# mesa az

# **Planning and Zoning Board**

# Meeting Minutes

Held in the City of Mesa Council Chambers – Upper Level Date: September 19, 2018 Time: 4:00 p.m.

#### **MEMBERS PRESENT:**

Chair Michelle Dahlke
Vice Chair Dane Astle
Tim Boyle
Shelly Allen
Deanna Villanueva-Saucedo
Jeffrey Crockett

#### **STAFF PRESENT:**

John Wesley
Tom Ellsworth
Lesley Davis
Lisa Davis
Cassidy Welch
Ryan McCann
Charlotte McDermott
Rebecca Gorton

#### **MEMBERS ABSENT:**

Jessica Sarkissian

#### **OTHERS PRESENT:**

Ken Holman Dave Holman Mindy Hill Larry Wheat Deborah Wheat Lynn Burnham Rebecca Torok Mike Wright Derek Brosemann W. Dea Montague Stephanie Wright Tanya Collins Jerry Earles Ben Layton Joshua Bachar Other citizens who did not sign

#### Call Meeting to Order.

Chair Dahlke declared a quorum present and the meeting was called to order at 4:08 pm.

Take action on all consent agenda items.

#### Items on the Consent Agenda

- 2. <u>Approval of minutes:</u> Consider the minutes from the August 14, 2018, and August 15, 2018 study sessions and regular hearing.
- \*2-a It was moved by Vice Chair Astle to approve the Consent Agenda. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Boyle.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Boardmember Sarkissian, absent)

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed: AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Boyle, Allen, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo NAYS – None

Zoning Cases: ZON17-00597, ZON18-00454, ZON18-00362, ZON17-00441, ZON18-00469, ZON18-00508, ZON18-00361; ZON18-00470; and ZON18-00510; and; Preliminary Plats: "Longbow Marketplace Phase II", "Montelucia" and "Mesa Germann Business Park".

\* \* \* \* 1

\*3-a ZON17-00597 District 2. 1961 South Val Vista Drive. Located on the northeast corner of Val Vista Drive and Baseline Road. (1± acres). Site Plan Modification. This request will allow a multi-tenant commercial building with a drive-thru. Thomas English Real Estate, LLC, applicant; Circle K Stores, Inc., owner. (Continued from August 15, 2018)

<u>Planner:</u> Wahid Alam Request by applicant to Table

**Summary:** This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Vice Chair Astle and seconded by Boardmember Boyle to table case ZON17-00597.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Boardmember Sarkissian, absent)
Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:
AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Boyle, Allen, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo
NAYS – None

\* \* \* \* 1

\*3-b ZON18-00454 District 3. The 1200 block of South Country Club Drive (west side).

Located on the west side of Country Club Drive south of Southern Avenue. (11.8 ± acres). Site Plan Review. This request will allow for the development of a restaurant with a drive-thru. Trish Flower, Vertical Design Studios, applicant; 1250 Country Club Dr, LP, owner. (Continued from August 15, 2018)

<u>Planner:</u> Ryan McCann Continuance to October 17, 2018

**Summary:** This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed

on an individual basis.

It was moved by Vice Chair Astle and seconded by Boardmember Boyle to continue case ZON18-00454 to October 17, 2018.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Boardmember Sarkissian, absent)
Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:
AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Boyle, Allen, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo
NAYS – None

\* \* \* \* \*

\*3-c ZON18-00362 District 6. Within the 6400 and 6500 blocks of South Mountain Road (west side). Located on the west side of Mountain Road and north of Pecos Road. (51± acres). Site Plan Modification; and a Special Use Permit for parking reduction. This request will allow for the expansion of an existing industrial facility. Bobby Magness, Weiss., Magness Architects, applicant; Fuji Electronic Materials, USA, Inc., owner.

<u>Planner:</u> Wahid Alam <u>Staff Recommendation:</u> Approval with conditions

**Summary:** This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Vice Chair Astle and seconded by Boardmember Boyle to approve case ZON18-00362 with conditions:

# That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON18-00362 conditioned upon:

- 1. Compliance with the basic development as described in the project narrative, and as shown on the site plan and landscape plan submitted.
- 2. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
- 3. Compliance with all requirements of zoning case # Z17-002, except as modified by this approval.
- 4. Compliance with all requirements of Design Review.
- 5. Prior to issuance of a building permit, enter into an amendment to the Development Agreement recorded on the property to address issues such as phasing of development and to reference the amended site plan.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Boardmember Sarkissian, absent)
Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:
AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Boyle, Allen, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo
NAYS – None

\*\*\*\*

\*3-d ZON18-00441 District 6. Within the 3800 block of South Sossaman Road (east side). Located south of Elliot Road on the east side of Sossaman Road. (16± acres). Site Plan Review. This request will allow for the development of a RV and boat storage facility. Winton Architects, applicant; Timothy Quigley, owner.

