



Planning and Zoning Board

Case Information

CASE NUMBER: Z15-006 (PLN2015-00004)
LOCATION/ADDRESS: 1800 Block South Crismon Road.
GENERAL VICINITY: Located north of Baseline Road on the east side of Crismon Road
REQUEST: Site Plan review for lots 2, 3, 4, and 7 of Crismon Gateway
PURPOSE: This request will allow the development of a retail center.
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 6
OWNER: Carrington Development Richard Richmond
APPLICANT: Architekton-Dane Astle
STAFF PLANNER: Lisa Davis

SITE DATA

PARCEL NUMBER(S): 220-81-963A, 220-81-964, 220-80-965A, 220-81-968A
PARCEL SIZE: 3.8± acres
EXISTING ZONING: LC
GENERAL PLAN Character area: Neighborhoods
CURRENT LAND USE: Vacant

HISTORY/RELATED CASES

Aug. 3, 1987: Annexed 1,119± acres to City (Ord.# 2249).
Oct. 5, 1987: Established comparable of 1,119± acres to City of Mesa Zoning, SR and R1-9. (Z87-066).
June 7, 2004: Rezoned from R1-43 to C-2, Site Plan Review, and preliminary Plat, 51 ± acres (Z04-033).
Oct. 15, 2007: Rezoned from C-2 to C-2-BIZ and Site Plan Review, 24± acres (Z07-093).
May 21, 2012: Approval of rezoning from LC to LC-BIZ (10.4± acres) and from LC BIZ to LC (14.3± acres) Z12-019 Ord. # 5092. Name change from Crismon Commons East to Crismon Gateway.
November 13, 2012: Administrative Site Plan Modification and Design Review approval for 1917 S Crismon-Banner Health Center. (10.4± acres) Z12-019 & DR12-009.
February 10, 2015: Design Review Board work Session for Buildings A & B and landscape review for 3.84± acre site.

SITE CONTEXT

NORTH: (Across Crismon) Crismon Commons West group commercial development – Zoned LC
EAST: Vacant- Lot 6&7 of Crismon Gateway–Zoned LC
SOUTH: Health Center- Banner Phase one – Zoned LC-BIZ
WEST: (Across Crismon) Crismon Commons West group commercial development – Zoned LC

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval with conditions

PLANNING & ZONING BOARD DECISION: ☐ Approval with conditions ☐ Denial ☐ Continuance

PROP-207 WAIVER: ☒ Signed ☐ Not Signed

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Phase I Building A:	12,500 SF
Phase II Building B:	9,500 SF
Future Office Phase II:	24,000 SF, 4-story building
Parking:	Phase I - 46 spaces required, 62 spaces proposed; Phase II - 83 spaces required, 69 spaces proposed Total of both Phases - 129 spaces required, 131 spaces proposed

The site is located north of Baseline Road on the East side of Crismon Road. The applicant is requesting site plan review of a 3.84± acre site and a site plan modification to the overall 24± acre Crismon Gateway project currently zoned Limited Commercial (LC). This project identifies Lots 2, 3, 4 and a portion of 7 of Crismon Gateway, plat attached, for development. This will allow for a proposed two phase project with three buildings totaling 46,000 square-feet. The narrative indicates the retail center will include office, retail, dance studio, restaurants and fast food restaurants. The overall site plan for the Crismon Gateway identifies Banner Health Center is currently located on lot 1 and a future meeting house for the LDS Church (with supporting parking and circulation) occupying lots 5, 6 and a portion of 7. The remaining portion of lot 7 and lot 8 are shown as future development and will require future site plan approval through the Planning and Zoning Board.

