



PLANNING DIVISION
STAFF REPORT

Planning and Zoning Board

May 13, 2020

CASE No.: **ZON20-00037**

PROJECT NAME: **Pioneer Place**

| | |
|---------------------------|---|
| Owner's Name: | Foster Arizona |
| Applicant's Name: | Ralph Pew, Pew & Lake |
| Location of Request: | Within the 500 block of East Broadway Road (south side) and within the 400 block of South Pioneer (west side). Located east of Mesa Drive on the south side of Broadway Road. |
| Parcel No(s): | 139-24-034C |
| Request: | Site Plan Review. This request will allow for a commercial and multiple-residence development. |
| Existing Zoning District: | Limited Commercial (LC) and Multiple Residence (RM-2) Districts |
| Council District: | 4 |
| Site Size: | 1± acre |
| Proposed Use(s): | Office and Multiple Residences |
| Existing Use(s): | Place of Worship and Accessory Residence |
| Hearing Date(s): | May 13, 2020 / 4:00 p.m. |
| Staff Planner: | Charlotte Bridges |
| Staff Recommendation: | APPROVAL with Conditions |

HISTORY

On **July 10, 1930** the subject site was annexed into the City of Mesa as part of a 551± acre annexation (Ord #157) and subsequently zoned Limited Commercial (LC) and Multiple Residence (RM-2).

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Background:

The subject request is for a site plan review to allow the development of a 16,032 square foot, two-story building containing office spaces and nine multi-residence units with associated parking on the property. Per Sections 11-5-2 and 11-6-2 of the MZO, the proposed uses are allowed in the RM-2 and LC districts. Specifically, Section 11-5-2 of the Mesa Zoning Ordinance (MZO), multiple residence uses with a maximum density of 15 dwelling units per acre are permitted in the RM-2 District. Per Section 11-31-31(A) of the MZO, multiple residence are also

allowed in the LC district so long as the proposed use conforms to the following; a minimum of 40 percent of the Gross Floor Area (GFA) of the lots reserved for non-residential uses; a minimum of 65 percent of the ground floor of the building is reserved for non-residential uses; and a maximum residential density does not exceed 25 dwelling units per acre. Further, per Section 11-6-2 of the MZO, office uses are also allowed in the LC district.

Overall, the portion of the proposed building located within the LC District section of the property complies with the required ratios of Section 11-31-31(A) of the MZO which equates to 41.9% of the GFA reserved for non-residential uses (1,176± square feet); 67.7% of the ground floor area (2,472± square feet) reserved for non-residential uses; and a maximum residential density of 5.4 dwelling units per acre.

According to the applicant and staff review of the site, currently, there are existing structures on the property. However, those structures will be removed to facilitate the new development. The proposed site plan shows a common open space to be centrally located adjacent to the west side of the building. On-site parking spaces will also be provided adjacent to the south side of the building and along the western property boundary. The site plan also shows construction of sidewalks that connect the ground floor units of the building directly to Pioneer located east of the property. There are also proposed sidewalks to be provided on all sides of the building, connecting the development to the public streets.

General Plan Character Area Designation and Goals:

The Mesa 2040 General Plan character area designation on the property is Neighborhood with a Traditional sub-type. Per Chapter 7 of the General Plan, the primary focus of the Neighborhood character type is to provide safe places for people to live where they can feel secure and enjoy their surrounding community. The Traditional sub-type is predominately single residences but may contain a variety of other uses including commercial and office activities along one street or in close proximity. In addition to the goals of the individual character areas outlined in Chapter 7 of the General Plan, Chapter 4 of the General Plan outlines goals for the City to focus on creating and maintaining a variety of great neighborhoods. The General Plan includes several key elements needed to create and maintain strong neighborhoods (Mesa 2040 General Plan pg. 4-2), such as providing diversity through a variety of housing types. Having a variety of housing types within a neighborhood provides interest to the built environment and provides the opportunity for differing people to live in close proximity to one another. The variety of housing also allows people to stay in the same neighborhood as their housing needs change throughout their life. Having long-term residents in a neighborhood brings stability and cohesion and makes continued investment in the neighborhood more likely.