Planner: Wahid Alam

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

**Summary:** This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Vice Chair Astle and seconded by Boardmember Boyle to approve case ZON18-00441 with conditions:

# That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON18-00441 conditioned upon:

- 1. Compliance with the basic development as shown on the site plan, landscape plan and preliminary elevations submitted.
- 2. Site Plan Review through the public hearing process of future development plans.
- 3. Compliance with all requirements of Design Review.
- 4. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
- 5. Prior to submittal of a building permit, submit a revised site plan for review and acceptance by the Planning Director that includes the following items:
  - a. Relocate the 8' tall screen wall located along the northern edge of the retention basin, that is located in the middle of the site, to the southern edge of the retention basin. This wall must be constructed in the first phase of development.
  - b. Remove the proposed 8' tall screen wall that is located along Sossaman Road and the south property line.
- 6. All off-site improvements and street frontage landscaping to be installed in the first phase of construction.
- In the first phase of construction, provide extruded concrete curbing and a 5foot-wide landscape area along the undeveloped edge(s) per Section 11-33-2:
   L.
- 8. Compliance with all requirements of Chapter 19 of the Zoning Ordinance including:
  - a. Owner granting an Avigation Easement and Release to the City, pertaining to Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport which will be prepared and recorded by the City (concurrently with the recordation of the final subdivision map or prior to the issuance of a building permit).
  - b. Written notice be provided to future property owners, and acknowledgment received that the project is within 5 mile(s) of Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport.

- c. Due to the proximity to Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport, any proposed structure is subject to an FAA filing for review in conformance with CFR Title 14 Part 77.9, (form 7460), to determine any effect to navigable airspace, air navigation facilities. A completed form with response by the FAA must accompany building permit application for structures on this property.
- d. Documentation by a registered Professional Engineer or registered Professional Architect demonstrating compliance with noise level reductions required by Section 11-19-5 prior to issuance of a building permit.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Boardmember Sarkissian, absent)
Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES - Dahlke, Astle, Boyle, Allen, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS - None

\* \* \* \* \*

\*3-e ZON18-00469 District 2. 6758 East University Drive. Located on the northwest corner of University Drive and Power Road. (1± acres). Site Plan Modification. This request will allow for the development of a restaurant with a drive-thru. Eric Gerster, Sustainability Engineering Group, applicant; University 6758, ŁLC, owner.

Planner: Ryan McCann

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

**Summary:** This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed on

an individual basis.

It was moved by Vice Chair Astle and seconded by Boardmember Boyle to approve case ZON18-00469 with conditions:

# That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON18-00469 conditioned upon:

- 1. Compliance with the basic development as shown on the site plan, landscape plan, and preliminary elevations, except as modified below.
- 2. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
- 3. Compliance with all requirements of Design Review.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Boardmember Sarkissian, absent)

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES - Dahlke, Astle, Boyle, Allen, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS - None

\* \* \* \* \*

\*3-f ZON18-00508 District 5. The 5800 block of East Longbow Parkway (north side). Located north of McDowell Road and west of Recker Road. (10.3± acres). Site Plan Review. This request will allow for the development of an indoor commercial recreation facility. Drew Yarnell, TK Architects International, applicant; Dover Associates, LLC, owner. (Companion case to preliminary plat "Longbow Marketplace Phase II", associated with item \*5-a).

**Planner: Lesley Davis** 

**Staff Recommendation:** Approval with conditions

Summary:

This case was discussed with preliminary plat "Longbow Marketplace Phase II" and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Vice Chair Astle and seconded by Boardmember Boyle to approve case ZON18-00508 with associated preliminary plat "Longbow Marketplace Phase II" with conditions:

#### That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON18-00508 conditioned upon:

- 1. Compliance with the basic development as shown on the site plan, landscape plan, and preliminary elevations, except as modified below.
- 2. Site Plan Review through the public hearing process of future development plans.
- 3. Compliance with all conditions of approval for Z08-063.
- 4. Compliance with all requirements of Design Review.
- 5. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
- 6. Compliance with all requirements of the Subdivision Regulations.
- 7. Dedicate the right-of-way and easements required under the Mesa City Code at the time of recordation of the subdivision plat.
- 8. Prior to issuance of a building permit, record an easement on the vacant property to the west that provides shared access to and maintenance of the shared driveway located along the western property line.
- 9. Compliance with all requirements of Chapter 19 of the Zoning Ordinance including:
  - a. Owner granting an Avigation Easement and Release to the City, pertaining to Falcon Field Airport, which will be prepared and recorded by the City (concurrently with the recordation of the final subdivision map or prior to the issuance of a building permit).
  - b. Due to the proximity to Falcon Field Airport, any proposed structure is subject to an FAA filing for review in conformance with CFR Title 14 Part 77.9, (form 7460), to determine any effect to navigable airspace, air navigation facilities. A completed form with response by the FAA must accompany building permit application for structures on this property.
  - c. Documentation by a registered Professional Engineer or registered Professional Architect demonstrating compliance with noise level reductions required by Section 11-19-5 prior to issuance of a building permit.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Boardmember Sarkissian, absent) Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES - Dahlke, Astle, Boyle, Allen, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS - None

\* \* \* \* \*

\*4-a ZON18-00361 District 4. 244 North Extension Road. Located east of Alma School Road south of University Drive. (3± acres). Council Use Permit for social service facility; and Special Use Permit for a parking reduction for a substance abuse social service facility. This request will allow an in-patient substance abuse treatment facility. Lindsay C. Schube, Gammage & Burnham, applicant; Crossroads, Inc., owner. (Continued from August 15, 2018)

Planner: Ryan McCann

Request by applicant for continuance to October 17, 2018

**Summary:** This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed

on an individual basis.

