

Planning and Zoning Board

Meeting Minutes

Held in the City of Mesa Council Chambers – Upper Level

Date: April 18, 2018 Time: 4:00 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Chair Michael Clement
Vice Chair Michelle Dahlke
Jessica Sarkissian
Tim Boyle
Jennifer Duff*
Shelly Allen

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Dane Astle

*Boardmember Duff was excused from the meeting at 5:30 pm

STAFF PRESENT:

John Wesley
Tom Ellsworth
Lesley Davis
Wahid Alam
Cassidy Welch
Evan Balmer
Ryan McCann
Charlotte McDermott
Rebecca Gorton

OTHERS PRESENT:

Sheila Byrne
Mike Byrne
Tim Hull
Dustin Curtis
Shane Jacobs
Richard Wimmer
Misty Karpola
Christopher Saldenegro
Courtney Kissane
Other citizens who did not sign in

Call Meeting to Order.

Chair Clement declared a quorum present and the meeting was called to order at 4:11 p.m.

1. Take action on all consent agenda items.

Items on the Consent Agenda

2. **Approval of minutes:** Consider the minutes from the March 20, 2018, and March 21, 2018 study sessions and regular hearing.

***2-a** It was moved by Boardmember Allen to approve the Consent Agenda as read into the record to include changes to the March 21, 2018 minutes with the added conditions of approval for case ZON18-00061 presented at the Study Session. The motion was seconded by Vice Chair Dahlke.

Vote: 6-0 (Boardmember Astle, absent)

Zoning Cases: ZON17-00597, ZON18-00135, ZON17-00410, ZON17-00532, ZON18-00056, ZON18-00061, ZON18-00066: Preliminary Plats: "The Landing", "Mountain Vista Marketplace Phase 1", and "Longbow Marketplace".

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *3-a ZON17-00597 District 2.** 1961 South Val Vista Drive. Located on the northeast corner of Val Vista Drive and Baseline Road. (1± acres). Site Plan Modification. This request will allow a multi-tenant commercial building with a drive-thru restaurant and tenant space for retail use in the LC zoning district. Mark Rykovich, Thomas English Real Estate, LLC, applicant; Circle K Stores, Inc., owner.

Planner: Wahid Alam

Staff Recommendation: Table

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Boardmember Allen and seconded by Vice Chair Dahlke to table case ZON17-00597.

Vote: 6-0 (Boardmember Astle, absent)

Note: *Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.gov*

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *3-b ZON18-00135 District 6.** The 7600 through 7800 blocks of East Ray Road (south side). Located east of Sossaman Road on the south side of Ray Road. (21± acres). Site Plan Review. This request will allow for the development of six industrial buildings. Eric Zitny, Ware Malcomb, applicant; David Martens, Marwest Enterprises, LLC/Santan 74 LLLP, owner. **(Companion to preliminary plat "The Landing", associated with item *5-a)**

Planner: Wahid Alam

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Boardmember Allen and seconded by Vice Chair Dahlke to approve case ZON18-00135 with conditions:

That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON18-00135 conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with the basic development as described in the project narrative and as shown on the site plan and preliminary plat submitted (without guarantee of lot yield, building count, lot coverage).
2. Compliance with all City of Mesa Code requirements and regulations.
3. Dedicate the right-of-way required under the Mesa City Code at the time of application for a building permit, at the time of recordation of the subdivision plat, or at the time of the City's request for dedication, whichever comes first.
4. Compliance with all requirements of the Subdivision Technical Review Committee.
5. Compliance with all requirements of Design Review case # DRB18-00062 for architectural and landscaping design.
6. Prior to submittal of a building permit:
 - a. Reduce the height of building 3 to a maximum of 40 feet, unless an increase is approved through a Special Use Permit.
 - b. Provide a copy of the recorded cross-access easement assuring access and connectivity to the property to the west.
 - c. Provide a copy of the recorded cross-access easement assuring access and connectivity to the property to the east.
 - d. Any proposed permanent, or temporary, structure is subject to an FAA filing for review in conformance with CFR Title 14 Part 77 (Form 7460) to determine any effect to navigable airspace and air navigation facilities. An FAA determination notice of no hazard to air navigation shall be provided.
 - e. Owner granting an Avigation Easement and Release to the City, pertaining to Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport which will be prepared and recorded by the City.
 - f. Written notice be provided to future property owners, and acknowledgment received that the project is within 0.25 miles of Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport.
7. Noise attenuation measures shall be incorporated into the design and construction buildings where people work, or are otherwise received to achieve an outdoor-to-indoor noise level reduction (NLR) of 25 decibels.