Access to the 3.84± acre site occurs with two driveways proposed from Crismon Road. One is the “main” access to the site that bi-sects the site between Buildings A and B. It is identified with a scored concrete drive material and palm trees within the roundabouts. Patios and grade level planters have been incorporated into the site design of Buildings A and B as well as a covered pedestrian walkway. Phase I consists of a 12,500 square-foot commercial retail Building A with two drive-thru facilities proposed. Phase II is identified as the 9,500 square-foot Building B commercial retail building with two drive-thru facilities as well. Phase II is further called out with a 4-story future office building. The 4-story office building will require rezoning to allow the additional height and site plan review through the Planning and Zoning Board prior to construction.

The project did go to a Design Review Board work session on February 10, 2015. The overall color, materials and design of the building were well received. Concern was expressed by the Board members in regard to the circulation of the site with the number of drive-thru facilities and that the visibility into the drive through areas could conflict with pedestrian traffic and be a safety concern. The site plan has been revised following the Design Review meeting.

At the time of the Banner Health Center development, Crismon Gateway accommodated storm water flows associated with a 404 wash. It included channelization of the wash from the point of entry into the site, along the east property line to Baseline Road, then along Baseline Road where it exits the site through an existing culvert at the southwest corner of the site. The channel has to handle significant storm water flows. The channel along the entire Baseline Road frontage was landscaped with the first phase of Banner Health Care development. This channel does not affect the 3.84 acre site plan or development.

Banner Health Center Phase I



Channel for wash along Baseline Road



NEIGHBORHOOD PARTICIPATION

The applicant has completed a Citizen Participation Plan to inform neighboring property owners of the project, solicit feedback, and address any comments or concerns that may arise. The Citizen Participation Plan included a contact list consisting of all registered neighborhoods and homeowners associations within 1,000 feet and all property owners within 500 feet. A neighborhood meeting was not held. The Plan indicates that approximately 300 neighborhood outreach notification letters were mailed on January 20th to the contact lists.

Feedback from the letters included concerns with connection to the Banner Health Center site, which restaurants were going into the center and some were happy to hear the market is beginning to move again. To date, Planning Staff has not received inquiries, phone calls or letters in regard to this project.

CONFORMANCE WITH THE MESA 2040 GENERAL PLAN

The goal of Mesa 2040 General Plan is to establish and maintain neighborhoods and to build a sense of place in neighborhoods and commercial/entertainment districts. Rather than focusing on individual land uses, the Plan focuses on the “character of development in different areas.” Character types combine concepts of land use with building form and intensity to describe the type of area being created through the development that occurs.

This request is within the Character Type of *Neighborhoods* as identified on the Character Area map in the Mesa 2040 General Plan.

Neighborhoods-The primary focus of neighborhoods is to provide safe places for people to live where they can feel secure and enjoy their surrounding community. Neighborhoods can contain a wide range of housing options and often have associated non-residential uses such as schools, parks, places of worship, and local serving businesses. The total area devoted to local serving businesses (commercial and office activities) in one location is generally less than 15 acres and these businesses would typically serve people within a mile radius of the area. Nonresidential areas within neighborhoods should be designed and located to bring people together and to not disrupt the fabric and functioning of the neighborhood as a place where people live.

The General Plan identifies key elements to community development that are important elements of continuing to grow and develop a healthy, sustainable City. The five elements include High quality development, Changing demographics, Public health, Urban design and place-making, and Desert environment. These key elements have been considered in the development of the vision statements, guiding principles, goals, policies and strategies contained in the General Plan have been reviewed and appear to have the potential to promote the following goals, policies, and strategies:

Goal: Create and maintain a variety of great neighborhoods.

Neighborhood P2: Review new development for the mix of uses and form of development needed to establish lasting neighborhoods.

Goal: Grow and maintain diverse and stable jobs.

Economic Development P1: Preserve designated commercial and industrial areas for future job growth.

Goal: Foster a development pattern that creates and maintains a variety of great neighborhoods, grows a diverse and stable economy, and develops rich public spaces.

Public Spaces P2: Design of neighborhoods, neighborhood village centers, mixed use activity districts, downtown, and transit districts should consider and include the development of public gathering places appropriate for the scale and location of the development.