The subject request includes demolishing a vacant building and redeveloping an underutilized property with a new office building and multiple residence development that is compatible with adjacent land uses, such as the existing commercial use to the west and the multiple residence units to the south. In addition, the proposed redevelopment of the site will add to the diversity of housing types in the neighborhood. Staff has reviewed the request and determined it is consistent with the criteria for review outlined in Chapter 15 of the Mesa 2040 General Plan.

The subject site is also within the Central Main Street Area and identified as part of the Temple/Pioneer Park Neighborhood Planning Area with a recommended Building Form and

Development Character of "Neighborhood Evolution". Per the Plan, the area is envisioned to evolve over time to consolidate the existing commercial uses into nodes at the intersections of Broadway Road/Mesa Drive and Broadway Road/Horne, as well as integrating multiple residential uses into the adjacent neighborhoods. The proposed redevelopment of the site for office and multiple residence use will contribute to the vitality of the neighborhood. The proposed site plan also shows improving the sidewalks and streetscape along the adjacent streets to conform to the Central Main Street Area Plan recommendations.

Zoning District Designations:

The subject property is zoned Limited Commercial (LC) and Multiple Residence (RM-2). Per Section 11-6-2 of the City of Mesa Zoning Ordinance (MZO), the proposed office and multiple residence uses are permitted in the LC District subject to Section 11-31-31 of the MZO: Additional Development Standards for Residential Uses in Commercial Districts. Per Section 11-31-31(A) of the MZO, residential uses are permitted in the LC District with a minimum of 40 percent of the Gross Floor Area (GFA) reserved for non-residential uses; a minimum of 65 percent of the ground floor of the building reserved for non-residential uses; and a maximum residential density not to exceed 25 dwelling units per acre. The portion of the building within the LC District complies with this criterion having 41.9% of the GFA reserved for non-residential uses; 67.7% of the ground floor area (2,472± square feet) reserved for non-residential uses; and a maximum residential density of 5.4 dwelling units per acre. Per Section 11-5-2 of the MZO, multiple residence uses with a maximum density of 15 dwelling units per acre are permitted in the RM-2 District.

Site Plan and General Site Development Standards:

The subject site is located on the southwest corner of East Broadway Road and South Pioneer. The proposed site plan shows construction of a 16,032 square foot, two-story building containing offices and nine multiple residence units. The proposed site plan also shows construction of a new driveway access to the site from Broadway Road. Currently, there is an existing driveway access from Pioneer onto the property. This existing driveway on Pioneer will be repositioned to provide access to the south side of the project. The Planning applications for this project were submitted prior to the MZO text amendments, effective February 10, 2020, and reviewed subject to the development standards of the previous MZO. The site plan shows construction of 100 square feet of private open space per unit and 1,500± square feet of common open space which conforms to Section 11-5-5(C) of the MZO. The common open space is centrally located adjacent to the west side of the building. Overall, the request conforms with the review criteria for site plans outlined in Section 11-69-5 of the MZO.

Development Incentive Permit (DIP):

There is no site plan case history on the site. According Maricopa County's historical aerial photos, the site was developed in the late 1940s or early 1950s and does not conform to the City's current setback and landscaping requirements. As a result of the nonconformity and in conjunction with the subject request, the applicant is requesting approval of a Development Incentive Permit (DIP) to allow modifications to certain development standards to accommodate the redevelopment of the property. Per section 11-72 of the MZO, the intent of the DIP is to provide incentives for the development of smaller tracts of land that would have difficulty meeting current MZO development standards.

As stated, the site plan, as proposed, does not conform to certain current MZO development standards. Specifically, requirements for building setbacks, perimeter landscape areas, parking lot landscape islands, and on-site parking requirements. The requested DIP will be reviewed by the Board of Adjustment on May 6, 2020. Planning staff will update the Planning and Zoning Board about the decision of the BOA during the scheduled Study Session on May 13, 2020.

Design Review:

The City's Design Review Board is scheduled to review the proposed elevations for the building and landscape design on May 12, 2020.