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

8. No structures are allowed within 6' of the airport's perimeter fence line.
9. Install extruded concrete curbing and a 5 feet-wide landscape area along the undeveloped edge(s) per Section 11-33-2L.

Vote: 6-0 (Boardmember Astle, absent)

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *3-c ZON17-00410 District 6.** The 8300 block of East Guadalupe Road (south side) and the 2800 block of South Hawes Road (west side). (1.3± acres). Located at the southwest corner of Hawes Road and Guadalupe Road. Site Plan Modification. This request will allow for the development of a restaurant with drive-thru in the LC-PAD district. Doug Cox, One Architecture, applicant; BBVA Compass, owner.

Planner: Wahid Alam

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Boardmember Allen and seconded by Vice Chair Dahlke to approve case ZON17-00410 with conditions:

That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON17-00410 conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with the basic development as described in the project narrative, and as shown on the site plan submitted, except as modified by the conditions below.
2. Compliance with Design Review process.
3. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
4. Compliance with the conditions of approval for cases Z95-106 and Z03-016, except as modified by this case.

Vote: 6-0 (Boardmember Astle, absent)

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *4-a ZON17-00532 District 3.** The 1600 through 2000 blocks of West Southern Avenue (south side) and the 1200 through 1500 blocks of South Dobson Road (east side) and the 1400 through 1500 blocks of South Longmore (west side). Located on the southeast corner of Southern Avenue and Dobson Road, (The Mesa Community College Campus). (145± acres). Rezoning from PS, LC and GC to GC-PAD. This request will allow for private development within the Mesa Community College campus. W. Ralph Pew, Pew and Lake, PLC, applicant; Maricopa County Community College District, owner. **(Continued from March 21, 2018 to re-advertise)**

Planner: Lesley Davis

Staff Recommendation: Continuance to May 16, 2018

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Boardmember Allen and seconded by Vice Chair Dahlke to continue case ZON17-00532 to the May 16, 2018 meeting.

Vote: 6-0 (Boardmember Astle, absent)

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *4-c ZON18-00056 District 2.** The 4300 through 4400 blocks of East Florian Avenue (north side). (1.2± acres). Located north of Southern Avenue and west of Greenfield Road. Modification of an existing PAD; and Site Plan Review. This request will allow for the development of an office building. Michael A. Hall, Michael A. Hall Architect, LLC; Steven Frost, Red Mountain Gaming, LLC, owner.

Planner: Wahid Alam

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Boardmember Allen and seconded by Vice Chair Dahlke to approve case ZON18-00056 with conditions:

That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON18-00056 conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with the basic development as described in the project narrative, and as shown on the site plan submitted, except as modified by the conditions below (without guarantee of lot yield, building count, lot coverage).
2. Compliance with all conditions of Design Review (DRB18-00073) approval.
3. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
4. Prior to submission of building permit application, modify the site plan and elevations for acceptance by the Planning Director to include the following items:
 - a) A maximum of 57 parking spaces per Section 11-32-3C.
 - b) Cover the parking spaces per zoning code Section 11-32-3D.
 - c) Screen the exterior wall mounted equipment including Service Entry Section (SES) per zoning code Section 11-30-9A 3.

Vote: 6-0 (Boardmember Astle, absent)

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *4-c ZON18-00061 District 6.** The 7600 block of East Baseline Road (south side) and the 2000 block of South Sossaman Road (east side). Located at the southeast corner of Sossaman Road and Baseline Road. (1.1± acres). Rezoning from LC to LC-BIZ; and Site Plan Review. This request will allow for the development of a medical clinic. Alex Buettner, Orcutt Winslow, applicant; Goldfield Medical Clinics, LLC, Trust, owner.

Planner: Evan Balmer

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Boardmember Allen and seconded by Vice Chair Dahlke to approve case ZON18-00061 and to include added condition of approval #7 presented at the study session:

That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON18-00061 conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with the basic development as described in the project narrative, and as shown on the site plan and preliminary plat submitted, and preliminary elevations, (without guarantee of lot yield, building count, lot coverage).
2. Compliance with all requirements of Design Review.
3. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
4. Dedicate the right-of-way required under the Mesa City Code at the time of application for a building permit or at the time of the City's request for dedication, whichever comes first.
5. Written notice be provided to future property owners, and acknowledgment received that the project is within four miles of Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport.
6. Owner granting an Avigation Easement and Release to the City, pertaining to Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport which will be prepared and recorded by the City prior to the issuance of a building permit.
7. **If the use of any portion of the mezzanine changes from storage to any other use, the property shall be brought in to compliance with Chapter 32 of the City of Mesa Zoning Ordinance pertaining to on-site parking.**

