

## Board of Adjustment

### *Staff Report*

**CASE NUMBER:** BA16-033-CSP (PLN2016-00448)  
**LOCATION/ADDRESS:** 2840 E Main Street  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:** 2  
**PLANNER:** Lisa Davis, Planner II  
**OWNER:** Red Mountain Asset Fund I  
**APPLICANT:** Welker Development Resources-Jeff Welker

**REQUEST:** *Requesting a Special Use Permit (SUP) for a Comprehensive Sign Plan (CSP) in the LC zoning district.*

#### **SUMMARY OF APPLICANT'S REQUEST**

Requesting a Special Use Permit (SUP) for a Comprehensive Sign Plan (CSP) for a commercial center proposed to be redeveloped at 2840 E Main Street in the Limited Commercial (LC) zoning district. The SUP for the Comprehensive Sign Plan proposes 4 detached monument signs and sign criteria for attached signs for the inline tenants and pad buildings adjacent to Main Street. The proposed CSP is requesting a maximum of 280 square feet (SF) of sign area and allowance of 4 attached signs which is far above the allowed 160 SF of sign area and maximum number of 3 signs allowed per the Mesa Zoning Ordinance (MZO).

#### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends approval of the SUP for the Comprehensive Sign Plan for case BA16-033-CSP, conditioned upon the following:

- 1. Compliance with the comprehensive sign plan submitted, except as modified by the conditions listed below.*
- 2. Any additional signage not identified with this Sign Plan will require modification to this Special Use Permit.*
- 3. Compliance with all requirements of the Development Services Division with regard to the issuance of sign permits.*
- 4. Major A, an anchor tenant, shall be limited to 240 SF of aggregate sign area and 3 signs maximum.*
- 5. Major B, an anchor tenant, shall be limited to 200 SF of aggregate sign area and 3 signs maximum.*
- 6. All minor tenants shall be limited to a maximum total of 160 SF of aggregate sign area and sign number allowed per MZO.*
- 7. The Jack in the Box monument sign shall still be considered a nonconforming sign for purposes of replacement. In the event the City issues a building permit, a sign permit, or this Jack-in-the-Box building applies to change the existing certificate of occupancy, the condition of issuing the permits or changing to certificate of occupancy shall specify and require that all non-conforming signs be removed, in conformance with Section 11-41-8.E.7. Any detached signs shall conform with the pad sign design, M2, as shown in this sign plan.*

#### **SITE CONTEXT**

**CASE SITE:** Existing large format retail center (former K-mart) – zoned LC  
**NORTH:** Existing RV Park – zoned RM-4  
**EAST:** Existing retail center- zoned LC  
**SOUTH:** (Across Main Street) Existing commercial – zoned GC  
**WEST:** (Across Lindsay Road) Existing commercial – zoned LC

### PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Development Standard	Overall Commercial site	Project Scope for Phase 1 SCIP
Site area	11.8± acre	6± acre
Building area	128,508 SF	85,201 SF
Code required minimum parking	343 spaces	214 spaces
Parking provided	626 spaces	298 spaces

### STAFF SUMMARY AND ANALYSIS

At the August Board of Adjustment meeting a SCIP was approved as part of case BA16-033 and the SUP for the Comprehensive Sign Plan was continued to the September 7, 2016 Board of Adjustment meeting. To give a brief history, the 11 ± acre overall commercial corner at the northeast corner of Lindsay Road and Main Street was developed in the mid-1970's. The K-mart building was approved, Z74-057, and constructed first. The SCIP was approved for Phase 1 identified as 6± acres to repurpose the Kmart 85,201 square feet (SF) building into 4 suites, 2 anchor tenants and 2 minor tenants.

The proposed Main & Lindsay Center CSP includes two detached sign designs and criteria for attached signs based on the tenant space area for the 11.8± acre site. The existing non-conforming pole signs for Kmart will be removed and replaced with the proposed monument signs with the redevelopment of this project. Three future pad sites and the existing Jack in the Box pad are included in the plan.

#### Detached Signs

The proposed Comprehensive Sign Plan (CSP) proposes a total of four detached multi-tenant signs with two different sizes proposed, M1 and M2. Two Main Multi-Tenant Identification Signs, sign type M1-Max 12' high, are proposed to be placed adjacent to Main Street and adjacent to Lindsay Road. One 12' high sign, M1, will be placed adjacent to each street frontage. One of the Pad Tenant Identification signs, M2 also multi-tenant, are proposed to be placed adjacent to each street frontage for a total of 2 signs. Referring to the proposed site plan note for the Jack in the Box, the existing pole sign is proposed to remain in place until the lease expires. According to the narrative provided it is approximately 3 years. Staff has added a stipulation requiring the Jack in the Box sign to be replaced within three years as indicated on the site plan. All detached monument signs have a maximum of 12' in height and 80 SF in area.