It was moved by Vice Chair Astle and seconded by Boardmember Boyle to continue case ZON18-00361 to October 17, 2018.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Boardmember Sarkissian, absent)

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES - Dahlke, Astle, Boyle, Allen, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS - None

\* \* \* \*

\*4-b ZON18-00446 District 4. Within the 600 block of West Pepper Place (south and north sides) and 0 block of North Date (west side north of Pepper Place). Located north of Main Street and west of Country Club Drive. (3.5± acres). Rezoning from RM-2 to RM-3-PAD; and Site Plan Review. This request will allow for the development of an attached single-residence subdivision. Perlman Architects of AZ, applicant; Chicanos Por La Causa, LLC, owner. (Companion case to preliminary plat "Mesa Royale", associated with item \*5-b).

Planner: Lisa Davis

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

#### Summary:

Staffmember Lisa Davis presented case ZON18-00446 to the Board. Ms. Davis stated this request is for redevelopment of an attached single-residence subdivision. Ms. Davis stated approximately 30 residents attended the neighborhood meeting and staff has received emails from some of the neighbors asking questions. Ms. Davis explained there will be 2-story buildings on the north side of Pepper Place and 3-story buildings on the south side. She explained the project is within the West Main Street Area Plan and the Central Main Street Area Plan.

Lindsay Schube, Gammage and Burnham, 2 N. Central Avenue, spoke as the applicant. Ms. Schube explained CPLC is the 4<sup>th</sup> largest non-profit organization in Arizona. There are 56 for sale units, surrounded by single family residences on Pepper Street. Ms. Schube explained this project will be going before the Design Review Board for final review and recognize the importance of working with staff.

Resident Larry Wheat, 601 W. 1<sup>st</sup> Street spoke about his concern that the windows on the 2-story units will be facing into his back yard. Mr. Wheat asked if those windows could be removed.

Deborah Wheat, 601 W. 1<sup>st</sup> Street stated she is opposed to the project unless the windows could be removed from the 2<sup>-</sup>story units on the back side looking over their property.

Lindsay Schube responded to the citizen comments. Ms. Schube stated the windows are in the stair well and not in living space. She stated windows are important for safety to see the surrounding area and for natural light. Ms. Schube stated they will work with staff to address this issue. Vice Chair Astle suggested looking into obscure type of opaque glass that allows natural light with no direct view of the back yard. Boardmember Boyle suggested the use of trees for blocking the back yard.

Architect Nate Mackey, 4808 N. 24<sup>th</sup> Street, discussed where the windows are placed on the floor plan of the units facing the single family homes. Mr. Mackey stated they will look at some options and work with the Wheat family to discuss alternatives.

Boardmember Boyle stated he likes this project and glad the units are for sale. Mr. Boyle stated he was happy CPLC has the project. He stated his concern is with the design and wants to see a modern look. Mr. Boyle stated he wants the City to see the future Mesa, not the historical Mesa in design.

Boardmember Allen commended the developer for this project as this site presents a lot of restraints. Ms. Allen stated design is important and they look for different types of projects.

It was moved by Boardmember Villanueva-Saucedo to approve case ZON18-00446 with the associated preliminary plat "Mesa Royale". The motion was seconded by Boardmember Allen.

# That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON18-00446 conditioned upon:

- Compliance with the project narrative Proposed PAD modifications on pages 15 through 19, the basic development as shown on the site plan and preliminary plat submitted, except as modified below (without guarantee of lot yield, building count, lot coverage).
- 2. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations, except as modified for the Proposed PAD.
- 3. Compliance with all requirements of Design Review.
- 4. Compliance with all requirements of the Subdivision Regulations.
- 5. Prior to submitting for Subdivision Technical Review, submit for Planning Director review and acceptance:
  - a. Project Narrative revisions:
    - Revise Proposed PAD modifications table beginning on page 15 of the project narrative by incorporating Staff recommendation changes identified in bolded blue of Table 1 of the staff report.
  - b. Site Plan revisions:
    - Remove the seven hammerhead parking spaces and turn arounds at the end of the private drives and replace them with landscaping. The private drive must extend past the end of the buildings.
    - ii. Install a wrought iron or view fence at the north side of Building A that extends to the masonry wall.
  - c. Landscape plan revisions: removal of the shrubs along the north and south property lines.
- Incorporate Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED) design principles, into the project. The CPTED design principles must be reviewed and approved by the City's Crime Prevention Officer.
- 7. Include a note on the subdivision plat, and a provision in the CC&R's, that the homeowner's association established for the property must maintain the landscaping in the common areas and all external lights and security cameras on the property.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Absent: Boardmember Allen)

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES - Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS - None



\*\*\*\*

\*4-c ZON18-00470 District 6. The 200 block of North Signal Butte Road (east side) and the 10800 block of East Mercury Drive (south side). Located south of University Drive on the east side of Signal Butte Road. (5± acres). Rezoning from RS-9 to RSL-2.5-PAD; and Site Plan Review. This request will allow for the development of a single-residence subdivision. Mark Funk, Funk Family Enterprises, applicant; Funk Family Enterprises, owner. (Companion case to preliminary plat "Montelucia", associated with item \*5-c).