Surrounding Zoning Designations and Existing Use Activity:

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| <p>Northwest (Across Broadway Road)</p> <p>LC Existing Commercial</p> | <p>North (Across Broadway Road)</p> <p>GC and LC Existing Commercial</p> | <p>Northeast (Across Broadway Road and Pioneer)</p> <p>LC Existing Single Residence</p> |
| <p>West LC and RM-2 Existing Commercial and Single Residences</p> | <p>Subject Property LC and RM-2 Existing vacant church and Accessory Residence to be removed</p> | <p>East (Across Pioneer) LC and RM-2 Existing church</p> |
| <p>Southwest RM-2 Existing Multiple Residence</p> | <p>South RM-2 Existing Multiple Residence</p> | <p>Southeast (Across Pioneer) RM-2 Existing Single Residence</p> |

Compatibility with Surrounding Land Uses:

The subject site is zoned for commercial and multiple residence uses. The north portion of the property, adjacent to Broadway Road, is zoned LC and is adjacent to existing commercial development to the west, and to the north, across Broadway Road. The southern portion of the property is zoned RM-2 and is adjacent to single residence uses to the west side and a multiple residence use to the south side. There is a church located on the east side of the Pioneer. The proposed office and multiple residence uses are commensurate with a mix of commercial and residential uses adjacent to the site.

Neighborhood Participation Plan and Public Comments:

The applicant completed a Citizen Participation Process, which included mailing letters to property owners within 1,000-feet of the site, as well as registered neighborhoods within 1 mile of the site inviting them to a neighborhood meeting held on December 20, 2018.

According to the applicant, 11 neighbors attended the meeting. The majority of attendees expressed opposition to the development. The Citizen Participation Plan contains a summary of the questions and comments from the neighborhood meeting. The topics discussed at the meeting include the following:

- Questions about the Foster Arizona and the foster care system.
- Concerns about the proposed use and more multiple residence units in the neighborhood:
The existing RM-2 District allows a maximum of 15 dwelling units per acre and per the allowances of Section 11-31-31 of the MZO, the existing LC District allows up to a maximum of 25 dwelling units per acre. The request proposes nine dwellings.
- Concerns about the proposed building height and other site planning issues:
The building setback from the south and west property lines meet the RM-2 and LC District MZO requirements for a two-story structure. A landscape buffer of 16-feet is proposed along the west property line.
- Impact of overflow parking on Pioneer:
A total of 22 parking spaces are provided on-site. The applicant explained that the number of on-site parking spaces is excessive given that the Foster Arizona participants are provided a bike and do not have the financial means to own cars.

Staff received several comments/concerns from surrounding property owners. Copies of the correspondence received by Staff is included in the Planning and Zoning packet information for reference. In response to the residents' concerns, the applicant held a "virtual meeting" on Thursday, April 30, 2020, with the interested neighbors to address their concerns. Neighbors who attended the April 30, 2020, virtual meeting reiterated similar comments/concerns to those expressed during the previous neighborhood meeting. A summary of the April 30, 2020, virtual meeting is included in the Citizen Participation Report.

Staff will provide the Board with any new information during the scheduled Study Session on May 6, 2020.

Staff Recommendations:

The subject request is consistent with the General Plan and meets the review criteria for Site Plan Review approval outlined in Section 11-69-5 of the MZO. The request also complies with the criteria outlined in Section 11-31-31 of the MZO for residential uses in the LC District; therefore, staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

Conditions of Approval:

1. Compliance with the final site plan submitted.
2. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
3. Prior to application for a building permit, receive approval through the Board of Adjustment for a Development Incentive Permit to allow modification to certain development standards of the Mesa Zoning Ordinance.
4. Compliance with all requirements of Design Review.

Exhibits:

Exhibit 1-Staff Report

Exhibit 2-Vicinity Map

Exhibit 3- Application Information

- 3.1 Project Narrative
- 3.2 Site Plan/Preliminary Plat
- 3.3 Landscape Plan
- 3.4 Elevations

Exhibit 4- Citizen Participation Report

- 4.1 Citizen Correspondence