Table 1 below shows the calculations for the allowed detached sign height and area based on the street frontage, and total proposed with the CSP:

**Table 1**

Frontage	Total sign height allowed for center	Total sign area for center allowed	Proposed number of signs	Proposed area
800' of Main Street	40'	400 SF	2 signs 1 M1 at 12' & 1 M2 at 8' totaling 20'	2 signs 1 at 70 SF & 1 at 35 SF totaling 105 SF
720' at Lindsay Road	36'	360 SF	2 signs 1 M1 at 12' & 1 M2 at 8' totaling 20'	80 SF 2 signs 1 at 70 SF & 1 at 35 SF totaling 105 SF

The future jack in the Box pad sign should be consistent with the height and design of the other pad signs. This would add an additional 35 SF and 8' in height for a total of 28' in height and 140 SF of sign area for detached sign which is still under the total area and height allowed for the commercial center. All proposed

detached signs utilize a coordinated design theme and upgraded materials that are consistent with the proposed elevations that has been submitted for administrative Design Review approval. No detached sign is proposed to exceed the maximum allowed 12 feet in height or 80 square feet in area.

### Attached Signs

The attached sign area proposed is based on the size of the tenant space for the in line shops and the pad sites adjacent to Main Street. The proposal includes three categories of in line tenants, Anchor, Minor Tenant and Shop tenant. The pad sites are proposed to have their own category of attached sign. Table 2 below shows the proposed attached sign area and number compared to code allowances:

**Table 2**

Category	Code requirements Max Sign Area	Code requirements Max Number of Signs	Proposed Max Sign Area	Proposed Max Number of Signs
<b>Anchor Tenants</b> 20,000 SF or more	2.0 SF/linear foot of building frontage Max. 160 SF aggregate	> 100 feet building frontage – 3 signs	2.0 SF/linear foot of building frontage -Max 280 SF aggregate	4 signs
<b>Minor Tenants</b> Between 5,000SF and 19,999 SF	2.0 SF/linear foot of building frontage Max. 160 SF aggregate	< 100 feet building frontage – 2 signs	2.0 SF/linear foot of building frontage -Max 200 SF aggregate	2 signs- 3 for endcap users
<b>Shop Tenants</b> Inline tenants under 5,000 SF	2.0 SF/linear foot of building frontage Max. 160 SF aggregate	< 100 feet building frontage – 2 signs	2.0 SF/linear foot of building frontage -Max 160 SF aggregate	2 signs-3 for endcap users
<b>Pad Building</b> Tenants- all future pad buildings and the existing Jack in the Box	2.0 SF/linear foot of building frontage Max. 160 SF aggregate	< 100 feet building frontage – 2 signs > 100 feet building frontage – 3 signs	2.0 SF/linear foot of building frontage -Max 160 SF aggregate	4 signs/ max of 1 per elevation

The CSP has specific information on the 4 suites that will be moving into the re-purposed Kmart building. Ross Store is at the corner that will have visibility to Main Street and to Lindsay Road. As shown in Table 3 below, the proposed sign area for the specific users are shown along with staff recommendation:

**Table 3**

Category	Proposed Sign area	Proposed number	Staff recommendation Max sign area	Staff recommendation Max sign number
<b>Ross</b> Anchor Tenant	230.75 SF aggregate	3 signs	240 SF Max	Per code requirements
<b>Big Lots</b> Anchor Tenant	178.78 SF aggregate	1 sign	200 SF Max	Per code requirements
<b>Melrose</b> Minor Tenant	176.64 SF aggregate	1 sign	160 SF Max	Per code requirements
<b>Shoe Dept.</b> Minor Tenant	80 SF aggregate	1 sign	160 SF Max	Per code requirements

The CSP is proposing that all Anchor tenants be allowed to have a maximum of 4 signs, rather than the allowed 3 and a maximum of 280 SF, maximum of 160 SF allowed per the Mesa Zoning Ordinance (MZO). The applicant is requesting the larger attached sign areas to accommodate the over 450' that the building is set back from Main Street. Staff does support the larger Anchor Tenants to have more than the maximum 160 SF allowed by the MZO. Although comparing the sign areas and numbers for the actual users (i.e. Ross, Big Lots) to the requested area and number in the plan, the area and number of the depicted actual user signs are much less than the 4 signs and 280 SF of area proposed in the plan. The proposed three signs for Ross at both the Main Street elevation and the Lindsay Road elevation total are only 230.7 SF in area. This is within the criteria staff is proposing for the site. The only attached sign that would need to be modified is

the Melrose Family Fashions that would need to be reduced to about 92% of the proposed sign. The sign could be reduced from 27' wide to 24.5 feet wide approximately.

The proposed CSP is generally consistent with the Sign Ordinance. As justification for the increase in attached sign area the applicant has noted 1) that the building is setback over 450' from Main Street; 2) this is a redevelopment site and more sign area is a benefit for users. 3) the sign criteria is tailored to the development to include contemporary detached sign design that will be consistent for all detached signs; 4) and the sign criteria is consistent with and will not be detrimental to the surrounding neighborhood.