Vote: 6-0 (Boardmember Astle, absent)

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *4-d **ZON18-00066 District 3.** The 1000 through 1100 blocks of South Alma School Road (west side) and the 1200 through 1300 blocks of West Southern Avenue (north side). Located at the northwest corner of Alma School Road and Southern Avenue. (16± acres). Rezoning from LC to RM-5 PAD for 10.5± acres, Rezoning from LC to LC-PAD for 5.5± acres; and Site Plan Review for 16± acres. This request will allow for development of multi-residential and commercial uses. Stan Thompson, Todd & Associates, Inc., applicant; WM Grace Development Co., ETAL, owner.

Planner: Lesley Davis

Staff Recommendation: Continuance to May 16, 2018

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Boardmember Allen and seconded by Vice Chair Dahlke to continue case ZON17-00532 to the May 16, 2018 meeting.

Vote: 6-0 (Boardmember Astle, absent)

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *5-a "The Landing" District 6.** The 7600 through 7800 blocks of East Ray Road (south side). Located east of Sossaman Road on the south side of Ray Road. (21± acres). Preliminary Plat. Eric Zitny, Ware Malcomb, applicant; David Martens, Marwest Enterprises, LLC/Santan 74 LLLP, owner. (Companion to ZON18-00135, associated with item *3-b) (ZON18-00135)

Planner: Wahid Alam

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Boardmember Allen and seconded by Vice Chair Dahlke to approve preliminary plat "The Landing" with conditions:

That: The Board recommends the approval of preliminary plat "The Landing conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with the basic development as described in the project narrative and as shown on the site plan and preliminary plat submitted (without guarantee of lot yield, building count, lot coverage).
2. Compliance with all City of Mesa Code requirements and regulations.
3. Dedicate the right-of-way required under the Mesa City Code at the time of application for a building permit, at the time of recordation of the subdivision plat, or at the time of the City's request for dedication, whichever comes first.
4. Compliance with all requirements of the Subdivision Technical Review Committee.
5. Compliance with all requirements of Design Review case # DRB18-00062 for architectural and landscaping design.
6. Prior to submittal of a building permit:
 - a. Reduce the height of building 3 to a maximum of 40 feet, unless an increase is approved through a Special Use Permit.
 - b. Provide a copy of the recorded cross-access easement assuring access and connectivity to the property to the west.
 - c. Provide a copy of the recorded cross-access easement assuring access and connectivity to the property to the east.
 - d. Any proposed permanent, or temporary, structure is subject to an FAA filing for review in conformance with CFR Title 14 Part 77 (Form 7460) to determine any effect to navigable airspace and air navigation facilities. An FAA determination notice of no hazard to air navigation shall be provided.
 - e. Owner granting an Avigation Easement and Release to the City, pertaining to Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport which will be prepared and recorded by the City.
 - f. Written notice be provided to future property owners, and acknowledgment received that the project is within 0.25 miles of Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport.
7. Noise attenuation measures shall be incorporated into the design and construction buildings where people work, or are otherwise received to achieve an outdoor-to-indoor noise level reduction (NLR) of 25 decibels.

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

8. No structures are allowed within 6' of the airport's perimeter fence line.
9. Install extruded concrete curbing and a 5 foot-wide landscape area along the undeveloped edge(s) per Section 11-33-2L.

Vote: 6-0 (Boardmember Astle, absent)

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *5-b "Mountain Vista Marketplace Phase 1" District 6.** The 10700 to 10800 blocks of East Southern Avenue (south side) and the 1200 through 1300 blocks of South Signal Butte Road (west side). Located on the south side of Southern Avenue on the west side of Signal Butte Road. (9.5± acres). Preliminary Plat. Patrick Lowry, Slater Hanifan Group applicant; Kitchell Development Company, owner. (ZON18-00117)

Planner: Ryan McCann

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Boardmember Allen and seconded by Vice Chair Dahlke to approve preliminary plat "Mountain Vista Marketplace Phase 1" with conditions:

That: The Board recommends the approval of preliminary plat "Mountain Vista Marketplace Phase 1" conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with the basic development as described in the project narrative and preliminary plat submitted (without guarantee of lot yield, building count, lot coverage).
2. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
3. Compliance with all requirements of the Subdivision Regulations.
4. Compliance with all conditions of approval of Site Plan Review ZON17-00045.
5. Compliance with all conditions of Design Review approval for DRB17-00044.

