



PLANNING DIVISION
STAFF REPORT

City Council Hearing

September 23, 2019

CASE No.: **ZON19-00322**

PROJECT NAME: **Broadstone Dobson Ranch**

Owner's Name:	TIC Dobson Ranch, LLC Etal.
Applicant's Name:	Brennan Ray, Burch and Cracchiolo, P.A.
Location of Request:	Within the 1600 through 1700 blocks of South Dobson Road (west side) and within the 2000 block of West Isabella Avenue (north side). Located west of Dobson Road and south of US 60.
Parcel No(s):	305-02-422
Request:	Rezone from Limited Commercial (LC) Planned Area Development (PAD) LC-PAD to Multiple Residence 4 (RM-4) Planned Area Development (PAD); and Site Plan Review. This request will allow for the development of a multiple residence development.
Existing Zoning District:	Limited Commercial (LC) Planned Area Development (PAD)
Council District:	3
Site Size:	10 ± acres
Proposed Use(s):	Multiple residence
Existing Use(s):	Hotel and restaurant (Dobson Ranch Inn and Fiesta Bar and Grill)
P&Z Hearing Date(s):	August 14, 2019/ 4:00 p.m.
Staff Planner:	Evan Balmer, AICP
Staff Recommendation:	APPROVAL with Conditions
Planning and Zoning Board Recommendation:	Approval with conditions
Proposition 207 Waiver Signed:	Yes

HISTORY

On **March 6, 1972**, the City Council annexed 1,768± acres from Maricopa County including the 10± acre subject property and zoned the subject property to Limited Commercial (C-2) within the Dobson Ranch Development Master Plan (Ordinance# 732).

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Background

The site is currently developed as a hotel (the Dobson Ranch Inn) and a restaurant (Fiesta Bar and Grill). The City's records show the site was constructed in the 1970s. According to the applicant, the occupancy rate of the hotel has substantially diminished, hence the need to redevelop the site with a more suitable use for the location. The requested rezoning is to allow a multi-residential use on the property.

General Plan Character Area Designation and Goals

The General Plan Character area designation on the property is Neighborhood Suburban. Per Chapter 7 of the General Plan, the focus of the Neighborhoods designation is a character type that provide a safe place for people to live where they can feel secure and enjoy their surrounding community. Within the suburban subtype, as part of a total neighborhood area, this character type may also contain areas of duplexes and other multi-residence properties and commercial uses along arterial frontages and at major street intersections. While the predominant building height within the suburban subtype is one and two stories, there will be areas with three- and four-story buildings where higher density development is appropriate. Residential Multiple Dwelling 4 (RM-4) is listed as a secondary use within the suburban subtype. The proposed project is consistent with the General Plan. Staff also reviewed the request and determined it is consistent with the criteria for review of development outlined in Chapter 15 (pg. 15-1) of the Mesa 2040 General Plan.

Zoning District Designations

The request includes rezoning of the property from Limited Commercial (LC) Planned Area Development (PAD) to Multiple Residence District 4 (RM-4) with a PAD Overlay to modify certain development standards on the property. The applicant is also requesting a site plan review.

Per Section 11-5-1 of the Zoning Ordinance, the purpose of the multiple residence districts is to provide for a variety of housing types. Appropriate types of dwelling units in the multiple residence districts include small-lot single residences, townhouses, cluster housing and multiple residence housing. The proposed use of the property for a multiple residence development will be consistent with the purpose of the RM-4 zoning district.

Planned Area Development (PAD) Overlay – MZO Article 3, Chapter 22:

The Planned Area Development (PAD) overlay request is to allow modifications to certain required standards for development of the property. The overlay is also to allow innovative design and flexibility that create high-quality development for the site.