<u>Planner:</u> Cassidy Welch <u>Staff Recommendation:</u> Approval with conditions

Summary: This case was discussed with preliminary plat "Montelucia" and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Vice Chair Astle and seconded by Boardmember Boyle to approve case ZON18-00470 with associated preliminary plat "Montelucia" with conditions:

#### That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON18-00470 conditioned upon:

- Compliance with the basic development as shown on the site plan, elevations and floor plans (without guarantee of lot yield, building count, lot coverage except as modified below:
- 2. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations, except as modified in Table 1 of the staff report.
- Dedicate the right-of-way and easements required under the Mesa City Code at the time of application for a building permit, at the time of recordation of the subdivision plat, or at the time of the City's request for dedication whichever comes first.
- 4. All off-site improvements and street frontage landscaping to be installed in the first phase of construction.
- 5. Compliance with all requirements of the Subdivision Regulations.
- 6. The side wall return shall be set back a minimum of 15' from the front of the livable portion of the house and 15' from the front of the garage for lots that side on an interior or landscape tract.
- 7. Prior to submittal of a permit application for a masterplan, or any modifications to an approved masterplan, submit for review and acceptance by the Planning Director elevations and floor plans that demonstrate:
  - a. Compliance with the Building Form Standards outlined in Chapter 5 of the Mesa Zoning Ordinance and the Residential Development Guidelines;
  - Use of architectural enhancements, such as windows, recesses, shutters, or metal accents applied to elevations that are located adjacent to the street or an open space; and,
  - c. Use of a variety of real building materials and finishes on the exterior of the homes, such as wood or quality wood synthetic, shutters, stone, and/or metal to create interest through color, material and texture.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Absent: Boardmember Allen)
Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:
AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo
NAYS – None

\*\*\*\*

\*4-d ZON18-00510 District 6. Within the 1700 and 1800 blocks of South Crismon Road (west side). Located west of Crismon Road north of Baseline Road. (8.5± acres). Rezoning to amend existing conditions of approval; Site Plan Modification; and a Special Use Permit for assisted living. This request will allow for the development of a continuum care facility. Overland Development, applicant; West of 3rd, LLC, owner. (Companion case to preliminary plat "Three Fountains Senior Living Facility", associated with item \*5-d).

Planner: Wahid Alam

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Summary: This case was discussed with preliminary plat "Three Fountains Senior

Living Facility" and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Vice Chair Astle and seconded by Boardmember Boyle to approve case ZON18-00171 with associated preliminary plat "Three Fountains Senior Living Facility" with conditions:

#### That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON18-00510 conditioned upon:

- 1. Compliance with the basic development as shown on the site plan, landscape plans and elevations, except as modified below:
- 2. Site Plan Review through the public hearing process of future development plans.
- 3. Compliance with all requirements of Design Review.
- 4. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
- All limits of construction shall have temporary landscaping, extruded curbs, and screen walls where parking and loading/service areas are visible from the right of way.
- 6. Compliance with all requirements of the Subdivision Regulations.
- 7. Prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, install required landscaping for the entire length of the property facing Crismon Road.
- 8. Provide direct pedestrian connection from the main entrance of the facility to the sidewalk along Crismon Road.
- 9. Compliance with all requirements of zoning case Z07-051, except as modified by this approval.
- 10. Compliance with all requirements of Chapter 19 of the Zoning Ordinance including:
  - a. Owner granting an Avigation Easement and Release to the City, pertaining to Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport which will be prepared and recorded by the City (concurrently with the recordation of the final subdivision map or prior to the issuance of a building permit).
  - b. Written notice be provided to future property owners, and acknowledgment received that the project is within 5 mile(s) of Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport.
  - c. Due to the proximity to Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport, any proposed structure is subject to an FAA filing for review in conformance with CFR Title 14 Part 77.9, (form 7460), to determine any effect to navigable airspace, air navigation facilities. A completed form with response by the FAA must accompany building permit application for structures on this property.

d. Documentation by a registered Professional Engineer or registered Professional Architect demonstrating compliance with noise level reductions required by Section 11-19-5 prior to issuance of a building permit.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Absent: Boardmember Allen)
Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:
AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo
NAYS – None

\*\*\*

\*5-a "Longbow Marketplace Phase II" District 5. The 5800 block of East Longbow Parkway (north side). Located north of McDowell Road and west of Recker Road. (10.3± acres). Preliminary Plat. D. Yarnell, TK Architects International, applicant; Dover Associates, LLC, owner. (Companion case to ZON18-00508, associated with item \*3-f).

<u>Planner:</u> Lesley Davis
<u>Staff Recommendation:</u> Approval with conditions

**Summary:** This case was discussed with case ZON18-00508 and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Vice Chair Astle and seconded by Boardmember Boyle to approve preliminary plat "Longbow Marketplace Phase II" with associated case ZON18-00508 with conditions:

# That: The Board recommends the approval of preliminary plat "Longbow Marketplace Phase II" conditioned upon:

- 1. Compliance with the basic development as shown on the site plan, landscape plan, and preliminary elevations, except as modified below.
- 2. Site Plan Review through the public hearing process of future development plans.
- 3. Compliance with all conditions of approval for Z08-063.
- 4. Compliance with all requirements of Design Review.
- 5. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
- 6. Compliance with all requirements of the Subdivision Regulations.
- 7. Dedicate the right-of-way and easements required under the Mesa City Code at the time of recordation of the subdivision plat.
- 8. Prior to issuance of a building permit, record an easement on the vacant property to the west that provides shared access to and maintenance of the shared driveway located along the western property line.
- 9. Compliance with all requirements of Chapter 19 of the Zoning Ordinance including:
  - a. Owner granting an Avigation Easement and Release to the City, pertaining to Falcon Field Airport, which will be prepared and recorded by the City (concurrently with the recordation of the final subdivision map or prior to the issuance of a building permit).
  - b. Due to the proximity to Falcon Field Airport, any proposed structure is subject to an FAA filing for review in conformance with CFR Title 14 Part 77.9, (form 7460), to determine any effect to navigable airspace, air navigation facilities. A completed form with response by the FAA must accompany building permit application for structures on this property.
  - c. Documentation by a registered Professional Engineer or registered Professional Architect demonstrating compliance with noise level reductions required by Section 11-19-5 prior to issuance of a building permit.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Boardmember Sarkissian, absent)
Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:
AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Boyle, Allen, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo
NAYS – None

