

## **Towing Service Options**

### **A. City-Owned Storage Lot**

To entertain this option, further time would be required to properly identify and address all issues.

**Description:** Under this concept, the City would provide the storage lot(s) used for towed vehicles; the City or a contracted party would operate the lot(s). Contracted tow companies would tow vehicles to the City lot unless the customer instructs the tow company otherwise (generally a residence or a repair shop).

#### **Pros:**

- Pricing may be controlled by the City as the City could establish both fees for the tow and impound.
- Citizens would have one location to go to claim their vehicle.
- May allow more vendors to participate on City contract.
- Revenues could be realized by the City from sale of unclaimed vehicles.
- City owned impound lot would allow the City to control customer service standards.

#### **Cons:**

- Operational and maintenance costs related to the impound yard and staffing.
- Cost to purchase the land for the impound yard if the land is not already owned by the City.
- Potential loss of other use for City land used as impound yard.
- Cost to secure the lot(s) and make land appropriate for an impound yard.
- Potential insurance costs.
- Depending on the number of vendors permitted to contract with the City for towing to the impound yard, could have a large number of vendors for City staff to monitor and bill for service.

#### **Decision Points:**

This option is not recommended by staff for implementation at this time due to the amount of time necessary to do the research, evaluation, and implementation this option requires before the current towing contract expires. Council could give staff direction to bring back a model for future discussion which then could be implemented for the next contract period.

### **B. Single Vendor**

**Description:** Under this option, staff would issue a Request for Proposals with scored criteria and recommend award to a single vendor to cover the entire City.

#### **Pros:**

- Single point of contact for citizens and City.
- No changes to administrative staffing needs.
- One set of monthly reports and billing for City staff to work with.
- One audit per month for processing and verifying company practices.
- Known, identifiable location(s) of one vendor for citizens to respond to.
- Ability to document/research/resolve issues quicker with less points of contact, meetings, and phone calls made.
- No new protocol for dispatch required.

**Cons:**

- No back up vendor if single vendor is unable to perform services.  
Examples of potential issues:
  - Tow truck(s) break down or company's dispatch notification system fails.
  - Tow company's phone lines down or are unable to be reached.
  - Possible multi-vehicle accident requiring more trucks than available by one vendor.
- Termination of contract with vendor would mean the City would be without towing services until such time as they are able to require a new vendor.

**Decision Points:**

1. 5-Year Term with a single, 5-Year Renewal Option (Recommended).
  - a. Other options are possible for the term.
  - b. A reasonable term will allow vendors to recoup any fixed costs.
2. Pricing: Vendor Proposed (Recommended)
  - a. Under this single vendor option, citizens would see consistent pricing across the City.
  - b. Alternative Option: If the City establishes pricing, it would be based on vendors' recommendations as well as comparable pricing for valley cities.
3. Tow yard location(s) within geographic boundaries of Mesa, including county land surrounded or partially surrounded by Mesa City limits.
4. Maximum response time will be based on Zone (Recommended)
  - a. Zone 1 & 2: 15 Minutes
  - b. Zone 3 & 4: 18 Minutes
5. Minimum number of trucks for vendor: ??

**C. Current Model (Four Vendors Based On Four Geographic Zones)**

**Description:** Under this option, staff would issue a Request for Proposals with scored criteria and recommend award to up to four vendors based on four geographic zones of the City divided by Broadway and Lindsey. (Refer to map for reference - labeled Zone 1, 2, 3, and 4)

**Pros:**

- Multiple vendors can cover other zones if necessary.

- No possibility for a single point of failure as with one vendor providing tow services for the entire City.
- No changes to administrative staffing needs.
- Current patrol operations remain unchanged.
- Has an established working model that has been beneficial to the City, citizens, officers, and staffing for operations.
- No new protocol for dispatch required.

**Cons:**

- Up to four towing vendors for citizens and City staff to deal with.
- Multiple sets of monthly reporting, billing, and audits required.

**Decision Points:**

1. 5-Year Term with one 5-Year Renewal Option (Recommended).
  - a. Other options are possible for the term.
  - b. A reasonable term will allow vendors to recoup any fixed costs.
2. No vendor may have more than two zones, resulting in a minimum of two vendors and a maximum of four vendors who could contract with the City (Recommended)
3. Pricing: Vendor Proposed (Recommended)
  - a. Under this single vendor option, citizens would see consistent pricing across the City.
  - b. Alternative Option: If the City establishes pricing, it would be based on vendors' recommendations as well as comparable pricing for valley cities.
4. Tow yard location(s) within geographic boundaries of Mesa, including county land surrounded or partially surrounded by Mesa City limits.
5. Maximum response time will be based on Zone (Recommended)
  - a. Zone 1: 15 Minutes
  - b. Zone 2: 15 Minutes
  - c. Zone 3: 18 Minutes
  - d. Zone 4: 15 Minutes
6. Minimum number of trucks for vendor: ??