This development is part of a larger suburban neighborhood. The addition of these commercial uses will add to the overall quality and mix of the neighborhood. The proposed design is consistent with the form and guidelines standards for this type of neighborhood. Another key feature of neighborhoods is that they are integrated and walkable. The site plan for this development illustrates the applicant's intent to connect this commercial development with the future development to the east and, through that, to the neighborhood east of Labelle.

Utilizing the tools of the Mesa 2040 General Plan in review of the proposed project, this request would further implement and enhance the planned Neighborhood character of the given area, help to create a greater sense of place, and make the place more economically viable into the future.

STAFF ANALYSIS:

Site plan:

In comparing the overall site plan from 2007 with the newly revised overall site plan on sheet AS-102, there have been a number of changes including the development of the Banner Health Center, the integration of the LDS Church site and the current application for the 3.84± acres. As identified in the project description section of this report, the site plan was revised after the February 10, 2015 Design Review Board meeting. The size and shape of this tract in conjunction with the adjacent proposed and existing developments create some challenges for the development of this lot. The applicant has worked with staff to address the concerns and provide a plan that can work. The remaining issues/concerns with the site plan revolve around the attempt to provide options for drive-thru windows in a unique way.

The primary change in the site plan since the February 10 Design Review Board meeting is the inclusion of the raised landscape medians adjacent to each of the drive-thru lanes at the back or southeast portion of the site. This raised landscape median complies with current code requirements for a

separation of the proposed drive-thru lane from the traffic circulation aisle. There are still issues regarding the dimensions associated with as described below.

Drive-thru dimensions and stacking distances

The drive-thru aisle lane widths are called out as 10', which does not meet minimum requirements; a 12' minimum width is required per section 11-32-2.J of the Zoning ordinance. The site plan will need to be modified.

Section 11-31-18 of the Zoning Code requires a minimum stacking distance of 40' measured from the entrance of the drive-thru from the speaker box, and from the order placing speaker to the pick-up window should be a minimum of 100'. The Planning and Zoning Board can approve modifications to these requirements. Although it is close in a couple of cases, it appears that distance for stacking behind the speaker boxes meets code. For the northern drive-thru lane in Building B the stacking distance between the order box and window is indicated as 75', which does not meet the requirement.. At this time there are not specific users for the proposed building, therefore staff believes that the drive through window location could to adjust to the actual user.

Pedestrian/vehicle conflicts

The foundation, pedestrian & landscape plan, sheet AE-101, indicates a ramp up at the exit portion of the drive-thru aisle where it would connect with pedestrian traffic. This will help to address the need for driver awareness where the drive-thru lane intersects with the pedestrian walkway. Safety concerns were raised by Design Review Board including visibility into the drive-thru lanes between the buildings. These concerns could be addressed by adding windows closer to the corners of the buildings or by clipping or stepping the corners of the building at the exit of the drive-thru lane, particularly at the drive-thru window portion of the buildings. The use of railing within the proposed landscape planter that interrupts the pedestrian traffic flow and a revised pedestrian walkway layout could be investigated to avoid potential conflicts of vehicles and pedestrians. Lighting will also need to be utilized to increase visibility into the drive-thru aisles.

Feel and safety of the drive-thru lanes

Staff has concern with the overall design of the narrow drive-thru aisles with the 22' high building walls creating a narrow space. Clipping the corners of the building could begin to address these concerns. Staff can work with the applicant through the Design Review approval process to address the safety and visibility concerns at the drive-thru exit portions of the buildings.

Grade level landscaping

The parking and circulation areas at the front or northwest portion of the project will have grade level curbing. Grade level planters are also proposed adjacent to the buildings. This is different than you would normally see in this type of development. Staff has concerns with containing landscape material in a planter that has a curb at grade level, however installed effectively it could work.