Table 1 below shows the MZO required standards, the applicant's proposed PAD standards, and staff recommendations:

Table 1

RM-4 Development Standards	Required	Proposed	Staff Recommendation
Maximum Height	40'	52'*	As proposed
Minimum Yards			
Street Facing Side Setback (Dobson Road)	30'	20'	As proposed
Interior Side Setback (west property line)	15' per story	5'	As proposed
Rear Setback (US Highway 60)	15' per story	6'	As proposed
Landscape Setback			
Street Facing Side (Dobson Road)	30'	20'	As proposed
Interior Side Setback (west property line)	20'	5'	As proposed
Rear Setback (US Highway 60)	30'	5'	As proposed
Minimum Private Open Space			
Studio/One Bedroom	60 square feet	50 square feet	As proposed
Two Bedroom	100 square feet	70 square feet	As proposed
Minimum Private Open Space Dimensions			
Ground Level	10'	6'	As proposed
Above Ground	8'wide X 6' deep	8'wide X 4.5' deep	As proposed
Required Parking	2.1 spaces per unit	1.6 spaces per unit	As proposed

*Building Type 2 only

As shown on the table above, the applicant is requesting deviations from the RM-4 zoning district development standards:

Maximum Height:

Section 11-5-5 of the MZO allows a maximum building height of 40 feet in the RM-4 zoning district. The applicant is requesting the maximum height of the development to be 52 feet. The height increase to 52 feet would apply to the Type 2 buildings as identified on the site plan. The location of the property at the intersection of a major arterial road (Dobson Road) and a freeway (US Highway 60) makes it suitable and appropriate to allow such a higher height. Additionally, the subject property is below the grade of the US Highway 60 offramp to Dobson Road, which offset the proposed increase in height.

Building and Landscape Setbacks:

The next deviation is for a reduction in the required building and landscape setbacks for the street facing side (Dobson Road), interior side (west property line), and the rear (US Highway 60). Section 11-5-5 of the MZO requires a 30-foot building and landscape setback along Dobson Road, a 15 foot per story setback between the building and the property line and a 20 foot landscape area along the west property line, and a 15 foot per story setback between the building and the property line and a 30 foot landscape area along US Highway 60. The applicant is requesting a reduction from the required building and landscape setbacks from 30 feet to 20 feet along Dobson Road, from a 15 feet per story building setback and a 20 foot landscape setback to 5 feet on the west side of the property, and from a 15 feet per story and 30 foot landscape setback to 6 feet on the rear property line adjacent to US Highway 60. According to the applicant, the

reductions are to accommodate development of the property and its proximity to the US Highway 60.

Private Open Space:

The applicant is requesting two deviations for reductions to the minimum private open space. Section 11-5-5 of the MZO requires 60 square feet of private open space for studio and one-bedroom units and 100 square feet of private open space for two-bedroom units. Section 11-5-5 of the MZO also requires minimum dimensions for private open space. For ground floor units a minimum dimension of 10 feet is required for both the width and depth of the private open space. Private open space areas above the ground floor are required to be 8 feet in width and 6 feet in depth. The applicant is requesting a reduction from 60 square feet of private open space to 50 square feet of private open space for studio and one-bedroom units and a reduction from 100 square feet of private open space to 70 square feet of private open space for two-bedroom units. The applicant is also requesting a reduction in the minimum private open space dimension for ground floor units from 10 feet to 6 feet and a reduction in the minimum private open space dimensions above the ground floor from 8 feet wide and 6 feet deep to 8 feet wide and 4.5 feet deep. The applicant has indicated that the reductions to the private open space requirements allow for greater flexibility to allow multiple patio configurations and increased interior space in some units.

Parking Spaces:

Section 11-32-3 of the MZO requires multiple residence developments to provide 2.1 parking spaces per unit. According to the applicant and the provided site plan, 178 of the 288 proposed units will be studios type of apartment and one-bedroom units; and that the reduced number of bedroom count per unit would result in a lower parking demand. The applicant has also provided a parking study prepared by a professional engineer to support this justification.

In exchange for the requested deviations and opportunity to create a well-designed and integrated community, the applicant is providing enhanced open space and recreational amenities within the development. Section 11-5-5 of the Mesa Zoning Ordinance requires common open space to provide sufficient amenities (e.g. seating, recreation facilities, ramadas, shade, etc.) to encourage or invite one or more uses by the resident of the development. The applicant is exceeding this requirement by providing enhanced open space amenities including a pool and spa with cabanas, fitness center, outdoor lounge with an outdoor kitchen, event lawn and dog park.