Vote: 6-0 (Boardmember Astle, absent)

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- *5-c "Longbow Marketplace" District 5.** The 5900 block of East Longbow Parkway (north side) and the 3100 through 3200 blocks of North Recker Road (west side). Located south of the Loop 202 Red Mountain Freeway on the west side of Recker Road. (9.1± acres). Preliminary Plat. Patrick Lowry, Slater Hanifan Group, applicant; Kitchell Development Company, owner. (ZON18-00144)

Planner: Ryan McCann

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Summary: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Boardmember Allen and seconded by Vice Chair Dahlke to approve preliminary plat "Longbow Marketplace" with conditions:

That: The Board recommends the approval of preliminary plat "Longbow Marketplace" conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with the basic development as described in the project narrative and preliminary plat submitted (without guarantee of lot yield, building count, lot coverage).
2. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
3. Compliance with all requirements of the Subdivision Regulations.
4. Compliance with all conditions of approval of Site Plan Review Z16-050.

Vote: 6-0 (Boardmember Astle, absent)

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- 6-a ZON17-00507 District 5** The 1200 block of North Ellsworth Road (west side) and the 9100 block of East Glencove Avenue (south side). Located north of Brown Road on the west side of Ellsworth Road. (1.8± acres). Rezoning (modification of Zoning Stipulation) and Site Plan Modification. This request will allow for the development of an enclosed RV storage facility in the LC zoning district. Dorothy Shupe, Sketch Architecture Company, applicant; Broc Hiatt, owner. (**Continued from March 21, 2018**)

Planner: Cassidy Welch

Staff Recommendation: Continuance to May 16, 2018

Summary: Staffmember Welch presented case ZON17-00507 to the Board. Ms. Welch stated staff had concerns with the original site plan showing the entrance to the facility on the west side off of Glencove. Staff believes the applicant has addressed some of staff's concerns when they relocated the drive to the center of the property off of Glencove and making it an ingress only drive.

Reese Anderson, 1741 S. Val Vista, spoke for the applicant. Mr. Anderson stated the subdivision north of the site is county property. He showed the approved site plan from 2002 which was never developed. Since that approval, there is a median on Ellsworth preventing larger vehicles to access the site without making a u-turn.

In response to neighborhood meeting, Mr. Anderson explained there are changes to the original site plan. These changes include removing the exit onto Glencove and relocating the entrance to be closer to Ellsworth and changing the building locations to allow stacking on the property and not off of Glencove. The traffic study shows there will be one trip per day. Mr. Anderson concluded by stating they have made changes to the buildings, removing the exit onto Glencove and increasing landscaping.

Boardmember Allen inquired if the applicant has discussed any alternatives with Transportation, perhaps requesting a cut in the median on Ellsworth. Mr. Anderson felt Transportation would not allow it. Boardmember Boyle inquired if the traffic study looks at an increase of traffic immediately after a holiday. Mr. Anderson responded an increase would assume that everyone would arrive all at once, and perhaps after a holiday traffic would increase.

Resident Jeff Karpola, 9012 E. Glencove Avenue, spoke in opposition. Mr. Karpola feels approval will increase traffic and has concerns that the facility may be accessed 24 hours a day.

Resident Hope Marsh, 9030 E. Glencove Avenue, spoke in opposition. Ms. Marsh stated she is concerned why they cannot access from Ellsworth. She stated the proposed use will impact the neighborhood by increase of traffic.

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

Resident Tim Hull, 9127 E. Halifax, spoke in opposition. Mr. Hull stated he is representing the residents and HOA of Sierra Heights and feels the proposed use seems inconsistent with the zoning. It would greatly alter the neighborhood concept in this area of Mesa and greatly diminish property values.

Resident Sheila Byrne, 8965 E. Halifax, spoke in opposition. Ms. Byrne stated 30' high warehouse will have a maximum impact on their community.

Resident Courtney Kissane, 9138 E. Glencove, spoke in opposition. Ms. Kissane stated her concern is the safety of the children on the street. She stated addition of speed bumps may help slow down the traffic.

Resident Mike Byrne, 8965 E. Halifax, spoke in opposition. Mr. Byrne stated his concern is the safety of the children in the community.