\* \* \* \* 1

\*5-b "Mesa Royale" District 4. Within the 600 block of West Pepper Place (south and north sides) and 0 block of North Date (west side north of Pepper Place). Located north of Main Street and west of Country Club Drive. (3.5± acres). Preliminary Plat. Perlman Architects of AZ, applicant; Chicanos Por La Causa, LLC, owner. (Companion case to ZON18-00446, associated with item \*4-a).

**Planner: Lisa Davis** 

**Staff Recommendation:** Approval with conditions

Summary: This was discussed with case ZON18-00446 and therefore was not

discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Boardmember Villanueva-Saucedo to approve case preliminary plat "Mesa Royle" with the associated case ZON18-00446. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Allen with conditions:

# That: The Board recommends the approval of preliminary plat "Mesa Royale" conditioned upon:

- Compliance with the project narrative Proposed PAD modifications on pages 15 through 19, the basic development as shown on the site plan and preliminary plat submitted, except as modified below (without guarantee of lot yield, building count, lot coverage).
- 2. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations, except as modified for the Proposed PAD.
- 3. Compliance with all requirements of Design Review.
- 4. Compliance with all requirements of the Subdivision Regulations.
- 5. Prior to submitting for Subdivision Technical Review, submit for Planning Director review and acceptance:
  - a. Project Narrative revisions:
    - Revise Proposed PAD modifications table beginning on page 15 of the project narrative by incorporating Staff recommendation changes identified in bolded blue of Table 1 of the staff report.
  - b. Site Plan revisions:
    - i. Remove the seven hammerhead parking spaces and turn arounds at the end of the private drives and replace them with landscaping. The private drive must extend past the end of the buildings.
    - ii. Install a wrought iron or view fence at the north side of Building A that extends to the masonry wall.
  - c. Landscape plan revisions: removal of the shrubs along the north and south property lines.
- Incorporate Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED) design
  principles, into the project. The CPTED design principles must be reviewed and
  approved by the City's Crime Prevention Officer.
- 7. Include a note on the subdivision plat, and a provision in the CC&R's, that the homeowner's association established for the property must maintain the landscaping in the common areas and all external lights and security cameras on the property.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Absent: Boardmember Allen)

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES - Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS - None

\*\*\*\*

\*5-c "Montelucia" District 6. The 200 block of North Signal Butte Road (east side) and the 10800 block of East Mercury Drive (south side). Located south of University Drive on the east side of Signal Butte Road. (5± acres). Preliminary Plat. Mark Funk, Funk Family Enterprises, applicant; Funk Family Enterprises, owner. (Companion case to ZON18-00470, associated with item \*4-b).

Planner: Cassidy Welch

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

**Summary:** This was discussed with case ZON18-00470 and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Vice Chair Astle and seconded by Boardmember Boyle to approve preliminary plat "Montelucia" and associated case ZON18-00470 with conditions:

# That: The Board recommends the approval of preliminary plat "Montelucia" conditioned upon:

- 1. Compliance with the basic development as shown on the site plan, elevations and floor plans (without guarantee of lot yield, building count, lot coverage except as modified below:
- 2. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations, except as modified in Table 1 of the staff report.
- Dedicate the right-of-way and easements required under the Mesa City Code at the time of application for a building permit, at the time of recordation of the subdivision plat, or at the time of the City's request for dedication whichever comes first.
- 4. All off-site improvements and street frontage landscaping to be installed in the first phase of construction.
- 5. Compliance with all requirements of the Subdivision Regulations.
- 6. The side wall return shall be set back a minimum of 15' from the front of the livable portion of the house and 15' from the front of the garage for lots that side on an interior or landscape tract.
- 7. Prior to submittal of a permit application for a masterplan, or any modifications to an approved masterplan, submit for review and acceptance by the Planning Director elevations and floor plans that demonstrate:
  - a. Compliance with the Building Form Standards outlined in Chapter 5 of the Mesa Zoning Ordinance and the Residential Development Guidelines;
  - Use of architectural enhancements, such as windows, recesses, shutters, or metal accents applied to elevations that are located adjacent to the street or an open space; and,
  - c. Use of a variety of real building materials and finishes on the exterior of the homes, such as wood or quality wood synthetic, shutters, stone, and/or metal to create interest through color, material and texture.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Absent: Boardmember Allen)

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES - Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS - None



\*5-d "Three Fountains Senior Living Facility" District 6. Within the 1700 and 1800 blocks of South Crismon Road (west side). Located west of Crismon Road north of Baseline Road. (8.5± acres). Preliminary Plat. Overland Development, applicant; West of 3rd, LLC, owner. (Companion case to ZON18-00510, associated with item \*4-c).