Site Plan and General Site Development Standards:

The subject site is approximately 10 acres in size. The applicant is proposing 12 buildings with an amenity area in the middle of the development. The leasing office and garage building along the west property line will be a single story and the three carriage buildings along the north and west property lines will be two stories in height. The site plan also shows three residential buildings to be constructed close to the intersection of Dobson Road and Isabella Avenue. These building will be three stories in height. All the remaining five buildings shown on the site plan will be four stories in height. Overall, the development will consist of 288 units that consist of 49 studio units, 129 one-bedroom units and 110 two-bedroom units. The site plan shows development of open space between the buildings with a central amenity area. Additionally, there will be a dog park

located on the north side of the development. The site plan also shows pedestrian connectivity from all buildings to the central amenity area.

The application documents also show the proposed floor plans and elevations for the development.

Surrounding Zoning Designations and Existing Use Activity:

Northwest US Highway 60	North US Highway 60	Northeast (Across Dobson Road) RM-4-PAD Multiple Residence
West RM-2-PAD Attached Single Residence	Subject Property LC-PAD Dobson Ranch Inn and Fiesta Bar and Grill	East (Across Dobson Road) LC-PAD Commercial
Southwest RS-6-PAD Single Residence	South RS-6-PAD Single Residence	Southeast (Across Dobson Road) RS-6-PAD Single Residence

Compatibility with Surrounding Land Uses:

The subject site is surrounded by a mix of uses including commercial, single-residence and multiple-residence. The proposed multiple residence development will be compatible with the surrounding uses.

Neighborhood Participation Plan and Public Comments:

The applicant held a neighborhood meeting on June 19, 2019. Property owners within 1,000 feet, HOA's within ½ mile, and registered neighborhoods within 1 mile were invited via mail to attend the meeting. Additionally, a representative for the applicant went door to door to residents within 500 feet of the subject site to discuss the proposed development. According to the applicant, thirty-seven (37) residents attended the meeting. The major comments discussed at the meeting included the following:

- Access to the site
- Additional traffic generated,
- Timing of the signal at Dobson Road and Isabella Avenue
- Potential impact to the school district from additional families moving into the proposed development
- The location of the four-story buildings
- Proposed amenities for the site
- Residents utilizing the Dobson Ranch amenities
- The number of residents anticipated for the development
- Amount of parking provided
- Timing of construction

As of writing this report, staff has been contacted by two residents to express opposition to the proposed multiple-residence development. The first resident was concerned about the

additional traffic the project would generate. The second resident was concerned about the residents of the new development utilizing the Dobson Ranch amenities.

Updated Neighborhood Participation Plan and Public Comments:

After the Planning and Zoning Board hearing staff was contacted by an additional resident, Cynthia Dunham, who expressed concerns with this proposed development. Her concern is with a potential over concentration of apartments in the area and an imbalance between owner occupied and rental units in the west Mesa area.

Staff Recommendations:

The subject request is consistent with the General Plan and meets the review criteria for Site Plan Review outlined in Section 11-69-5 and for Planned Area Development overlays outlined in Section 11-22-5 of the MZO; Therefore, staff recommends approval of the request with the following conditions:

Conditions of Approval:

1. Compliance with final site plan submitted.
2. Compliance with all requirements of Design Review.
3. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations, except as modified in Table 1 in the staff report.
4. Buildings labeled Type 2 on the site plan shall comply with the following:
 - A. The maximum height allowed is 52 feet.
 - B. At least two sides of each building shall have Hardie Plank siding, similar in material and design as Building Type 1, that covers a minimum of two floors.
5. Windows with pop-out trim shall be flush with the wall plane or recessed from the wall plane.
6. The railing on each balcony shall incorporate a view fence material as shown on Building Type 1. The maximum height of stucco finishes on balconies shall be 2 feet 6 inches.
7. The color palette for all buildings shall consist of two principal colors and one accent color.