Reese Anderson responded to the concerns of the neighbors. Mr. Anderson stated the lights on the proposed high end, indoor storage are low level and turned into the buildings and would not impact the residents. Mr. Anderson explained this is a low impact land use with minimal traffic impact and requested site plan approval.

There was further discussion on options for changing the entrances and exits to the site. In response to Vice Chair Dahlke question regarding the right to use Glencove by developers, Planning Director John Wesley stated typically we do allow access to adjacent streets. Staff has looked at the history of this case and it appears from the record that it has been the intention of Council to not allow access to Glencove. Although staff does not like to approve access on a residential street, we found that because the median now exists, it prevents directly accessing the site from Ellsworth. He explained the median did not exist in the original zoning case.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Dahlke to continue case ZON17-00507 to the May 16, 2018 meeting. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Allen.

Vote: 6-0 (Boardmember Astle, absent)

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

- 6-b ZON18-00169 District 6.** The 8200 to 8400 blocks of East Baseline Road (north side). Located west of Hawes Road on the north side of Baseline Road. (32.6± acres). Modification of an existing PAD. This request will allow for the reduction of interior garage dimensions. Drew Huseh, Woodside Homes, applicant; Baseline Mesa LLC, owner.

Planner: Cassidy Welch

Staff Recommendation: Denial

Summary: Staffmember Cassidy Welch presented case ZON18-00169. Ms. Welch stated the current City of Mesa zoning code requires new subdivisions provide a 20' wide by 22' deep, 2 car garage. Ms. Welch stated the applicant is requesting a reduction in the garage size to 19' 4" wide by 22' deep for the traditional lots, and 21' 4" wide by 20" deep for the alley loaded courtyard product. She stated staff feels the reduction of garage size would not provide sufficient storage space or parking and increase traffic concerns. Ms. Welch stated there are no driveways for the alley loaded product and staff feels the residents will be parking on the streets. Ms. Welch stated staff feels a reduction in garage space would significantly deteriorate the quality of the neighborhood.

Susan Demmitt, Gammage & Burnham, 2 North Central Ave., spoke on behalf of the applicant. Ms. Demmitt explained this is the first time Woodside Homes has developed in the City of Mesa and feels they had been proactive in working with staff and customizes floor plans and elevations for each new development. Ms. Demmitt stated as they progressed into developing the product, they ensured they worked within any specific City of Mesa guidelines and are now in the Final Plat stage. Ms. Demmitt stated the garage dimension requirement is an unusual regulation and not easy to find in COM zoning ordinance. She explained once this came to their attention, they immediately requested a reduction in the garage dimension. Ms. Demmitt stated the reduction of the garage size is imperative due to the product type and size of the lots.

Ms. Demmitt explained the applicant is requesting an 8" reduction in width for two of the six floor plans in the traditional product and a reduction of all the garages for the cluster product. She believes there will be adequate storage space for all of the garages and that they meet or exceed all requirements. Ms. Demmitt reviewed garage size requirements of surrounding cities and feels the City of Mesa has the greatest requirements. She stated this is a market driven issue and builders build what buyers are looking for.

Ms. Demmitt stated Woodside Homes had built cluster product in other communities and have not experience parking issues with this product. Boardmember Sarkissian inquired if the other Woodside Home communities have been sold and if there have been any parking issues. Ms. Demmitt stated there is a community in West Phoenix, 75th Avenue

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

and Thomas Road, which is fully built out. She stated Woodside Homes has not experienced any parking issues at this time in this development.

Ms. Demmitt explained they have already made modifications to the 45' wide floor plans in response to conversations with staff. She stated the original intent was to build a 19'4"x20' garage which is what was built in other communities. Ms. Demmitt explained the intent was to provide an option for buyers to extend their garage 2'. Instead of the option for the buyer, Ms. Demmitt stated they agreed with staff to make the 2' extension a mandatory requirement for the 45' lots.

Ms Demmitt stated their request is for reduction of the width of the garages and not reduction of length for the traditional lots. She explained the process if the builder were required to keep the larger garages and the impact on living spaces. She explained these elevations are finely tuned floor plans and are geared to a specific buyer type. Ms. Demmitt stated it would be helpful to the building community if the requirements were not buried in the ordinance and easier to find.