**Planner: Wahid Alam** 

**Staff Recommendation:** Approval with conditions

**Summary:** This was discussed with case ZON18-00510 and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Vice Chair Astle and seconded by Boardmember Boyle to approve preliminary plat "Three Fountains Senior Living Facility" with associated case ZON18-00171 with conditions:

# That: The Board recommends the approval of preliminary plat "Three Fountains Senior Living Facility" conditioned upon:

- 1. Compliance with the basic development as shown on the site plan, landscape plans and elevations, except as modified below:
- 2. Site Plan Review through the public hearing process of future development plans.
- 3. Compliance with all requirements of Design Review.
- 4. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
- 5. All limits of construction shall have temporary landscaping, extruded curbs, and screen walls where parking and loading/service areas are visible from the right of way.
- 6. Compliance with all requirements of the Subdivision Regulations.
- 7. Prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, install required landscaping for the entire length of the property facing Crismon Road.
- 8. Provide direct pedestrian connection from the main entrance of the facility to the sidewalk along Crismon Road.
- 9. Compliance with all requirements of zoning case Z07-051, except as modified by this approval.
- 10. Compliance with all requirements of Chapter 19 of the Zoning Ordinance including:
  - a. Owner granting an Avigation Easement and Release to the City, pertaining to Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport which will be prepared and recorded by the City (concurrently with the recordation of the final subdivision map or prior to the issuance of a building permit).
  - b. Written notice be provided to future property owners, and acknowledgment received that the project is within 5 mile(s) of Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport.
  - c. Due to the proximity to Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport, any proposed structure is subject to an FAA filing for review in conformance with CFR Title 14 Part 77.9, (form 7460), to determine any effect to navigable airspace, air navigation facilities. A completed form with response by the FAA must accompany building permit application for structures on this property.

d. Documentation by a registered Professional Engineer or registered Professional Architect demonstrating compliance with noise level reductions required by Section 11-19-5 prior to issuance of a building permit.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Absent: Boardmember Allen)

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES - Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS - None

\* \* \* \* \*

"Mesa Fiesta" District 3. The 1300 block of South Alma School Road (east side). \*5-e Located south of Southern Avenue on the east side of Alma School Road (16.51± acres). Preliminary Plat. Nick Johnson, Sunrise Engineering, applicant; HV & Canal, LLC, owner. (ZON18-00604).

Planner: Cassidy Welch

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Summary: Staffmember Cassidy Welch presented the preliminary plat "Mesa Fiesta" to the Board. Ms. Welch stated this plat is request is for a preliminary plat for an existing commercial center to allow for private ownership.

> Boardmember Crockett stated his concern to allow more private ownership in an area that is being redeveloped. Mr. Corckett stated redevelopment works better when there are fewer owners and not more.

Boardmember Boyle stated he has the same concerns. Planning Director John Wesley stated he understands the concerns and often we encourage combining smaller parcels into larger ones in older areas. Mr. Welsey explained we are limited to denying this unless the applicant does not meet technical requirements for subdivision and this applicant meets all of the requirements. There was discussion regarding whether or not the Board can deny the request.

It was moved by Boardmember Crockett and seconded by Boardmember Boyle to continue preliminary plat "Mesa Fiesta" to the October 17, 2018 meeting to allow the applicant to present their request.

Vote: 6-0 to continue to October 17, 2018 (Boardmember Sarkissian, absent) Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES - Dahlke, Astle, Boyle, Allen, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS - None

\*5-f "Mesa Germann Business Park" District 6. The 7200 through the 7600 blocks of South Ellsworth Road (west side). Located north of the of Elliot Road on the west side of Ellsworth Road (79± acres). Preliminary Plat. Jeffrey Blilie, Beus Gilbert, PLLC, applicant; Sunbelt Land Holdings, LP, owner. (ZON18-00555)

Planner: Lesley Davis

Staff Recommendation: Approval with conditions

**Summary:** This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed on an individual basis.

It was moved by Boardmember Allen and seconded by Boardmember Boyle to approve preliminary plat "Mesa Germann Business Park" with conditions:

# That: The Board recommends the approval of preliminary plat "Mesa Germann Business Park" conditioned upon:

- 1. Compliance with the basic development as shown on the preliminary plat submitted (without guarantee of lot yield, building count, lot coverage).
- 2. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
- 3. Site Plan Review through the public hearing process of future development plans.
- 4. Compliance with all requirements of the Subdivision Regulations.
- 5. All street improvements and street frontage landscaping to be installed in the first phase of construction.
- 6. Compliance with all conditions of approval of Z04-001.
- 7. Owner granting an Avigation Easement and Release to the City, pertaining to Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport which will be prepared and recorded by the City concurrently with the recordation of the final subdivision map and prior to the issuance of a building permit.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Absent: Boardmember Allen)

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES - Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS - None

\*\*\*\*

**6-a Mesa East Redevelopment Area Plan** Consider and make recommendations to the Mesa City Council for approval on the proposed East Redevelopment Area Plan.

Planner: Tom Ellsworth

Staff Recommendation: Approval

Summary: Principal Planner, Tom Ellsworth, presented an overview of the Mesa

East Redevelopment Area Plan to the Board. Mr. Ellsworth stated this is a significant tool to help improve these areas in Mesa which has seen

blithe and to spur development. David Packard with Economic

Development presented a detailed description of the plan to the Board.