**D. Rotation Based On Three Geographic Zones**

**Description:** Under this option, staff would issue a Request for Qualifications/Proposals with essential and scored criteria. Recommend award to multiple vendors for each zone of the City to be called on a next-up rotation. (Refer to map for reference - labeled Zone A, B, and C)

**Pros:**

- Multiple vendors that can cover other zones if necessary.
- No possibility for a single point of failure as with one vendor providing tow services for the entire City.
- May allow more vendors to participate on City contract.

**Cons:**

- Could be many vendors for citizens and City staff to deal with locating vehicles towed, or resolving complaint issues.
- Multiple audits for processing and verifying company practices.
- There is a risk of impact to patrol operations due to a greater number of vendors, their ability to respond, the large number of calls in the western half of the City, and the large geographic area in the eastern half of the City.
- May impede response times and create more administrative duties to ensure compliance with contract specifications.
- New protocol for dispatch required.

**Decision Points:**

1. 1-Year Term with up to four, 1-Year or multiple-year renewals (maximum term for a vendor would be up to 5 Years) so annual reviews can be done to ensure rotation meets the needs of the City (Recommended).
2. Three Zones. West of Lindsay would be divided into two zones by Broadway. Everything east of Lindsay would be one zone. This mapping scheme balances out the number of tows for each zone based on current numbers. (Recommended)
3. Vendors can submit to participate in one or all zones. (Recommended)
4. Up to six vendors per zone (Recommended)
5. Pricing: City Established (Recommendation)
  - a. Vendor proposed pricing would result in different prices based on the location of the vehicle, and vendor next up on the rotation list.
  - b. If the City establishes pricing, it would be based on vendors' recommendations as well as comparable pricing for valley cities
6. Tow yard location(s) within geographic boundaries of Mesa, including county land surrounded or partially surrounded by Mesa City limits.
7. Maximum response time will be based on Zone (Recommended)
  - a. Zone 1: 15 Minutes
  - b. Zone 2: 15 Minutes
  - c. Zone 3: 20 Minutes
8. Minimum number of trucks for vendor: ??

## **Towing Pricing Options**

Average citizen pays for the Flat Rate per Tow fee and Daily Storage fee for the number of days the vehicle was stored on the vendor's lot. If the vehicle is towed as a result of violating ARS 28-3511 (30 Day Impound Tow), the Daily Storage fee is mandated at \$15.00 per day by statute. The Flat Rate per Tow fee includes the first hour on scene, mileage, tow to the vendor's lot, securing the vehicle, and first 24 hours of storage.

Additional fees listed on the City contract may occur when a tow driver is held longer on scene, possibly due to a multiple vehicle accident creating excessive clean up, resulting in an extra "Hourly Rate" fee. If the citizen requests the vehicle be released to them during a time outside of normal vendor operating hours set by the City's towing contract, it will result in an "Open Lot After Hours" fee. A "Cost Per Mile" fee is assessed to a citizen requesting the vehicle be towed to another location other than the contracted vendor's lot, resulting in the citizen being charged per mile to the requested location, but not to include the "Flat Rate Per Tow" fee. Below is the City of Mesa's average tow rates on the four existing "Police Emergency Tow" contracts:

- Current pricing average on existing contracts:
  - Flat Rate per Tow (light or medium duty) \$19.40
  - Hourly Rate \$70.72
  - Daily Storage (most vehicles) \$14.56
  - Daily Storage (ARS 28-3511 vehicles) \$15.00
  - Open Lot After Hours \$26.35
  - Cost Per Mile \$ 3.72
- Last recommended pricing to be set by the City in 2013 (pricing recommendation based on comparing valley wide contracts with similar specifications):
  - Flat Rate per Tow (light or medium duty) \$30.00
  - Hourly Rate \$60.00
  - Daily Storage (most vehicles) \$20.00
  - Daily Storage (ARS 28-3511 vehicles) \$15.00
  - Open Lot After Hours \$30.00
  - Cost Per Mile \$ 5.00
- Pricing set by vendors upon contract solicitation and award with RFP or RFQ.
- If the City establishes pricing, it would be based on the vendor's recommendations as well as comparable pricing for valley cities.

## **Current Average Tow Truck Response Times per Zone**

- Zone 1 12.1 minutes
- Zone 2 12.9 minutes
- Zone 3 15.9 minutes
- Zone 4 13.6 minutes

## Towing Options Zone Map