Circulation & screen walls

Circulation for Phase II includes connection to the Banner Health Center site that is not reciprocated by the Banner site. The applicant will need to continue to work with Banner to get the connection to work. The Banner Health Center has not started Phase II, therefore the opportunity is available to obtain the cross access. In addition, once the final design is determined for the 4-story office building the parking and circulation for the site may need to be adjusted. Finally, in order to fully screen the parking and

circulation areas, more screen walls will need to be added along the Crismon Road street frontage.

Landscape plan:

Two phases are proposed for the project. The first phase proposes to include only landscaping along the Crismon Road frontage for Phase I. To be consistent with development requirements, all of the landscape adjacent to Crismon Road will be required to be installed with the first phase development. Foundation base requirements include trees at one per 50 linear feet of exterior wall length. The landscape plan indicates that there are not adequate numbers of trees to meet the foundation base landscape requirement. Building A requires 11 trees and Building B requires a total of 9 trees in the foundation base of the building. Additional trees could be incorporated at the entrance of the buildings. Staff will work with the applicant through the Design Review approval process to ensure compliance.

Future phasing:

Phase II is called out as Building B and the 4-story future office building. The site plan does not provide adequate information for a complete review of the 4-story office building. Further, a 4-story building will need more than the 30' height allowed in the LC zoning district. The applicant will need to rezone to add a BIZ overlay. Therefore, the office building will be required to come back through a separate Planning and Zoning Board review.

Building height and architectural style:

The architectural design, colors and materials chosen for the project are interesting and different. They come together well in design to create a unique identifiable building. The Design Review Board had limited comments with regard to architecture of the proposed buildings. The Board did identify that they would like to see a covered drive-thru canopy incorporated at the north side of Building A. The Board focused primarily on the circulation of the site.

SUMMARY:

Staff does have concerns with some details of the site plan layout as identified in the analysis portion of the staff report. The project is currently being reviewed for Design Review approval. Therefore, staff can work with the applicant to ensure all of the concerns are addressed prior to the Design Review approval of the project. While we believe staff can work out these details with the applicant, the Board may want to see these changes. If the Board would like to see the modifications, this case could be continued to the April meeting.

CONCLUSIONS:

Staff is in support of and recommends approval of the site plan subject to the following conditions:

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

1. Compliance with the basic development as described in the project narrative and as shown on the site plan, landscape plan and preliminary elevations submitted except as modified by following stipulations.
2. **Compliance with all conditions of Design Review approval from case DR15-006.**
3. **Staff approval of a revised site plan addressing the following conditions prior to Design Review approval:**
 - a) Compliance with all City development codes and regulations, including Section 11-33-5: Foundation Base Landscaping. The minimum number of trees required for foundation base at Building A is 11 trees and Building B is 9 trees.

- b) Additional screen walls shall be added along the Crismon Road street frontage to screen the parking and circulation areas.
 - c) **Increase visibility into the drive-thru lanes at the drive-thru exit points. This may include incorporating windows closer to the corners of the buildings, or clipping or stepping the corners of the buildings adjacent to the drive-thru windows. Vehicular and pedestrian circulation conflict concerns could also be addressed utilizing revised curb designs, raised planters, varied pedestrian pathways, decorative railing and/or additional lighting.**
 - d) **Incorporate a covered drive-thru canopy at the north-west elevation of Building A.**
- 4. All landscape adjacent to Crismon Road will be required to be installed with the Phase I of the development.
 - 5. Owner shall grant an Avigation Easement and Release to the City, pertaining to Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport which will be prepared and recorded by the City (prior to the issuance of a building permit).
 - 6. Written notice be provided to future property owners, and acknowledgment received that the project is within 5 miles of Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport.
 - 7. Noise attenuation measures shall be incorporated into the design and construction buildings where people work, or are otherwise received to achieve an outdoor-to-indoor noise level reduction (NLR) as required by section 11-19-5.D of the Zoning Ordinance.
 - 8. Future development of the office project as well at lots 7 and 8 shall require site plan review and approval by the Planning and Zoning Board.
 - 9. A re- plat of Crismon Gateway shall be recorded prior to the issuance of building permits.
 - 10. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.