It was moved by Boardmember Allen and seconded by Vice Chair Astle to approve the **Mesa East Redevelopment Area Plan**.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Absent: Boardmember Allen)

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES - Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS - None

\* \* \* \* \*

**6-b Mesa West Redevelopment Area Plan** Consider and make recommendations to the Mesa City Council for approval on the proposed Mesa West Redevelopment Area Plan.

**Planner: Tom Ellsworth** 

Staff Recommendation: Approval

**Summary:** Principal Planner, Tom Ellsworth, presented an overview of the Mesa

West Redevelopment Area Plan to the Board. Mr. Ellsworth stated this is a significant tool to help improve these areas in Mesa which has seen blithe and to spur development. David Packard with Economic

Development presented a detailed description of the plan to the Board.

It was moved by Vice Chair Astle and seconded by Boardmember Allen to approve the **Mesa West Redevelopment Area Plan**.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Absent: Boardmember Allen)

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES - Dahlke, Astle, Sarkissian, Boyle, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS - None

\* \* \* \*

7-a ZON18-00509 District 1. 860 North Center Street. Located east of Country Club Drive south of Brown Road. (1.7± acres). Council Use Permit for social service facility; and a Special Use Permit for parking reduction. This request will allow for an in-patient substance abuse detoxification and treatment center. Sam Bohannon, Ingram Civil Engineering, applicant; Summit BHC Mesa, LLC, owner.

<u>Planner:</u> Ryan McCann <u>Staff Recommendation:</u> Approval with conditions

#### Summary:

Staffmember Ryan McCann presented case ZON18-00361 to the Board. Mr. McCann stated this request will allow for an in-patient substance abuse and detox treatment facility. He explained the City Zoning Ordinance identifies this type of use as a social service and requires the approval of a Council Use Permit. This facility has been operating as a substance abuse facility for approximately 17 years as a legal non-conforming use and is requesting the addition of the in-patient detox treatment facility.

Mr. McCann stated the applicant held a neighborhood meeting with approximately 13 residents in attendance and staff has been contacted by two citizens voicing concerns discussed at the study session. This is an existing site with a pedetrian gate to the neighborhood. In response to concerns voiced by the surrounding neighbors, the applicant will be restricting the access through the gate to only emergency response personnel.

Mr. McCann explained the applicant has requested a Special Use Permit for reduction in parking. Mr. McCann stated staff reviewed the proposal for parking reduction and found it complies with the standard requirements outlined in the City Ordinance.

City Attorney Charlotte McDermott reviewed criteria for recommending a Council Use Permit and the procedure for the Board to make a motion. Ms. McDermott explained the decision on whether or not to grant the CUP is an adminstrative act which means their descretion is limited to the guidelines set by City Code. The Mesa Zoning Ordinance establishes four criteria which can be considered outlined in the staff report. Ms. McDermott reminded the Board the facility will serve people recovering from drug and alcohol addiction and the applicant may be able to assert some Fair Housing protection.

Ralph Pew, 1744 S. Val Vista, spoke for the applicant. Mr. Pew explained to the Board this is a high-end treatment facility and does not treat court ordered patients or on probation. Mr. Pew explained the facility had been in operation for 17 years as a transitional facility for women to live while recovering from addiction and the residents were allowed to come and go as they wanted.

Mr. Pew explained this is a legal non-conforming facility that Summit took over one year ago. He explained the care and treatment at the facility is different than the women's facility was. Mr. Pew stated no one comes in off the street and most clients come from out of the area. The patients are picked up and brought to the site, having already been through detox. The treatment is roughly a 30 day plan and no one leaves the campus unless they are released by the facility and taken to their destination.

Mr. Pew requested consideration of the reduction in parking as 97% of their patients will not have cars and the majority of the families to those patients live out of the area and do not visit. Mr. Pew stated the visiting hours are staggered with each individual building having specific times and days for visitors. He addressed concerns over the concentration of Council Use Permits in the area and stated the CUP will be for one building. Mr. Pew stated there are no similar sites within 3 miles of this property and feels this is not a concentration of the area. He explained there are two Council Use Permits within one mile of the building for a Charter School and a medical training facility.

Boardmember Crockett inquired how the change for building 8 would effect the number of patients. Mr. Pew responded the number of patients for detox is less than if it were used for other treatment per state licensing requirements. Mr. Crockett inquired how many professionals will be working there and Mr. Pew responde approximately 25 which includes part-time and visiting medical professionals.

Boardmember Boyle inquired how patients are transported to or away from the facility. Mr. Pew responded patients do not leave without a staff member. Joanna Shapiro, CEO, 860 N. Center, responded anytime they have a patient that are either admitting or discharging they provide concierge service. Ms. Shapiro stated staff would either pick them up or take them to their destination, never by taxi or other form of public transportation. There was discussion regarding an increase of crime surrounding the neighboring areas. Ms. Shapiro reminded the Board patients at this facility are on a voluntary program.

Lynn Burnham, 1062 W. 4<sup>th</sup> Place, is opposed to the request. Mr. Burnham stated his concern of the amount of facilities concentrated in the West Mesa area.

Rebecca Torok, 50 W. 9<sup>th</sup> Place, spoke in opposition to the request. Ms. Torok spoke as an owner of a multi-family building and is concerned that she only recently received notification of the proposal and is concerned with an increase of crime and property values.

