of Stapley Drive. (0.38 ± acres). Rezone from RM-4 to RS-6. This request will allow for the development of single residences. Andrea Forman, Forman Architects, applicant; Jesus Ludwig/Reina Salustia Roman, owners.

Planner: Ryan McCann

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed as a separate individual item.

Boardmember Villanueva-Saucedo motioned to approve case ZON19-00193 with conditions of approval. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Allen.

That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON18-00193 conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.

Vote: 7-0 Approved

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Allen, Crockett and Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS – None

* * * * *

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also “live broadcasted” through the City of Mesa’s website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2019 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *4-d ZON19-00201 District 6.** Within the 9800 through 10000 blocks of East Hampton Avenue (south side) and within the 1400 through 1500 block of South Crismon Road (west side). Located at the northwest corner of the US-60 Superstition Freeway and Crismon Road. (15 ± acres). Rezoning from PEP-PAD to PEP-PAD; and Site Plan Review. This request will allow for the development of a group commercial center with office and commercial uses. Gilmore Planning & Landscape Architecture, applicant; Virtua Mesa Crismon Owner LLC; and SWC Crismon & Hampton LLC, owners. **(Companion case to Preliminary Plat "SWC Crismon Road & Hampton Avenue", associated with item *5-b).**

Planner: Lisa Davis

Staff Recommendation:

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed as a separate individual item.

Boardmember Villanueva-Saucedo motioned to approve case ZON19-00201 and associated preliminary plat "SWC Crismon Road & Hampton Avenue" with conditions of approval. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Allen.

That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON18-00201 conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with final site plan submitted.
2. Compliance with all requirements of Ordinance No. 5459, associated with ZON18-00149, with the following modification: removal of conditions of approval 10, 11, and 12 pertaining to the airport overlay area.

Vote: 7-0 Approved

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Allen, Crockett and Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS – None

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2019 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *4-e ZON19-00231 District 1.** 445 W 5th Place Building, #102. Located west of Country Club Drive and north of University Drive. (.04± acres). Council Use Permit. This request will establish a Council Use Permit to allow a school in the LC zoning district. Sherri Samson, applicant; Southwest Institute of Montessori Studies, Inc., owner.

Planner: Charlotte Bridges

Staff Recommendation: Withdrawn by applicant

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed as a separate individual item.

Boardmember Villanueva-Saucedo motioned to withdraw case ZON19-00231 with conditions of approval. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Allen.

Vote: 7-0 Approved

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Allen, Crockett and Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS – None

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also “live broadcasted” through the City of Mesa’s website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2019 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *5-a “Bella Encanta” District 6.** Within the 9500 through 9800 blocks of East Hampton Avenue (south side). Located north of the US-60 Superstition Freeway and west of Crismon Road. (33± acres). Preliminary Plat. This request will allow for a single residence subdivision. Reese Anderson, Pew & Lake, LLC, applicant; Crismon BFC, LLC owner. **(Companion case to ZON18-00067, associated with item *4-a).**

Planner: Evan Balmer

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Summary: This case was discussed in conjunction with ZON18-00067.

Vice Chair Astle motioned to approve preliminary plat “Bella Encanta” to include case ZON18-00067 with conditions of approval. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Sarkissian.

Vote: Denial (Vote: 3-3; Boardmember Crockett, recused)

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian

NAYS – Allen, Boyle, Villanueva-Saucedo

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also “live broadcasted” through the City of Mesa’s website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2019 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *5-b “SWC Crismon Road & Hampton Avenue” District 6.** Within the 9800 through 10000 blocks of East Hampton Avenue (south side) and within the 1400 through 1500 block of South Crismon Road (west side). Located at the northwest corner of the US-60 Superstition Freeway and Crismon Road. (15 ± acres). Preliminary Plat. Gilmore Planning & Landscape Architecture, applicant; Virtua Mesa Crismon Owner LLC; and SWC Crismon & Hampton LLC, owners. **(Companion case to ZON19-00201, associated with item *4-d).**

Planner: Lisa Davis

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed as a separate individual item.

Boardmember Villanueva-Saucedo motioned to approve preliminary plat “SWC Crismon Road & Hampton Avenue” and associated case ZON19-00201 with conditions of approval. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Allen.

That: The Board recommends the approval of preliminary plat “SWC Crismon Road & Hampton Avenue” conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with final site plan submitted.
2. Compliance with all requirements of Ordinance No. 5459, associated with ZON18-00149, with the following modification: removal of conditions of approval 10, 11, and 12 pertaining to the airport overlay area.

Vote: 7-0 Approved

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Allen, Crockett and Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS – None

* * * * *

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also “live broadcasted” through the City of Mesa’s website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2019 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *5-c “Eastmark Row Towns” District 6.** Within the 9800 through 9900 blocks of East Point Twenty-Two Boulevard (north side) and the 4600 through 4700 blocks of South Eastmark Parkway (west side). Located north of Ray Road and East of Ellsworth Road. Preliminary Plat. Heather Chadwick, Lennar Arizona, applicant; DMB Mesa Proving Grounds, LLC, owner. (ZON19-00199)

Planner: Cassidy Welch

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed as a separate individual item.

Boardmember Villanueva-Saucedo motioned to approve preliminary plat “Eastmark Row Towns” with conditions of approval. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Allen.

That: The Board recommends the approval of preliminary plat “Eastmark Row Towns” conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with the preliminary plat submitted.
2. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
3. Compliance with all requirements of the Subdivision Regulations.
4. Development within the proposed plat shall be in conformance with the approved Development Unit Plan for Development Unit 3/4 (DU3/4) of the Mesa Proving Grounds Community Plan.

Vote: 7-0 Approved

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Allen, Crockett and Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS – None

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also “live broadcasted” through the City of Mesa’s website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2019 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *5-d “SEC First & Macdonald Phase 2” District 4.** Within the 0 through 100 blocks of West 1st Avenue (south side) and the 100 block of South Macdonald (east side). Located south of Main Street and west of Center Street. (1.6± acres). Preliminary Plat. Charles Huellmantel, Huellmantel & Affiliates, applicant; City of Mesa, owner. (ZON19-00267)

Planner: Cassidy Welch

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed as a separate individual item.

Boardmember Villanueva-Saucedo motioned to approve preliminary plat “SEC First & Macdonald Phase 2” with conditions of approval. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Allen.

That: The Board recommends the approval of preliminary plat “SEC First & Macdonald Phase 2” conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with the preliminary plat submitted.
2. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
3. Compliance with all requirements of the Subdivision Regulations.

Vote: 7-0 Approved

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Allen, Crockett and Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS – None

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also “live broadcasted” through the City of Mesa’s website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2019 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

5 Other Business.

None.

6 Adjournment.

Boardmember Allen motioned to adjourn the meeting at 5:26 pm. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Villanueva-Saucedo.

Vote: 7-0 Approved

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Allen, Crockett and Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS – None

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Nana K. Appiah', is written over a horizontal line.

Nana K. Appiah, AICP, Secretary
Planning Director