### **FINDINGS**

- 1.1** The CSP establishes consistent detached sign design, size and height.
- 2.1** The CSP proposes two detached signs adjacent to Main Street and two detached signs adjacent to Lindsay Road. No proposed detached sign exceeds 12 feet in height or 80 square feet in area.
- 3.1** The proposed detached sign design for all four of the signs is consistent in size, colors and material with the proposed elevations for the repurposed Kmart building.
- 4.1** The proposed placement of the detached signs is more than 50' apart.
- 5.1** The existing repurposed Kmart building is setback more than 450' from Main Street.
- 6.1** The original commercial center was constructed in the mid-1970's.
- 7.1** The proposed CSP is largely consistent with current Code requirements and is complimentary to adjacent development and consistent with the use of the property. Therefore, the CSP, with the recommended conditions, will be compatible with, and not detrimental to, adjacent properties or the neighborhood in general.

### **ORDINANCE REQUIREMENTS**

#### Zoning Ordinance, Section 11-19-5 – Definition of Terms:

*SPECIAL USE PERMIT (S.U.P.):* A discretionary authorization issued by the Zoning Administrator/Board of Adjustment only upon finding, through a public hearing, that the proposed activity permitted by such Special Use Permit is in conformance with the intent of this Code, the General Plan and/or other specified plans or Council policies; and will be compatible with, and not detrimental to, adjacent properties or the neighborhood in general; and may be limited by specific conditions, restrictions, terms or time periods.

#### Zoning Ordinance, Sec. 11-41-6 – Signs Permitted By Zoning District:

(E) NC, LC, GC, PEP, LI, GI, HI and PS Districts

1. Attached Signs:

- (a) Occupancies with less than one hundred (100) front feet: Two (2) signs for each occupancy not to exceed two (2) square feet of total sign area for each front foot of building occupancy.
- (b) Occupancies with more than one hundred (100) front feet: Three (3) signs for each occupancy not to exceed two (2) square feet of total sign area for each front foot of building occupancy.
- (c) Total attached signage shall not exceed one hundred sixty (160) square feet per occupancy.
- (d) Attached signage shall not extend horizontally a distance greater than fifty percent (50%) of the width of the building wall on which it is displayed, except for buildings containing multiple occupancies.
- (e) Each occupancy shall be permitted at least twenty-four (24) square feet of attached signage.
- (f) Occupancies having no exterior wall parallel to a fronting street shall be permitted signage based on two (2) square feet of sign area for each lineal foot of exterior wall of the front of such occupancy.

- (g) Occupancies having an exterior building wall parallel to more than one fronting street shall be permitted signage based on the longer parallel wall. Signage placed on the shorter parallel exterior wall shall not exceed two (2) square feet of area per front foot of building occupancy of such shorter parallel wall, and this area shall be subtracted from the total allowable sign area.
  - (h) Attached signage shall be located on the specific occupancy identified therein and is not transferable from one occupancy to another.
2. Detached Signs:
- (a) One (1) square foot of total sign area per lineal foot of street frontage.
  - (b) One (1) foot of total sign height per each ten (10) feet of street frontage.
  - (c) Developments, including group C-O-I developments, displaying more than one (1) detached sign per street frontage shall be permitted fifty percent (50%) of total aggregate sign area and sign height specified in (a) and (b) above.
  - (d) No detached sign shall exceed eighty (80) square feet in area or twelve feet (12') in height.

Zoning Ordinance, Sec. 11-41-8 (D) – Supplemental Provisions:

13. A Comprehensive Sign Plan for a proposed or existing development/building may be approved by the Zoning Administrator/Board of Adjustment in conjunction with the granting of a Special Use Permit under Title 11, Administration and Procedures Chapter of the Mesa City Code. The purpose of a Comprehensive Sign Plan is to provide for the establishment of signage criteria that are tailored to a specific development or location, and which may vary from specific Ordinance provisions. The intent is to provide for flexible sign criteria that promote superior design through architectural integration of the site, buildings and signs.

A Comprehensive Sign Plan shall include the location, size, height, construction material, color, type of illumination and orientation of all proposed signs, either permanent or temporary.

A Comprehensive Sign Plan containing elements which exceed the permitted height, area and number of signs specified in this Chapter may be approved by the Zoning Administrator/Board of Adjustment only upon a finding that:

- (a) The development site contains unique or unusual physical conditions, such as topography, proportion, size or relation to a public street that would limit or restrict normal sign visibility; or
- (b) The proposed or existing development exhibits unique characteristics of land use, architectural style, site location, physical scale, historical interest or other distinguishing features that represent a clear variation from conventional development; or
- (c) The proposed signage incorporates special design features such as logos, emblems, murals or statuary that are integrated with the building architecture.

The construction and placement of individual signs contained in the approved Comprehensive Sign Plan shall be subject to the issuance of sign permits in accordance with 11-41-8 (E).