Mike Wright, 629 W. Caballero Circle, spoke in opposition to the request. Mr. Wright's concern is the concentration of social services in the area.

Derek Brosemann, 639 W. Contessa Circle, spoke in opposition to the request. Mr. Brosemann feels West Mesa has an increase of concentration of social service facilities in the area. Mr. Brosemann stated social service facilities bring an increase of crime to the area and request the Board deny the request until social services are re-evaluated.

W. Dea Montague, 553 N. Orange spoke in opposition. Mr. Montague inquired what is the definition of over concentration in an area. He feels this does not meet the General Plan requirements and stated 90% of the social service facilities are concentrated in the West Mesa area.

Stephanie Wright, 660 N. Date, spoke in opposition. Ms. Wright stated social service facilities are out of balance with an over concentration in West Mesa.

Tanya Collins, 864 W. 10<sup>th</sup> Street, is opposed to the project and did not speak.

Jerry Earles, 61 W. 9<sup>th</sup> Street, spoke in opposition. Mr. Earles feels the locked gate will not prevent patients from going into their neighborhood and spoke about the previous residents that were able to go into the neighborhood and able to loiter.

Joshua Bachar, no address provided, is opposed to the project and did not speak.

Ben Layton, 736 E. 6<sup>th</sup> Place, spoke in opposition. Mr. Layton stated there is an over concentration of social services and would like to see the City adopt a more clean plan on how to handle these proposals in the future.

Ralph Pew responded to the comments from the residents. Mr. Pew stated some of the comments focused on the language of "area" in the General Plan. Mr. Pew stated there are no other facilities similar to this one within 3 miles. He stated to deny this request is denying 8-10 people a place to go for recovery.

Boardmember Boyle asked Mr. Pew to clarify that they cannot stop the patients from leaving. He stated this is a voluntary facility and not the same as the previous facility where the women were allowed to come and go as desired. Mr. Pew reminded the Board staff will be bringing patients to and from the facility and will not be allowed to come and go as they please. Mr. Pew stated in theory, a patient could leave if they chose to, and reminded the Board this facility has been run for a year now without incident.

Planning Director John Wesley stated in Chapter 70 of the Mesa Zoning Ordinance on Council Use Permits, it sets the parameters staff looks at for a CUP. Mr. Wesley stated the General Plan and concentration of an area is one of the items staff looks at when making a recommendation. There was discussion regarding distance separation and definintions of types of uses and facilities within the City of Mesa.

Chair Dahlke stated she does not like using a project or applicant as an example when there is a larger issue which cannot be addressed immediately. Ms. Dahlke feels we should look at our policies and receive direction on how to address these items in the future. Mr. Wesley informed the Board sober living ordinance and regulations in reference to group housing were recently raised to Council. He stated the City is in the process of hiring a consultant to review this portion of our code and maybe this subject can be looked into at the same time.

Boardmember Crockett stated there is an existing use at this site currently and if the CUP is not approved, the applicant will continue the social service facility as is. Mr. Crockett agrees there is a need for future conversation regarding concentration soon. He feels this is a good project and will be a good neighbor.

Boardmember Allen agrees that this is an existing facility and has been for over 17 years. Ms. Allen feels the improvements that have been made over the past year since this applicant has taken over the facility has helped the neighborhood and people are not coming and going as before. Ms. Allen stated she also wants to begin the conversation on concentration within the next month or two for all of Mesa.

Vice Chair Astle stated he believes together we can come up with a better solution for these concerns. Mr. Astle feels since the facility has been existing, he is in support of the request.

Boardmember Boyle stated there has not been a discussion from the Board on how this fits in to the General Plan. Mr. Boyle stated it is does not fit in the General Plan. He stated this is concentrating additional services in an area that has the majority of this type of services; does not fit in the surrounding area as it is within a residential area; and the General Plan states crime is higher around this type of services. Mr. Boyle asked when does the City stop approving these types of services so we can have direction on how to proceed. Mr. Boyle suggested a continuance until there is strong criteria for the Board to make better decisions.

Boardmember Villanueva-Saucedo stated she considers everything that comes forward to this Board and does not "rubber stamp" anything. Ms. Villanueva-Saucedo feels this is an existing service now and with and for

the time it has been in place she will be voting for approval. She will continue to reiterate they do not have clear clarification what over concentration is and will continue to call for a robust discussion on what this means. She feels the conversation needs to go beyond the Planning and Zoning Board.

It was moved by Boardmember Allen and seconded by Boardmember Crockett to approve case ZON18-00361 with conditions:

#### That: The Board recommends the approval of case ZON18-00361 conditioned upon:

- 1. Compliance with the plan of operation, as described in the Council Use Permit project narrative, and the good neighbor policy.
- 2. Conformance with the site plan, landscape plan and elevations approved in case Z96-073.

Vote: 5-1 Approved (Boardmember Sarkissian, absent) Upon tabulation of vote, it showed: AYES – Dahlke, Astle, Allen, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo NAYS – Boyle

& Zoning Roard Meetings are availa

#### 6 Other Business.

None.

# 7 Adjournment.

Vice Chair Astle made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 6:28 pm. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Allen.

Vote: 6-0 Approved (Boardmember Sarkissian, absent)

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES - Dahlke, Astle, Boyle, Allen, Crockett, Villanueva-Saucedo

NAYS - None

Respectfully submitted,

John D. Wesley AICP, Secretary

Planning Director