Ms. Demmitt believes the reduced garages accommodate the type of vehicles people are driving today. She presented a comparison of top selling vehicles in 2017 and found that all of the cars would comfortably fit into the smaller garage. She stated the issue then becomes if there is enough storage. Ms. Demmitt stated the cluster lots all have 10' side yards that run the length of the house, and do not have traditional rear yards. She explained there is enough room for to store trash receptacles on the side yard, a lawn mower or bikes. There is also a 45 sq. ft. storage area under the stairway in the house for storage. As far as the parking concerns, Ms. Demmitt stated they exceed the city standards for parking requirements by providing 3 parking spaces per home, averaging a ratio of 3.1. The streets are designed by city standards and designed for on-street parking.

Referencing the traditional lots, Ms. Demmitt provided the Board with specific garage sizes for each of the traditional lots. She stated they have a minimum 10' rear yard, but the buyer for these lots want a more traditional back yard. Ms. Demmitt stated every single lot in the traditional homes will be 20' deep at a minimum. This will provide the buyer space in the rear for storage. She stated there will be space to park two vehicles in the driveway and there will be on-street parking, developed by City standards.

Boardmember Boyle inquired of staff if they feel the location of the standards for garage size is easily located, as he has been able to locate it for his various projects. Planning Director John Wesley responded staff feels it is easily found and is located in the Zoning Code under parking standards. Mr. Wesley stated it has been suggested it be added to residential design standards as well.

Boardmember Allen stated her home was built prior to the standard and is unable to fit two cars in her garage and struggles with the request for narrowing garage sizes. Ms. Allen stated neighbors have begun parking

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

their cars on the street and feels it makes a statement in the neighborhood. She understands the cost associated with changing the garage sizes, but feels cluster homes typically are starter homes and buyers tend to turn into rentals. Boardmember Allen stated she is still opposed to approving the reduction of the garages.

Chair Clement inquired if the applicant had read the code correctly, would this have changed anything. Ms. Demmitt replied they would still be here today, requesting the reduction of the garage width. She explained the reduced garage sizes are adequate for this product.

Chair Clement inquired if there have been other requests for this width recently. Planning Director John Wesley responded the 20' width standard has been in our code for years. In 2011, the standard for depth was changed from 20' to 22'. Mr. Wesley explained there was a request a few years ago from Mulberry to reduce one product line to 19'4" in width. He stated all other small lot cluster product have been built to City standards.

Chair Clement inquired what would be the process if the Board denies the request. Ms. Demmitt stated they will continue to proceed to Council for their decision. If it is denied, Woodside Homes would need to reassess their development. Ms. Demmitt stated she feels the City needs to have flexibility in the Ordinance standards for small lot development.

Boardmember Sarkissian stated if the application were to be denied, the applicant could incur the cost of revising the floor plans, be impacted with amending the set-backs for PAD amendment or re-plot the entire development. Ms. Sarkissian stated this could push the developer to walk away from the project. She stated she feels deviating the standards for this product at this location is appropriate.

Vice Chair Dahlke stated she feels that most vehicles will be able to fit into the smaller garage and making the home smaller would make selling the home harder. Ms. Dahlke stated there are storage opportunities provided and the applicant has exceeded the parking requirements. She feels the applicant is so far along in the process and it would be unfair to recommend denial.

Boardmember Boyle stated he recognizes the hardship a denial would put on the applicant, as he has been through having to lose some units on a project because of the standards. Mr. Boyle stated he feels the standards make a better product and better City and is not concerned what other cities' requirements are. He stated he likes we are trying new product and feels we need to go with standards that have been set.

It was moved by Vice Chair Dahlke to approve case ZON18-00169 with the recommended stipulations presented by Planning Director John Wesley. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Sarkissian.

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

That: The Board recommends the approval of the PAD Modifications to case ZON18-00169 conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with conditions of approval associated with case numbers Z14-021 and ZON17-00326, except as amended by case ZON18-00169.
2. All traditional lot homes (45'x110') allowed a garage width not less than 19' 4" and depth of garage shall meet City standards.
3. All courtyard and alley lot homes allowed a garage depth of not less than 20' and width of garage shall meet City standards.

Vote: 3-2 (Boardmembers Astle and Duff, absent; Boardmembers Allen and Boyle, nay)

Note: Audio recordings of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE APRIL 18, 2018 PLANNING & ZONING MEETING

7 Other Business.

7-a Receive a presentation and discuss Sign Code Update.

Angelica Guevara, Project Manager, presented an update of the draft Sign Code to the Board.

8 Adjournment.

Boardmember Allen made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 7:02 pm. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Sarkissian.

Vote: 5-0 (Boardmembers Astle and Duff, absent)

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, reading "John D. Wesley", is written over a horizontal line.

John D. Wesley AICP, Secretary
Planning Director